MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
Held in Washington, D.C., September 13,1948.

The first meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts, during the fiscal year 1949, was held in its office in the Interior Department Building on Monday, September 13, 1948. The following members were present:

Mr. Clarke, Chairman,

Mr. Finley,

Mr. Aldrich,

Mr. Reinhard,

Mr. Sterne,

Mr. Murphy,

Mr. Lawrie,

also H. P. Caemmerer, Secretary and

Administrative Officer.

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m.

- 1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING METING: The Minutes of the Meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts, held June 8, 1948, were approved, with a change to omit Exhibit I, relating to the discussion with Mr. Walker, concerning the American Military Cemetery at Hamm, Luxembourg, since this matter was sufficiently covered in a letter to General North.
- 2. STATUE OF GENERAL ARTIGAS: Chairman Clarke reported that early this morning he was in conference with Minister Mora of Uruguay, accompanied by Mr. John C. M. Crane, and Mr. Harry T. Thompson, Assistant Superintendent of National Capital Parks, concerning a location for the statue of General Artigas, the erection of which in the District of Columbia has been authorized by Congress, by Act approved June 26, 1948.

Several locations adjacent to the Pan American Union and to their new Annex were considered. It was finally decided that possibly the best location would be on the triangle on which the Annex is being built, either on the east or west side of the building, along Constitution Avenue, where the statue would face south.

ئە ئىدانى ب

y was her and who

e 311 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1

* . The graph of the same process. The same process of the same pr

The section of the contract of

The Office of National Capital Parks is to make a study of this question of location for the statue, and Mr. Thompson was authorized to confer with officials of the Pan American Union concerning the matter. The plan is to be ready for submission to the Commission of Fine Arts at the next meeting on October 29th. A report was sent to Minister Mora (Exhibit A).

Mr. Lawrie felt the statue should have a pedestal fully 9 feet high. If the statue is placed near the Annex, the architects of the buildings, Messrs. Harbeson, Hough, Livingston and Larson, should design the pedestal.

5. STATUE OF GEORGE WASHINGTON FOR URUGUAY: The Commission considered the question of a gift of a statue of George Washington for Uruguay, in reciprocation of the gift of the statue of General Artigas to the United States. The Department of State favors this and asked the advice of the Commission of Fine Arts concerning the matter.

The Commission concurred in the suggestion, but decided that such a statue of George Washington should be an original work of art done by a competent sculptor selected as the result of a limited competition. Mr. Lawrie said the statue, in bronze, including pedestal, would cost \$75,000.

A letter was sent to the Department of State on the subject, and it was assumed that the Department would draft the necessary legislation (Exhibit B).

The Commission discussed also the question of policy concerning additional statues from South American countries, other than Uruguay, that have been proposed. Attention was called to an equestrian statue of General San Martin that was given by Argentine to the United States and erected in Judiciary Square in Washington about 25 years ago.

Chairman Clarke called attention to a statue of General Simon Bolivar, which Venezuela proposes to present to the City of Washington. Recently one was dedicated at Bolivar, Missouri.

mit and to the state of the sta

ni , in the second of the seco

The angle of the control of the second of th

RESTORDED TO BOTH TO BE TO STANDED TO THE STANDED THE

The pares from the ciscons of the second of

The Commission decided that any additional statue from South America erected in Washington should be an original work of art, and that the Commission should be informed as to its design before it is cast, as well as the design of the pedestal.

4. ERECTION OF THE MCMILLAN FOUNTAIN: Chairman Clarke asked Mr. Thompson as to whether or not anything is being done about erecting the McMillan Fountain in Potomac Park. Mr. Thompson replied:

No. The moving of the fountain has almost been stymied for the time being by the Navy Department. Unfortunately, we thought we had the problem completely solved, and the Secretary of the Navy had agreed; he told us as much in writing. He said they would be very happy to move from the temporary buildings, and would have the buildings down this October, but the Assistant Secretary of the Navy got in touch with our Secretary of the Interior, and after certain informal discussions it seemed advisable to leave them there for certain reasons which they discussed that I am not familiar with, so instead of ripping them down, they are still there and will be for another year.

Chairman Clarke, suggesting further action in the matter, thought it might be a good thing if the necessary funds to erect the fountain at the site of the new Rose Garden in Potomac Park be secured from Congress, but it was realized that any figure specified in a bid would not be good a year hence.

Therefore, it was decided to keep the project in mind, in the hope that something in 1950. might develop so that the fountain could be erected for the Sesquicentennual /

5. ARLINGTON MEMORIAL BRIDGE STATUARY: Chairman Clarke asked Mr. Thompson as to whether or not any progress is being made with regard to the Arlington Memorial Bridge statuary by Messrs. Fraser and Friedlander. Mr. Thompson replied:

"I made a resume of all the foundries of this country that seemed qualified to cast them, and, as you know, during the war years so many of them were converted to war work and have not been reconverted back to art work. Some have gone out of business. Fraser and Friedlander have made inquiries of all the foundries they think are large enough to cast them, and all but one could not do it. One could. The name slips me at the moment, but at least there is one that is willing to undertake to do them. They estimate they will take nine months per figure for casting, and they want an escalator clause in their contract, which is rather difficult to write into a contract with the Government.

The Jamisaion lesifed that was fill income from the a miss areclosed and asserts to ashington enough be a consided to a creinfield that the should be information as the design before it is cert, as allies the design of the possible.

6. MOSTUN OF THE LEMMAN STATE OF BELLIANDED STATES OF THE STATES OF THE

No. The moving of the fount in las fillers and approved to the set of the set of the last the set of the set o

Ossignar Tisela, or repring the measure of the mistration of the mistration of the measure of th

mon to the second of the secon

Tablica:

I apple to east value, as a compact of all conditions of all conditions of a compact o

"I have tried to interest Congressman Lodge, of Connecticut, and also Congressman Gwinn of New York, in this project and they have indicated quite an interest, and I have had a request from Congressman Gwinn to the effect that if I would assemble a story he and Congressman Lodge would present this problem to Mr. Hoffman's office with the thought that they might be acquired under the authority of the European Recovery Program, to be cast abroad. I think there is an agreement between this Commission, the sculptors and ourselves, that they might be covered with a dolomite finish, and if that be true, then it is not very important, as I see it, that they be cast in one foundry. They could well be cast by separate foundries.

Mr. Lawrie remarked, "If the metal is of the same composition they can be cast in different foundries, and they will look alike, except those patinaed, but they could be patined by one chemist. One could be cast in Italy, one in Belgium, one in Germany (if there is a foundry there) and one in France. Also, there is a good foundry in England."

Mr. Sterne said that they could be patinaed in the United States, and Mr. Thompson remarked that that was his idea but to have four foundries abroad do the work.

Mr. Finley said, -- "I know you can have them cast in France, because I was there last summer, and they are prepared to cast some large bronze statues."

Mr. Thompson remarked, "I talked to the gentleman who helped to prepare the European Recovery Bill, and he tells me it is well within the authority of the Act to do it, if Mr. Hoffman elects to do it. He was good enough to say that he thought Mr. Hoffman was a very open-minded person and might well go along with the idea.

In conclusion, Chairman Clarke said, "We have the stimulus to get behind this thing in connection with the Sesquicentennial in 1950, which will not happen again for a long time, and I am encouraged by what you say. Anything we can do. let us know."

Mr. Thompson said finally that he would prepare the Memorandum desired for Mr. Hoffman's office. Also, that the Office of National Capital Parks has

The state of the s

The simple and the second of t

Line of the state of the state

The set to the showing and the file of the country of the set of the short of the set of the showing as a set of the set of the set of the showing as a set of the set of

In complete, Mairele Carle vil 1900 of 1 1900 of 100 of 10

ld. Frigson said finally soft as well-pas as the first most of the

about \$80,000 which is available for shipping charges, erecting charges, and putting the patina on in this country by one person. . . As to the cost of casting the figures abroad, Mr. Thompson reported that one founder in France said he would cast two for \$250,000, American money. The American foundries are estimating anywhere from \$56,000 to \$75,000 per unit, without erection charges. Mr. Lawrie thought these figures to be high.

As to the size of these four equestrians, each is 16 feet high, about 12 feet long and about eight feet wide.

A copy of the letter which Mr. Thompson sent to Mr. Gwinn on September 16, 1948, together with copy of Memorandum, is attached hereto and made a part of these Minutes (Exhibit C).

6. UNDERPASS AT THE INTERSECTION OF MENNSYLVANIA AND CONSTITUTION

AVENUES: Major General U. S. Grant III, Chairman of the National Capital Park

and Planning Commission, informed the Commission concerning a Hearing held at

the Board Room of the Commissioners of the District of Columbia on September 10th.

General Grant said:

"Well you know there was a Hearing last year on a scheme for an Underpass, and of the various schemes suggested, I think there was every preference for the scheme which you had suggested, but money is a very important thing to the District right now, and that would have been a pretty expensive Underpass, and it has been suggested that you might do without it anyway for a period of years, and it was proposed that the street cars be removed from Pennsylvania Avenue east of Sixth Street—the little loop that is just west of Sixth Street be removed and the street—cars relocated so that there would be no cars going down Pennsylvania Avenue east of Sixth Street, and then that the crossing be treated on the surface by rearrangement and channeling of traffic.

I am sorry we do not have drawings, but we never did have them, excepting when the District gave them to us to look at at our meeting.

Another Hearing was held on this subject a few days ago. Our Commission's attitude is that it is a good thing to do. The removal of the street car tracks east of Sixth Street is something that is very desirable, but, however, the re-routing of street cars as a solution has not been worked out. We have had a committee working on it, consisting of representatives of Motor Vehicles and Traffic, the Highway Department, the Capital Transit Company, the engineer of the Public Utilities

Commission and our own people, and they have discussed almost every

ുന്നു പ്രധാനമായ പ്രവിശ് നിന്നും പ്രവിശ് നിന്നും പ്രവിശ് നിന്നും വരും വിശ് നിന്നും വരും വിശ് നിന്നും വരും വരും

. Zw. z i di elen Ed er 6 e til nord til tyr - "te manette it belå, be a

on the second of the second of

101. Ust 101., 0. 1001. 15 \$77. 101.

iblisa danam famenoli

eres succession of the second second

Observation of a devication and the contraction of the contraction of

possible way of doing it and have not yet been generally satisfied with any one solution. That was the statement that I made at the Hearing; we thought it would be well if this Committee continued its studies until they found a solution that is really satisfactory."

It was pointed out that removing street car tracks might help somewhat, but would not be a thorough solution of the traffic problem at the intersection of Pennsylvania and Constitution Avenues; ultimately it will be necessary to construct the Underpass.

Chairman Clarke remarked that the first thing to do is to get a copy of the plan, including the alternate plan proposed by the Commissioners of the District of Columbia.

The Highway Department has advised that they will supply the Commission of Fine Arts with a set of these plans. A report was sent to General Grant. (Exhibit D).

7. MODEL FOR THE WASHINGTON MONUMENT GROUNDS: General Grant stated that the Plan of 1901 for the Washington Monument Grounds, with its gardens, and terrace, is not practical because of bad foundation conditions; about 1930 a Board of Engineers made borings, investigated sub-surface conditions, and decided that the foundations of the Washington Monument must not be disturbed. Thereupon, Mr. Olmsted and Mr. Hubbard drew up a a landscape plan and William Adams Delano made an alternate plan.

General Grant said that at the Centennial Celebration of laying the cornerstone of the Washington Monument, last July, he had recommended the appropriate embellishment of the Washington Monument Grounds so as to be more in keeping with the Mall and the Central Area Composition of Washington, and that this should be one of the projects for the Sesquicentennial Celebration in 1950. This suggestion has been generally favored and in the rooms of the National Capital Park and Planning Commission there are plans and model that have been prepared under the direction of the Commission. General Grant asked the advice of the Commission of Fine Arts concerning them. The Commission thereupon inspected them, in the rooms of the National Capital Park and Planning Commission.

A LE COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DE LA COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DEL COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DEL COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DE LA COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DEL COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DEL COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DE LA COLLEGE COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DE LA COLLEGE COLLEGE CONTRACTOR DE LA COLLEGE CO

The second secon

The same of the sa

The digram of the sate of the

ir. Clastel and ir. Automate where is a serie of the model to the series of the series

rede on thought in about

For soil Tains of the that the product of the soil of

, notice the time to the local model, a consider the amoon saft of

The Commission were generally well pleased with the model because of its simplicity. Major Clarke, as the landscape architect member of the Commission, gave the model particular attention. He felt that too many trees are proposed which would dwarf the height of the Monument and interfere with the views from Constitution Avenue; also the locations for the walks from the North and South should be restudied.

General Grant pointed out several features, including a plan to rebuild the Sylvan Theatre, making it an out-of-door theater that could be used for a Pageant during the Sesquicentennial Celebration. Automobile parking spaces on the grounds immediately adjacent to the Monument are to be eliminated, and situated on the periphery (east) where they may be screened from view by trees.

The Commission decided that as a sketch model it is in the right direction and reported to General Grant accordingly (Exhibit D). General Grant said he would submit a revised model at a future meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts.

8. DEATH OF CAPTAIN WHITEHURST: The Secretary reported the death of Captain H. C. Whitehurst, Director of Highways of the District of Columbia, on September 1, 1948. Burial took place in the Arlington National Cemetery, World War I Section.

The Commission received this information with profound regret, in view of the distinguished service rendered to the District of Columbia by Captain Whitehurst over a period of many years. In behalf of the Commission of Fine Arts, the Chairman sent a letter of appreciation and sympathy to the Commissioners of the District of Columbia (Exhibit E).

9. SCULPTURE FOR THE NEW COURT HOUSE: Mr. A. S. Thorn, Acting Supervising Architect, and Mr. J. M. Lowe, Design Architect, of the Public Buildings Administration, accompanied by Mr. Louis Justement, architect of the Court House

The state of the s

Grown in the set to the set of our series of the set of

tagle on the drift felous rought as a renautable in lastic to a last country of the felous and the country of the felous and the felous and the fact and the fact the country of the fact the country of the country of the fact the country of the co

on ingress to the same of the control of the contro

The contraction of the contract of the best the solution of the contraction of the contra

 to be built at Constitution Avenue and Third Street, N.W., presented a drawing embodying suggestions for sculpture, as considered at a Committee Meeting attended by Mr. Lawrie, Mr. Murphy and Mr. Thorn on July 15, 1948. Concerning that meeting, Mr. Thorn had reported to Chairman Clarke by letter of July 22, 1948, which reads in part as follows:

"As you will note the sketches contemplate elimination of all sculptural features on or attached to the Constitution Avenue facade, and the placement of a monumental piece of free standing sculpture in the small plaza approaching the entrance, and located relatively close to the inner sidewalk. We received the impression that both Mr. Lawrie and Mr. Murphy favor this idea, qualified only by statements that the sculpture should be a work of great distinction and appropriateness.

One other point was discussed, namely, an appropriate location for a bronze figure of the English jurist Blackstone, executed by Paul Bartlett."

The Commission inspected the design. Mr. Thorn said that no one has been commissioned for any of the sculpture, though Sidney Waugh is being considered.

Mr. Justement called particular attention to a location for the statue of Sir William Blackstone by Paul Bartlett, which was presented to the United States by Mrs. Bartlett. Its erection on public grounds in the District of Columbia has been authorized by Congress, but an appropriation for a pedestal is needed, and in the meantime the statue is inside the District of Columbia Court House in Judiciary Square. Several years ago the Commission of Fine Arts recommended a site for it on the north side of the "Hatfield Court House."

Mr. Justement said that several of the Judges are anxious to see the statue of Blackstone erected in a good place. It is impossible to place it inside of the new Court House since the ceilings are not high enough. A suggestion to place the statue on an island in John Marshall Place was disapproved.

A location on the Court House grounds was tentatively favored. The statue of Blackstone is to face south, amidst planting.

The Commission made a number of suggestions regarding the sculpture proposed, which will be embodied in a revised design, to be submitted at the next meeting

and the obtained of the contract of the contra

The policy of the control of the con

the Consideration interests for distance, we consider the survivers and commissions of the considerations of the considerations, the consideration of the consideration of the constance of a second c

The initian initial contracts of the contract of the contract

to recome an in in the second of the first of the second o

The John ion was a time of the goation of the second of th

of the Commission of Fine Arts on October 29th.

The Commission noted the general treatment of the south terrace of the Court House which is proposed; two fountains are suggested. No action was taken with regard to the design.

10. CHANDELIER FOR THE WHITE HOUSE: Chairman Clarke reported on the proposed gift by Mrs. Brooks Thayer, of New York, of a chandelier for the White House. Mr. Finley stated that he had seen it and that it is eminently suitable for the White House.

Also, Chairman Clarke reported that a new Waterford chandelier, donated by Mr. Chester Dale, has already been installed in the Red Room; the one that was there has been placed in the Monroe Room on the second floor of the Mansion.

The Commission felt the chandelier offered by Mrs. Thayer could well be placed in the Blue Room, to take the place of an old (French) one which is there now. Mr. Finley and Mr. Aldrich suggested four appliques for the walls of the Blue Room, in character with the Thayer chandelier.

The Commission expressed the hope that funds would be made avilable for the use of the Committee on Furnishings for the State Rooms of the White House.

11. SIGN FOR THE CARLYLE HOTEL, 500 North Capitol Street: Chairman Clarke reported:

"We turned down a roof sign on a hotel, which is now known or was to be known as the Carlyle Hotel. It was previously the Capital Park Hotel. It was purchased by the Government during the War and was used as an office building, and the sign "Capital Park Hotel" was taken down. After the War, the hotel was turned back to them and was sold, and they now call it the Carlyle Hotel. They want to put a sign on the roof again, and the Shipstead-Luce Act says definitely there are to be no roof signs, so we turned it down as a matter of course under the Act (Application No.1173, dated March 3, 1948).

"Then I got a long letter from Mr. John Russell Young (Exhibit F), saying there were mitigating circumstances and they thought the sign should go up. I wrote a long letter (Exhibit G), copies of which I sent to all of you. Most of you concurred in what I said, and, if they put it up, it will go up without our blessing, and at least we are straight in the record. I think the District Commissioners can override our action."

The Secretary stated that the legislation on the Shipstead-Luce Act of

and the state of t

THE STATE OF A CONTRACT OF A C

Donner to the contract of the

en ill. The same of the second of the second

ent and the solution was the solution of the s

The summary of the second seco

The political form of the control of

ilong I got thing I follows it is a sign of a

May 16, 1930, so indicates. Also, that the Commissioners of the District of Columbia wish to consider the matter further at a meeting in Commissioner John Russell Young's office on September 16th, and would like to have a representative of the Commission of Fine Arts present.

The Commission considered the matter, and confirmed the action of the Chairman, as set forth in his letter to Commissioner Young.

Mr. Murphy and Mr. Caemmerer were designated to represent the Commission at the meeting above-mentioned.

- 12. AMERICAN BATTLE MONUMENTS COMMISSION:
- (a) The Secretary presented a letter dated September 8, 1948, from Mr. John F. Harbeson (Exhibit H), concerning the development of projects. The Chairman read the letter for the information of the Commission.

Since the return of General North from Europe is expected by about the middle of October, the Commission expressed the hope that a meeting of the American Battle Monuments Commission could be held prior to the next meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts on October 29th. The Secretary stated that he would bring this suggestion to the attention of Col. Shaw, Executive Officer of the American Battle Monuments Commission.

(b) The Secretary presented a letter from Congressman George H.

Bender, as follows:

September 10, 1948.

Dear Mr. Caemmerer:

One of my very good friends is Mr. Charles Hubbell, Jr., of the architectural group known as Hubbell and Benes, 4500 Euclid Avenue, Cleveland, Ohio.

I know that this organization is very actively interested in being given the opportunity to submit its qualifications to the Commission for consideration. These folks have drafted plans for some of the outstanding public buildings in this area and I am prepared to vouch for their reputation in this community.

I should greatly appreciate your courtesy in placing Hubbell and Benes upon your lists.

- With my thanks for your cooperation, I am, Cordially and sincerely yours,

> GEORGE H. BEWDER, Congressman at Large, Ohio.

. The second of grander of the control of the second of the

The state of the s Audios day of the control of the con

magnetic entropy to the state of the state o and ship the form and the total

in the second of the second of

a respect to the control of the cont and the first state of the stat

Single this representation and place to the property of the second second secon ರ್ಷ-೧೯೮೮ ಕ್ರೀಡಿಕ್ ಪ್ರತಿ green and the second material and the selection and selections and selection produced. der en de perfecte de la companya de Fritzensky state of the control of the graduation of the control o and the standard of the second of the second

* 1.5 - 1.4 (a) - 1.4 (b) - 1.4 (b) - 1.4 (c) - 1.4 (d) - 1.4 (d)

a & . -

remise, on collabor:

TO ME TO STATE OF of the craff of the grant to the contract of t Tronge, dieveneme, with, in the second of the second of

The control of the co Tormat sold the first transfer of the second of the second sold of the second of the s and the contract of which are them product design and to see A CONTRACTOR OF THE STATE OF TH Diski oi to an and the second that the state in

... i... ord Lowe on Elector. en la final and the state of th

er in the state of the state of

Also, the Secretary presented photographs from Messrs. Hubbell and Benes, together with letter, of some of their executed work, which included a picture of the Cleveland Art Museum. These were inspected by the Commission.

Chairman Clarke called attention to a letter that he had sent to Congressman Bender on August 20, 1948 (Exhibit I, concerning this matter, and said it would simply result in confusion to approve architects for a memorial project prior to a request from the American Battle Monuments Commission for advice as to a proposed commission.

The Commission felt that there is nothing further that could be done in the matter at this time, pending the receipt of a request from the American Battle Monuments Commission for additional architectural services. The Secretary was requested to inform Congressman Bender and Messrs. Hubbell and Benes accordingly, and this was done (Exhibit J).

has been dissatisfaction expressed by some members of the Commission because of the attitude of the Director of the Mint in ignoring recommendations of the Commission of Fine Arts when they are made pertaining to a design. The new Benjamin Franklin half-dollar is a case in point. A few weeks ago a design was received from the Director of the Mint, requesting advice as to a Medal of Merit for the Interior Department. Mr. Lawrie made criticisms which were brought to the attention of the Director of the Mint, with request for a photograph of the revised design. None has been received. The Commission felt that hereafter when the Director of the Mint submits a design, no report should be made unless there is assurance that the design will be revised in accordance with such recommendations as may be made.

The Secretary was requested to write to the Acting Director of the Mint, asking for a photograph of the revised design of the medal, as above mentioned (Exhibit K. See also K-1).

The control of the co

Let place as a second of the content of the content

The Counting of the bound of the continuous of t

The secretary was remarked on with each of the community of the community of the continuation of the conti

14. FIRST DIVISION NEMORIALS, WORLD WAR II: Lieut. Col. Richard G. Ciccolella submitted in behalf of the First Division Memorial Association a revised design for the proposed World War II Memorial of the First Division, which is to be placed in relationship to their World War I Memorial south of the "State, War and Navy" building. About 4500 members of the First Division, World War II, are to be commemorated. The sum of \$125,000 is being raised for the proposed memorial.

Col. Ciccolella expressed regret that a more adequate drawing is not available, but the architect of the memorial met with a misfortune several months ago and has been unable to work on the project.

The Commission inspected the design and noted that it proposes something in the nature of an exedra about the First Division Memorial, World War I.

The Commission felt it was a poor solution of the problem and disapproved the design.

Mr. Reinhard offered to talk with Mr. Jennewein, sculptor for the project.

Also, Mr. Reinhard suggested a meeting in his office in New York, which

Col. Ciccolella could attend, regarding a revised design. This was deemed

desirable; the meeting is to take place some time soon.

15. POST CARD VIEWS OF WASHINGTON: Mr. Finley presented a letter from Mr. Lewis L. Young, 1705 Lanier Place, N.W., Washington, complaing about the poer post cards in color that are being sold of views of the City of Washington, and strongly recommending that something be done to improve them. Mr. Finley said he concurred in the complaint of Mr. Young, saying, "We have some decent ones at the National Gallery of Art because we do them ourselves." Mr. Finley suggested bringing this matter to the attention of the Distributors of post cards in Washington.

The Secretary suggested first bringing this matter to the attention of

isocial and a control in the control

To graph or the second state of the second s

in the nature of the entropy of the first property of a first second of the first of the control of the first of the control of the first of the control of

in, miny produce of the state of the graph of the state o

lar firsts in desired of the second of the s

There is a second of the secon

the National Capital Committee of the Washington Board of Trade, and offered to do this and report at the next meeting of the Commission. This was agreed to.

Chairman Clarke said that during his recent trip in Europe he was impressed with the remarkably fine post cards now available there.

16. SHELTER FOR UNION STATION: In accordance with the suggestion of Chairman Clarke, the Secretary was requested to confer with Mr. B. R. Tolson, Manager of Union Station, regarding an adequate permanent shelter to take the place of the ugly temporary shelter erected in front of and against the facade of Union Station during the War.

The Secretary asked whether or not the Shelter could extend over the street car traks. Chairman Clarke replied that the question of width is not so important, but the Shelter should be properly designed and be detached from the building.

The Secretary stated that he would confer with Mr. Tolson about the matter and report at the next meeting of the Commission.

17. TOMB OF THE UNKNOWN SCLIER, WORLD WAR II: During the afternoon, the Commission visited the Arlington Memorial Amphitheater to consider further the question of location of the proposed Tomb of the Unknown Soldier of World War II.

Chairman Clarke said he was of the opinion that the best arrangement would be to remove the east steps of the Amphitheater and have simply a plain marble wall to support the columns, in front of which would be the Tomb of the Unknown Soldier of World War II, on the same level as that of World War I.

There would be no entrance from the east side. The President and other dignitaries would approach the portico from the memorial hall. Thus a splendid view could be had of both the World War I and the World War II memorials.

The Commission considered the matter fully, and seemed to think that the idea as presented by Chairman Clarke is worthy of study by the Architect,

to this est of the section of the se

Tagin en al rice a la contential de la company de la compa

The George and relied the bloom on the compact of the second sections of the compact of the comp

n - 1 - c - nucle to the part of the period file of the ont to during the same out to during the same of the contract of the c

1/4 Louis Life Little of Louis and Life Little of the court of the cou

Disigner objects and he cas store of the epidien test the local markets and all and and the case of the remark of the case of

The County fam son a sured the satter will, a success of the same of the same as the same of the same

Mr. Lorimer Rich. A drawing setting forth this idea is being made by
Mr. Rich, and it is expected that the War Department will present it to the
Commission at the next meeting.

18. NEXT MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS: The Commission decided to hold the next meeting in Washington on Friday, October 29th.

The Commission adjourned at 3:30 p.m. The Commission had luncheon at "Hogate's" on the waterfront. Improvements under way along the waterfront were noted.

in the second se

The state of the system of the

September 16, 1948.

My dear Mr. Minister,

It was a pleasure to meet with you last Monday morning for the purpose of discussing the problem related to an appropriate site for the statue of General Jose Gervasio Artigas, which the Government of Uruguay has given to the United States for erection in the National Capital. The Commission studied this problem and have recommended two sites for further consideration at their next meeting to be held in Washington on October 29th. The two sites suggested are to the east and to the west of the new Pan American Union Annex now under construction on Constitution Avenue. The selection of one or the other site will depend upon which location is most suitable from the standpoint of the statue itself. Either location would provide an eminently suitable site and the statue itself will have the best possible lighting since in either case the figure will face south.

Mr. Harry T. Thompson, Assistant Superintendent, National Capital Parks, who was present at our meeting Monday morning, will give further study to this matter and was authorized to confer with representatives of the Pan American Union concerning it. The Commission hope that the architects for the building, Harbeson, Hough, Livingston and Larson, can be engaged to design the pedestal for the statue so that it will in every respect harmonize with the architecture of this new building.

Be assured, sir, that the Commission of Fine Arts are desirous of being of whatever assistance they can in aiding to expedite the arrangements necessary to have the statue of General Artigas suitably and permanently situated in the City of Washington.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Cordially and sincerely yours,

GILMORE D. CLARKE,

Chairman.

The Honorable José A. Mora, Minister Plenipotentiary of Uruguay, Embassy of Uruguay, 1025 Connecticut Avenue, Washington, D.C.

EXHIBIT A-

en ludich . Land. ...

If we will we will have the control of the control

ir. Termy 1. Thompse, to site but a still extend of the entry of the confidence of the extended of the extended of this outless and the still confidence of the still extended to conferent the formal extended of the formal extended of the formal extended the extended of the extended of

Ge esserved, that the solutional and anterests are capable for of being of the testing to the arranger onto necessary to the arranger onto the control of the abate of the chiral and person ntly of the testing of the chiral and person ntly of the testing of the chiral and person ntly of the testing of the chiral chirals and person ntly of the chiral chirals and person ntly of the chiral chirals and person not the chiral chiral

For the Uperluster of the 1960

er introduction and site and

et said was to C Time

all the the

The fonorthie hort . was, initially us, , in the last was, , and the last was, , makes of the last . We was, loss tonnections . We was, lashington, D.C.

Copy

The Commission of Fine Arts

Washington

September 15th, 1948.

Dear Mr. Bohlen:

At their meeting on September 13, 1948, the Commission of Fine Arts considered the question of location of the statue of General Jose Gervasio Artigas, and were in conference with Minister Mora of Uruguay on the subject. The Commission decided that the statue should be placed in the vicinity of the Pan American Union or the adjacent Annex, which is now under construction. A plan, incorporating the suggestions of the Commission made at their last meeting, will be prepared for the next meeting of the Commission on October 29th.

At the same time the Commission considered the question of a reciprocal gift to Uruguay of a statue of George Washington. The Commission advise that such a statue should be an original work of art procured as the result of a limited competition among a group of eminently qualified sculptors recommended by the Commission of Fine Arts for this project. It is understood, of course, that the appropriate legislation will be drafted for the attention of Congress by the Department of State. A statue of appropriate size, including the pedestal, would cost approximately \$75,000.

The Commission of Fine Arts would appreciate being informed by the Department of State of progress related to this project.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

Gilmore D. Clarke Chairman

Honorable Charles E. Bohlen Counselor, Department of State Washington, D. C.

- d._ engl * - L in the state of th Just the service of t TO THE STATE OF TH ా నా క్రిమాంధానికి కార్యాలు కార్యాలు మండలానికి క్రిమాంధానికి అయినికి ఉంది. మహించికుండానికి ఉంది. మహించికుండానికి 2002, which is at the determinent, - 121, second to me to the compact of each as the medical and will be oppositely us gardo d'im une neal). College e Borgin e un Borgin exam e e es Zeu a en per la companya de la companya d . The result of the section of the section of the first sections That is the same of the support confide a score double relivation makes and Continues in the same a man a regulation of reducing a terminate and earlier second qualifie scalptore reconside of the entitle of the artists of a nak jedty. It as misersbook, of coerce, but a sign of the . The dry the free for the decimental of frequency and the training of the company of v stabbue ci u gropaduta sine, includentata value com propini in entata v achie et a relodant is a summer of the summer of the summer of the summer of the 8 . - 1 - (Ciana 4 in the second second to the second of * * - elimin ala UNITED STATES

Department of the Interior National Park Service National Capital Parks Washington, D.C.

September 16, 1948.

Hon. Ralph W. Gwinn,

House of Representatives.

My dear Mr. Gwinn:

You will find enclosed a brief statement, a number of photographs and what I hope will be sufficient supporting data relating to the Arlington Memorial Bridge equestrian statues to present successfully our request for assistance to the Economic Cooperation Administration. My latest communication from you on this subject was by way of your telephone request that the enclosures be assembled for the use of Representative John D. Lodge, of Connecticut. As I understand it, Mr. Lodge has indicated that he would be willing to present our request to the Economic Cooperation Administration.

Although we cannot as yet be sure of success in our efforts to secure the statue castings in this manner, I am confident that with you and Representative Lodge jointly supporting this project, it is as good as done. If I can be of assistance in clarifying the enclosures or in presenting this problem to those who will have to consider it, please let me know.

Sincerely yours,

(sgd.) Harry T. Thompson
Assistant Superintendent.

Enclosure.

0

P

+ = 11 = 2 L11 == 11 the second of the second N Literature A. C. A. Harris will a service of the ÷กระเทศ ๒๐ กระโลกซ์ สวา 20 ก. . 2 ก. เป็นสาก พาณะ ซุโน้มโ∙อบออตร e and the second of the second and the second of the second o ~น่อย เรียงอย่าง เกียงสามารถ เกียง เกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกียงการเกีย ionte de la caracteria de la companya del companya della companya -alto a la traca de Carrolla de la companya de la distribución palable. · California sagio al in the same of the same same and the same eugebros 15, riemer let me 'oras Activities with the second *College of Silvers . TIBLULED.

STATEMENT IN SUPPORT OF REQUEST TO THE ECONOMIC COOPERATION ADMINISTRATION SEEKING ASSISTANCE OF THAT AGENCY IN THE ACZULISITION OF BRONZE CASTINGS OF FOUR EQUESTRIAN STATUES TO BE ERECTED ON THE ARLINGTON MEMORIAL BRIDGE

This Nation's most significant memorial to those who have died in the military service of their country, the Arlington Memorial Bridge, stands today in a state of incompletion some 15 years after its dedication in 1933. An important but as yet incompleted feature of this memorial consists of four heroic sculptured statues to be erected on pylons at the eastern, or Lincoln Memorial Plaza, approach to the bridge.

These sculptured groups have been in a continuous process of preparation since 1931 at which time two of the Nation's outstanding sculptors were commissioned to design them. After some 17 years spent by the sculptors in their preparation, the models have at last been completed full size in plaster ready for casting in bronze. The plaster models have been approved by the National Commission of Fine Arts. They await only the necessary arrangements for this final stage of casting in metal and erection on the Memorial Bridge Plaza.

Two groups, symbolic of "The Arts of War" depicting "Valor" and "Sacrifice" are the work of Mr. Leo Friedlander of White Plains, New York. Mr. Friedlander's statues are to be placed on two pylons flanking the bridge terminus. Two groups, symbolic of "The Arts of Peace" depicting "Harvest" and "Music", and "Literature" and "Aspiration", are the work of Mr. James E. Fraser of Westport, Connecticut. Mr. Fraser's statues are to be placed on companion pylons approximately 300 feet to the north of the bridge terminus on the Memorial Bridge Plaza.

The four statues are inspiring conceptions of symbolism in the finest tradition of two artists of outstanding ability. To the best of our knowledge they are the largest statues of their kind ever executed by any American sculptor. Once erected they will greatly enhance the incompleted bridge and plaza by their size and beauty.

In addition to many compelling reasons why further delay should be avoided, there is the further incentive to have these statues erected as soon as possible. The Capital City of the United States will celebrate its 150th anniversary in 1950 by presenting to the The second secon

These similar of ceepids and the Tuncount of the social sense.

Seepid plants using a fill and fine for the social sense.

Seepid plants using a control for the social sense.

Apend on pile sect such a fine plants of the social sense in the sense of th

modeline discount to the control office of the control office of the control of t

The four abrawes and based the on arthion of spanouing the interest breaking of two arthios of two interests are considered of two althoughts of any interest of any interest of the conference of any interest on a conference of the conference of t

 world an elaborate series of events and displays having to do with the history, the growth of the country and the more important events that have taken place in the United States since the establishment of the Capital in the District of Columbia in the year 1800. It would seem altogether timely and fitting that this important memorial should be completed by that date. It is doubly important that arrangements be made for their casting and erection if the statues are to be in place for the sesqui-centennial celebration.

We have found that certain foundries in this country qualified to undertake castings of this size have gone out of business. Some have converted to war production and have elected to continue with the production of commercial and architectural bronze work. Other foundries have indicated a lack of interest because of other commitments. One qualified foundry submitted an appraisal in 1947 to undertake the castings on a "cost-plus" basis with an escalator clause providing for an adjustment in price. In this instance, it has been estimated that the casting by this company would take approximately three years to complete the foundry work, which would carry their completion date well beyond the sesqui-centennial year of 1950. Faced with a shortage of funds and a shortage of foundry capacity in the United States, we have turned to the only other known source of obtaining the castings; namely, foundries of Europe, in search of a solution to this problem.

Preliminary investigations indicate that it might be possible to locate foundries in a number of European countries that are qualified to perform this work. The nature of the finished product is such that it is not essential that they be cast in any one foundry, or for that matter, in any one country. It would be possible to commission four separate foundries to perform the actual casting work, leaving the finishing or the patina of the surface to be completed in the United States.

Since the United States is now actively engaged in extending aid to a nymber of European countries where foundries might be located, it would seem possible to arrange for this final stage of the project through the Economic Cooperation Administration. From a review of Public Law 472, it appears to be well within the authority of the ECA to render a great service to this country and at the same time greatly aid in the rehabilitation program of the cooperating countries of Europe by stimulating industry in the art foundries of those countries.

To initial and a source of the control of the contr

e have subtant occubing the community of the community of

e in the control of t

A CONTROL OF THE CONT

The art foundries of Europe must have suffered greatly during the war and if this industry is to be preserved, it should prove to be a great stimulus to this industry that has contributed so much to the cultural life of the world. The craftsmen qualified to perform this highly skilled art are centered in the countries of Europe. Their number is rapidly diminishing by lack of commissions in this field of work.

The cooperation of the European countries in a project of this kind should prove of great value in the betterment of public relations between our respective countries. Once the statues are cast and erected, they cannot help but create a tremendous amount of favorable interest and comment in this country and abroad. Their size, their beauty, their significance and their placement as a feature of this important memorial would prove to be a never-ending source of favorable comment and good-will toward any nation or nations undertaking this cooperative effort as a service to the United States. Sufficient funds are available to the National Capital Parks office of the National Park Service to defray the cost of crating, transportation, finishing and erection in this country but not for actual casting. It is doubtful if many opportunities of this kind will be presented where so much good-will can be acquired for so little. It would appear that there is inherent in this project an unusual opportunity to secure a tremendous bargain in improved public relations and international good-will for all countries participating in it if the ECA could secure the financing of the casting in Europe.

H.T.T. 9/16/49

A CONTROL OF THE PROPERTY OF T

Note about the source of the second of the s

*- * * - * -

ESTIMATES FOR CASTING OF EQUESTRIAN STATUES

Sculptor: James E. Fraser Location: Arlington Memorial Bridge Plaza "The Arts of Peace" Group #1 "Harvest - Music"
Group #2 "Literature - Aspiration"

1/20/41 - Gorham Co. withdrew offer of \$41,319 each made previously.

12/4/46 - Gorham Co. refused to offer bid.
12/11/46 - Roman Bronze Co. advised they are out of business.

12/19/46- Capitol Products Co. estimates \$75,000 each; or \$300,000 for all four groups.

3/18/47 - Rodier estimates \$125,000 each, or \$500,000 for all four groups, f.o.b. Paris.

*7/11/47 - Capitol Products, Inc., estimates \$53,000 each, or \$212,000 for all four groups,

9 months work for each group. 8/8/47 - Bedi-Rossy estimates \$57,200 each, or \$228,800 for all four groups; indefinite delivery date,

> Location: Arlington Memorial Bridge Approach Sculptor: Leo Friedlander Title: "The Arts of War" Group #1 "Valor"

Group #2 "Sacrifice"

12/11/46 - Roman Bronze Co. advised they are out of business.

* 1/27/47 - Capitol Products Co. estimate \$70,0000 each, or \$280,000 for all four

groups; 10 months to cast each group.

1/30/47 - Gorham Co. made no estimate but would consider casting on "Gost-plus" basis with escalator clause.

Of the above firms, the Capitol Products Co. is the only foundry in the Inited States considered by the sculptors to be acceptable to perform the casting of their work in bronze. In 1947 they were in potential position to perform casting but estimated that the time required to complete the four groups would be 3 to $3\frac{1}{5}$ years.

The second of th 193

TOTAL STRUCTURES, THE TOTAL STRUCTURES OF A STRUCTURE OF LOCATORS, AND THE STRUCTURES OF THE STRUCTURE

Excerpts from Public Law 472 - 80th Congress Approved - April 3, 1948

- Sec. 102. (a) The restoration in European countries rests largely upon the establishment of sound economic conditions, and the achievement of a healthy economy independent of extraordinary outside assistance. "The accomplishment of these objectives calls for a plan of European recovery,* * * based upon a strong production effort, the expansion of foreign trade, the * * *.
- Sec. 102.(b) "It is the purpose of this title to promote industrial production in the participating countries * * *."
- Sec. 111. (a) The Administrator may, from time to time, furnish assistance to any participating country by providing for the performance of any of the functions set forth in paragraphs (1) through (5) of this subsection when he deems it to be in furtherance of the purposes of this title, and upon the terms and conditions set forth in this title and such additional terms and conditions consistent with the provisions of this title as he may determine to be necessary and proper.

(1) Procurement from any source, including Government stocks on the same basis as procurement by Government agencies under Public Law 375 (Seventy-ninth Congress) for their own use, of any commodity which he determines to be required for the furtherance of the purposes of this title. As used in this title, the term "commodity" means any commodity, material, article, supply, or goods necessary for the purposes of this title.

(2) Processing, storing, transporting, and repairing any commodities, or performing any other services with respect to a participating country which he determines to be required for accomplishing the purposes of this title. * * * *

- Sec. 111. (c) (1) The Administrator may provide assistance for any participating country, in the form and under the procedures authorized in subsections (a) and (b), respectively, of this section, through grants or upon payment in cash, or on credit terms, or on such other terms of payment as he may find appropriate, including payment by the transfer to the United States (under such terms and in such quantities as may be agreed to between the Administrator and the participating country) of materials which are required by the United States as a result of deficiencies or potential deficiencies in its own resources. * * * *
- Sec. 113. (b) The Administrator, whenever in his judgment the interests of the United States will best be served thereby, may dispose of any commodity procured out of funds made available for the purposes of this title, in lieu of transferring such commodity to a participating country, (1) by transfer of such commodity, upon reimbursement, to any department, agency, or

The second of th

Secondary Control of the secondary of th

(i) for the second problem of the second of

A constitution of the second o

Signature (a) (a) (ii) (iii) the company of the com

Sees 113, (h)

of the introduction of the control of the introduction of the control of the cont

establishment of the Government for use or disposal by such department, agency, or establishment as authorized by law, or (2) without regard to provisions of law relating to the disposal of Government-owned property, when necessary to prevent spoilage or wastage of such commodity or to conserve the usefulness thereof. Funds realized from such disposal or transfer shall revert to the respective appropriation or appropriations out of which funds were expended for the procurement of such commodity.

Sec. 117. (a) The Administrator, in furtherance of the purposes of section 115 (b) (5) and in agreement with a participating country, shall, whenever practicable, promote, by means of funds made available for the purposes of this title, an increase in the production of such participating country of materials which are required by the United States as a result of deficiencies or potential deficiencies in the resources within the United States. * * * * *

establish internation of its control of the control

section 117. (A) the division-traces, in firm sects of the purposes of section 115 (b) (c) and in agreement titles which wing courtmy and described practicable, promote, or means of an access of whis title, an uncrease of whis title, an uncrease of which are required or the production of metalials which are required or the Julius that the required or the Julius that the required or the Julius of a finite or potential deficiencies in the required or the first which the court was a finite or potential deficiencies in the required or the courts of the courts

COPY The Commission of fine Arts Washington

September 14, 1948.

Major General U. S. Grant III Chairman National Capital Park and Planning Commission Washington, D. C.

Dear General Grant:

The Commission of Fine Arts, at their meeting on September 13, 1948, were pleased to consider with you the following projects:-

1. Intersection of Pennsylvania Amenue and Constitution Avenues at Sixth Street.

The Commission believe that the only thoroughly satisfactory solution of this troublesome traffic problem is to build an Underpass along Pennsylvania Avenue in a manner along the lines as submitted in the form of plans by the District Commissioners and approved by this Commission a year or more ago. This scheme called for the retention of Constitution Avenue in its present state as an uninterrupted traffic route.

The Commission favor the elimination of street car tracks on Pennsylvania Avenue between Seventh Street east to the Capitol Grounds. As to an alternate scheme to provide temporary relief by the temporary surface channeling of traffic by means of islands, traffic lights, and the re-routing of street car lines, the Commission of Fine Arts wish to study this project on the receipt of a set of plans from the Highway Department of the District of Columbia.

2. Completion of the Washington Monument Grounds

The Commission were pleased to inspect the sketch model prepared by the National Capital Park and Planning Commission for this project. The Commission were impressed with its dignity and simplicity and believe that the present stage in the plans are in the right direction. The Commission suggest that further study be given to the composition of the plantations of trees and in this connection they urge great restraint, with a view toward retaining as much of the existing open lawn areas as possible.

The Commission understand that provision will be made for the parking of automobiles in a manner so that they are screened from view by plantations of trees.

pile voltas il stoc e il. Regionales

a light of the confer

Chalrada Strawl U. Grant T.L. Chalrada Chalrada Stratonal Judicka Ferra Lo. Florida Constant Constant

Mear General Manti

e de la Commune de la grante de la companya de la c

The John Living of the structure of the structure.

The Constitution darth the side intention of these careful constitutions of the constitution of the consti

a national di imparta de amblemati parte la collèmatique de

The containshow were theread to include the district model or correctly the detional carries in the district of the property of the district of the property of the district of the carries of the district of the carries of the district of

The solidate of the contract o

It is understood that careful study will be given to the planning of the paved area at the base of the monument, more particularly as related to the size, the shape, and the surface materials. The location of the approach paths also requires further study.

The Commission of Fine Arts hope that they will be kept informed of the progress of your work in connection with this proposed development.

The Commission heartily concur in your desire to have funds made a-vailable for this project, so that a beginning may be made in the construction work at the time of the Sesquicentennial Celebration in 1950.

#3. Statue of General Jose Gervasio Artigas.

Congress having authorized the erection of this statue on public grounds in the District of Columbia, by Act approved June 26, 1948, the Commission of Fine Arts have considered the question of its location with Dr. Jose A. Mora, Minister Plenipotentiary of Uruguay and a representative of the Department of State. It has been decided that the statue should be located in relation to the Pan American Union or its new Annex. The Office of National Capital Parks, which was represented during the discussion by Mr. Harry T. Thompson, Assistnat Superintendent, will give detailed study to the problem of placing the statue either on the east or the west side of the Annex, facing Constitution Avenue, and confer with representatives of the Pan American Union on the Subject. The National Capital Park and Planning Commission will be informed of the exact location finally selected for the statue.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

Gilmote D. Clarke Chairman

COPY

in the state of the file of th

The Continuing of the arts were the difference of the arts of the property of

The some issuica issued in across in the control of the control of

wash ref clastres each Larger to substa

Congress to wine abtenied the enection of this status on proved the Estatus of the Consisting of the London with the tender of the status of the tenders of the status of the consisting of the constitution of the constant of the co

For the Connection of Mare 1750.

lincered to the

extend .T equality

September 16, 1948.

The Commissioners of the District of Columbia, Washington, D.C.

Gentlemen.

At the last meeting of this Commission we learned of the recent death of Captain Herbert C. Whitehurst, for many years Director of Highways of the Government of the District of Columbia.

Through the years, the members of this Commission have had the opportunity to meet with Captain Whitehurst in connection with official matters related to the District and we always found him to be thoroughly informed in all matters pertaining to his office, always ready and willing to accept suggestions, always courteous, and withall, a splendid exemple of the unselfish public servant. It has been a privilege through the years to have known and to have worked with your late Director of Highways, and the Commission have asked me to write to you to express their sorrow in his passing and to add that his presence at our meetings, when he presented projects of the District of Columbia, will be greatly missed. We shall always remember him with deep affection and with the full realization that he has made important contributions to the development of the National Capital.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours, Gilmore D. Clarke, Chairman. عدال المستحي العالمة

e in the solution of the solut

ING. DOLTER

Succession of the second of th

and it organists and the set of t

:=in til _e inti = co call co =

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

Executive Offices
Washington 4, D.C.

July 13, 1948

The Honorable Gilmore D. Clarke, Chairman Commission of Fine Arts Interior Department Washington 25, D.C.

My dear Mr. Clarke:

Last February the owners of the Carlyle Hotel, 500 North Capitol Street, applied to your Commission for permission to erect a sign 3' x 30' on the front of their building a little below the roof. Such application was submitted to you under the provisions of the District of Columbia Sign Regulations. Your Commission has recommended disapproval of the proposal.

The legal representatives of the Hotel conferred with the Secretary of your Commission, who stated that the action had been taken without regard to any special equities that might exist in favor of the applicant, and that application must be made to the District Commission for any special relief. They have accordingly referred the matter to us.

Our information is as follows:

- 1. Four hotels (the Dodge, Commodore, Continental and Pennsylvania) have signs on or near their roofs, in each case larger than the sign now requested, and in each case facing on or clearly visible from the Union Station Plaza and adjacent Federal areas. Permits for these were issued many years ago.
- 2. The Carlyle Hotel, under its former name of Capitol Park Hotel, had a similar sign, considerably larger than the one now being requested, which had been erected under permit in 1914. It remained there until the recent War.
- 3. During the War the building was taken over by the Federal Works Administration and operated as a United Nations Service Center. In connection with this operation the sign was taken down.
- 4. After the War, FWA sold the building to The Carlyle Hotel, Inc., which gave the hotel its New name. The new owners could not, of course, utilize the old sign on account of the change of name. They therefore submitted to your Commission their application to put up a substitute sign; with the results indicated above.

While the Board of Commissioners have the final decision in the case, we are extremely reluctant to dissent from the views of your Commission. However, in the light of the facts presented to us, and in the absence of any other information, we find difficulty in going along with you.

=, = = 1 1 × 1 × 1 × 1 × 1 and the state of * State of the sta was the original of the contract of the contra فَكُمُوهِ فِي مُمْكُمُ مُورِي اللهِ الدُورِي مِن اللهِ مِنْ اللهِ مِنْ اللهِ عَلَيْهِ اللهِ اللهِ اللهِ اللهِ ال and the second of the second o end to becoming a literate of a religious district of a contracting of mili-. Lacomore La company of the com $oldsymbol{oldsymbol{eta}}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$. The definition of the control of t The first the second of the se and the control of th 1 22 M366 The All the second of the seco A second of the control The state of the s e in .i -oi. 8:-. da الإحادة فرنج المحمد والمتألف الراالية الأنباك المنافعي المدور والمنا الفائد المار والمنافع المنافع الماري الماري الماري الماري الماري الماري الماري The state of the s 3 the control of the transfer of the control of the c

From an equitable viewpoint it appears to us that the Hotel has a prima facie case for protesting your recommendation. The preceding owners, operating the Hotel under a different name, had a sign larger and more conspicuous than the one now being requested, and which, moreover, projected above the roof. That sign would still have been there, except that the Federal Government bought the property for temporary war use. The other hotels, which were not thus taken over by the Government, have retained their signs. There is an element of unfairness in preventing the newly re-opened hotel from enjoying the same advantages as its predecessor enjoyed, and as its competitors still enjoy.

It may plausibly be argued that such a consideration should not weigh against the further beautification of our city. If the decision of your Commission would produce a material effect along this line, the Board of Commissioners would be more inclined to concur in it. But this does not seem to be the case. We do not wish to raise the question of whether such signs do in fact injure or deface the beauty of the Plaza. Regardless of this, the fact remains that the other hotels can legally continue to use their signs. Our information is that these hotels as a group are in sound financial and physical condition, are doing an excellent business, and are likely to continue their operations indefinitely. Under these conditions, it does not appear that the denial of a sign to the Carlyle Hotel would have any material effect upon the beauty or symmetry of the Plaza and adjacent areas, from which the four other signs will continue to be visible.

It therefore seems to us that the request of the Carlyle Hotel, Inc., should be granted. However, before taking final@action, we should be happy to receive your views or to arrange for a conference with your Commission or its representative. I would appreciate your letting me know your wishes in the matter.

With warmest personal regards.

Sincerely yours,

/s/ JOHN RUSSELL YOUNG,
President
Board of Commissioners

C O P Y The series of th

Local particular and the second of the secon

, av is is a flame del de converti**cabi**

And the same of the

July 23, 1948.

Honorable John Russell Young President Board of Commissioners Government of District of Columbia Washington 4, D. C.

My dear Commissioner:

This will acknowledge your letter of July 13th relative to the question of a sign 3' x 30' proposed to be erected on the front of the Carlyle Hotel at a point a little below the roof line so that it may be visible from the Station Plaza.

The Commission of Fine Arts have exercised the greatest care in their endeavor to act consistently with respect to their responsibilities under the so-called Shipstead-Luce Act approved by the 71st Congress on May 16, 1930. In the regulations governing procedure under the provisions of the Act the following appears under "Signs":-

"No sign shall be constructed, painted, or affixed on buildings coming within the provisions of the act (Public, No. 231), except with specific approval of the Commission of Fine Arts in each case. In general, signs shall not exceed 25 square feet in area; the Commission may in its discretion make special exceptions to this requirement. No roof signs are permitted."

The Commission have in no instance within my memory, which goes back more than 15 years, made a substantial exception to the ruling above quoted. There have been several instances where special equities have been requested in favor of certain applicants. For the Commission to have deferred in favor of these applicants would have meant undermining the purposes of the Act as well as to treat unfairly every other applicant who agreed to conform to the provisions set forth by the Commission, more particularly in those cases where the applicants did not at first wish to conform with the regulations promulgated under the authority of the Act.

I can recall an instance where the editor of one of Washington's important newspapers wished to erect a sign across the front
of their office building, in size comparable to the one proposed by the
Carlyle Hotel. The application was denied, but not without a good deal
of heated discussion on the part of the applicant who finally agreed
to conform to the regulations; there were a number of other instances of
this character. Personally, I think it would be manifestly unfair to
every applicant whose request for a roof sign has been denied if
any exception is made to the rather specific regulation that "No roof
signs are permitted".

Thouse we so western laws
From looks
Cours of Commissing are
Government of Disbrict
Wishington by M. C.

ily dear Jonaleanourne

This will added to the property of the property of the present of the sign of the specific of the first of th

The Commission to the state are consistent to the consistent of the consistent of the consistent are entered in the consistent the consistent are entered in the consistent and selected approved by the flat Congress of the consistent are proceeded to the consistent are procedure under the consistent are consistent are procedure under "this consistent are consistent

Two sign shall be constructed, pertuber, or affiliated on outiled. The contint officer old promoted on outiled. The contint officer old proceeds the with specific tendent of the latest seed of the contint seed of the tendent of the latest seed of the contest of

The Commission in the danstrain and the content of the content of

I car neo il on dreboure terma lie edupor il e od encadante importanto neuroppane mini il e escado e il encada thou mon affect allaico baileing, in siss origin eigenst to il en equalistication ele acmis, eas en allace e allace e interperation ele acmis, eas en allace e en elemento e en elemento e en elemento el entre el entre el el entre

The only way we can get rid of ugly roof signs, which the Commission believe to be detrimental to the dignity and the beauty of the Plaza at the Union Station, is to take advantage of instances such as obtains in this particular case. If we permit the Carlyle Hotel to erect a roof sign, visible from points of view in the Union Station Plaza, is there any reason why the Hotel Washington, for example, should not erect a roof sign opposite the Treasury, or the Willard and the Raleigh Hotels erect roof signs on Pennsylvania Avenue? I think not.

The strength of the Shipstead-Luce Act has been retained through the coordinate actions of the Commissioners of the District of Columbia and the Commission of Fine Arts over a period of 18 years. If a single exception is made to the regulations, such as the approval of the recent application of the Hotel Carlyle to erect a roof sign, then the force of the Act will be dissipated and effective control to preserve the dignity of the National Capital will be lost.

It seems to me that with 18 years precedent behind us we need not fear if a case of this sort is tried in the courts of the District of Columbia.

While I realize, as stated in your letter, that four other signs will continue to be visible from the roofs of buildings in the Station Plaza it is a fact, I believe, that these signs were erected prior to the passage of the Shipstead-Luce Act and, inasmuch as the provisions of the Act are not retroactive, the District Commissioners and the Commission of Fine Arts are without power to effect any control. The time will come, however, when these signs will be removed; when they are we should see to it that they are not replaced.

I do not believe that an electric sign will make any difference in the volume of patronage to a hotel; satisfied patrons are the best means of advertising. The preservation of the dignity of the National Capital is the problem which is of first concern to this Commission; it would seem natural that this should be of some concern to Washington's hotels.

While I rather expect that I have expressed herein the unanimous views of the Commission of Fine Arts I would, neverthe-less, like to have their concurrence in the statements I have made in this letter and I would appreciate it if you could withhold any further action on the part of the Commissioners of the District of Columbia toward approval of the application of the Hotel Carlyle until after the next meeting of the Commission which time I shall bring this matter once again to their attention.

With warm personal regards,

Sincerely yours,

Honory Lassett alo, or shoulf

The oxity of the control of the cont

In a structured of the control of th

్రం కా ప్రాంతం చేయు గుంటుండారు. చూడుందిన కొన్న చేయాకుడి కల్కాని కుట్టుడు చేస్తో ఇంట్లు కల్కుకు కొన్న నిర్మాణకు అన్నారు. కుట్టికి మెక్కుకు కార్క్ కోష్ కుట్టి చేయుకు క్రాంతు. కాళా ఇంట్లు మెక్కి ద్వారికోండి కాళ్క కొర్

initia in a site of the site of the state of the site of the site

indice is relieved to the country of the construction of the construction of the country of the country of the country of the construction of the consequents and the consequents in the consequents in the consequents in the consequents in the consequents of the following configuration of the consequence of the consequence is a solution of the consequence of the consequence

euroan naidhean iir

HARBESON, HOUCH, LIVINGSTON AND LARSON ARCHITECTS

COPY

Successors to Paul P. Cret, Architect, 1510 Architects Building, Philadelphia 3, Pa.

8 September 1948

Re: A.B.M.C.

Mr. H. P. Caemmerer:
The Commission of Fine Arts
Interior Department Building
Washington, D.C.

Dear Mr. Caemmerer:

You have set aside some time for us at next Monday's meeting, but General North is still in Europe and the architects are all digesting suggestions made by him as a result of his visit of inspection to the sites, and therefore will not be ready to report, and I suggest you cancel our time.

I can report the following progress:

- l. Henri Chapelle. John Root has discussed the sculpture with Carl Milles: they have agreed that the sculpture shall not be assymetrical: that in front (roadside) there will be an eagle on the center line, rather tall, of Swedish granite; that toward the graves there will be a tall figure of a man, representing courage or patriotic duty, on a tall pedestal, also on the center line. Root is preparing a model on which these ideas will be tried, and these will be presented to your Commission when studied.
- 2. Margraten. Henry Shepley has restudied his chapel along the lines suggested by the Commission: in my opinion he has arrived at very good Battle Monuments character.
- 3. <u>Draguignan</u>. Henry Toombs is restudying his building along the lines requested.
- 4. St. James. Wm. T. Aldrich is trying a tower at lower height, as requested by General North, and a rearrangement of the plan bringing the Chapel nearer the graves area.
- 5. Neuville. The property-taking having completely changed, Andrew Reinhard will have to make a completely new start. The topography for this new start has not yet arrived.

The other architects are carrying along with their studies, some planning to visit the sites in the near future.

With best wishes,

Sincerely,

(Signed) John Harbeson

JH:c cc:Lt. Colonel Chas. B. Shaw

EXHIBIT H

The Thirty

uccessors to Paul F. Orra, weinteer,

8 September 1948

76: A.R.A. 19F

ir. H. P. Jasmersk: The Cornission of Fire .rts Interior Department Suilding ..eshington, D.C.

Dear Mr. Caemmarer:

You have set aside some the for us at land order of other, but be well use it still in Europe and the architects are the digoclary suggestions are of this visit of inspection to the since, and therefore whit not be rough to report, and I suggest you cencel our time.

- I can report the following progen as:
- 1. Heari Chapelle. John Root has discussed the soulpture with Jami Lilles: 19, have agreed that the soulpture shall not be asqueerical: that in front (reasside) there will be an acule on the center line, rather tall, of country ramits; date toward the graves there will be a tall figure of a man, representing occurry, on a tril pedestal, also on de conter hims. Note in preparing a model on which there ideas will be tried, and these will at gruentar to your Commission when studied.
 - 2. Margreter. Henry Topley has restudied his chapple the lines and elected by the Commission: in my opinion he has arrived to ware good intell contactus character.
 - 3. brequister. henry Roams is returying his bluncy shorp the line requester.
 - 4. St. James. The Andrich is trying a tower at lower being, as required an General worth, and a rearrangement of the plan bringler the Playel Playel recent the graves area.
 - 5. Keaville. To property-taking having educionally elected, that to the call will have to make a completely now styre. The topolysa, the time not clare make arrived.

The other architects are careful along what their studies, sure almount on whath the circs in the near between

. samelw dead doil

incerel,,

(Signed) John Hardeson

Jis cosib. Colonel Chas. c. shaw

(1).....

() · + · · ·

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

WASHINGTON

August 20, 1948

My dear Congressman,

This will acknowledge your telegram of this date, raising the question of placing the firm of Hubbell and Benes, Architects of Clevela nd, Ohio, on an approved list of the Commission of Fine Arts; the fact is, the Commission do not have an "approved list" of architects. From time to time they have been requested to submit the names of architects and firms of architects for the consideration of the American Battle Monuments Commission, Inasmuch as Messrs. Hubbell and Benes are interested in being considered I shall be glad to present their names to the Commission for consideration in connection with any future work. The next meeting of the Commission will be held on Monday, September 13th in Washington. At this moment I am not aware of any work of the Battle Monuments Commission for which architects have not already been engaged.

In connection with other work the Commission are hardly ever asked to recommend architects; they are usually selected by other governmental agencies in direct charge of the work involved.

With kind regards,

Sincerely yours,

Gilmore D. Clarke Chairman

The Honorable George H. Bender The House of Representatives Washington, D. C.

ne destante l'anna e din la martin de la company and the state of t —i, the interpretation of example in the control of the control o jetës und fless a_{ij} - the post for the a_{ij} - a_{ij} and a_{ij} - a_{ij} and a_{ij} - a_{ij} and a_{ij} and the state of t to the woman thin is a market him to the of the other way that it is a continued to The most marting of the confidence of the confid and the control of th complembs in its first transfer and the complete and the — grafing a light of the control of the control of the graphet in the company of beneat are the state of t pater of a life day, galace a some the time to and a of a 1112 Line.

COPY

The Commission of Fine Arts Washington

September 16, 1948.

Dear Congressman Bender:

I received your letter of September 10th, recommending that the architectural firm of Hubbell and Benes, of Cleveland, be placed on a list of architects for World War II memorials, and brought it to the attention of the Commission of Fine Arts at their meeting on September 13, 1948.

The Commission concur in your opinion that the firm has done outstanding work in Cleveland and elsewhere; indeed the Cleveland Museum of Art is one of the notable buildings of the country.

Chairman Clarke called my attention to a letter that he addressed to you on August 20th in regard to this matter, in which he stated that he would "be glad to present their names to the Commission for consideration in connection with any future work. . . At this moment I am not aware of any work of the Battle Monuments Commission for which architects have not already been engaged."

Chairman Clarke presented the names of Hubbell and Benes to the

Commission of Fine Arts. Before further action can be taken it will

Be necessary to await a request from the American Battle Monuments

Commission for advice as to recommendations for additional architectural

services. For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

H.P.Caemmerer, Secretary,

Hon. George H. Bender, House of Representatives, Washington, D. C.

13.30

- 1

-X 1 32 120 15 171

a month of the A

¢ - L.

n, - ndorđilica

September 13, 1948.

Dear Mr. Howard:

At a meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts held today, attention was called to a letter addressed to you by Chairman Clarke on July 27, 1948, concerning the design for an Employee Honor Award Medal ordered by the United States Department of the Interior. The suggestion was made "that your sculptor make the changes suggested by Mr. Lawrie for the obverse of the medal and submit another photograph of the revised model for approval.

The Commission of Fine Arts have not received the photograph in question and would be pleased to hear from you as to what is being done in the matter.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

H. P. Caemmerer,

Secretary.

Honorable Leland Howard, Acting Director of the Mint, Treasury Department, Washington, D.C.

Exhibit K

garage grant territoria a Table

g the sale the the

abbending of the state of the s

The first the first of the water in the west was a second of the first of the first

south the state of the state of

e in the terms of the terms of

COPY

Treasury Department,

Washington

Office of the Director of the Mint.

September 16, 1948.

Commission of Fine Arts, Interior Department Building, Washington, D.C.

Gentlemen:

In reference to your letter dated September 13, 1948, the changes suggested by Mr. Lawrie for the obverse of the medal for the United States Department of the Interior were not adopted in view of the fact that the model, as submitted, represented an exact replica of the official seal of the Department of the Interior. The Department of the Interior desired that the obverse of the medal be identical with the official seal.

Very truly yours,

Leland Howard,

Acting Director of the Mint.

Exhibit R-11

ون ـ عنه

10 1 71 8

e i in e i.

a - 44 - 4 - 23.

Journal of Mars are, and the state of the st

ide blenen:

The content of the co

local a may hours

, and the last ser

*v. i cl. lo c. coeni. gairo

adar same in Visit in the same