Article Feedback V5
Project Overview

Prepared by:
Fabrice Florin
Wikimedia Foundation
fflorin@wikimedia.org

March 23, 2012
Article Feedback v5
Wikimedia Product Group

- **Goal 1**: engage readers to **contribute** to Wikipedia
- **Goal 2**: help editors **improve articles** on Wikipedia
- **Solution**: invite readers to provide **article feedback**
- **Process**: develop and test 3 different **feedback forms**
- **Research**: collect and analyze 4 different **data points**
Phase 1 Overview

• Call to action: Help improve this page

• Inputs: comments for all 3 forms + yes/no or rating

• Scope: 22,000+ articles on English encyclopedia (0.6%)

• Outreach: IRC chats, talk page, surveys, evaluations


• Decision: Selected option 1 as the final form in Feb.

• Next steps: Final tests in Mar.- Apr., deployment in May.
Key Features

- feedback forms (phase 1.0)
- feedback page (phase 1.5)
- calls to action (phase 1.0+)
- talk page integration (phase 2.0)
- expanded feedback (phase 2.0)
Activity Flow

Here are the 3 key stages of the desired “virtuous circle.”

Read Article

Post Feedback

Edit Article
Editors promote the best posts to Talk.

Did you know you can edit this article?
Feedback forms
Feedback Forms

We tested 3 different forms in phase 1:

• **Option 1:** *Find what you’re looking for?*

• **Option 2:** *Make a suggestion*

• **Option 3:** *Rate this article*
Feedback Form – Option 1

Help improve this article

Did you find what you were looking for?  
Yes  No

What was most useful to you? How could this article be improved?

By posting, you agree to transparency under these terms.

Post your feedback
Feedback Form – Option 2

Help improve this article

- Suggestion
- 🤗 Praise
- 😞 Problem
- 😊 Question

Make a suggestion! How can this article be improved?

By posting, you agree to transparency under these terms.

Post your feedback
Feedback Form – Option 3

Help improve this article

Is this article helpful? ★★★★½

Add a comment. How can this article be improved?

By posting, you agree to transparency under these terms.

Post your feedback
Overall Findings


- **30,000+ feedback posts** in first 6 weeks
- **73%** of posts had comments
- **98%** of posts were from anonymous users
- **64%** of users surveyed like the feedback forms
- **45%** of posts were found useful by at least 2 editors
Comparison - Overall

How do the three designs compare?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Option 1</th>
<th>Option 2</th>
<th>Option 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feedback volume (% posts)</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful to editors (% posts)</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful to readers (% responses)</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful to team (% responses)</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Feedback Volume

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option 1</th>
<th>Option 2</th>
<th>Option 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[Boxplot]</td>
<td>[Boxplot]</td>
<td>[Boxplot]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Daily feedback with text

[Boxplot details]
Graph – Editor Evaluations

Proportion useful

Usefulness agreement

- Mean: 65%
- Mean: 45%
- Mean: 38%

Option 1
Option 2
Option 3
Feedback page
Feedback: Newt Gingrich

14 feedback posts on this article  53% found what they were looking for

Sort by: Date | Helpful | Rating  Showing: Comments only (11)  

24.17.83.33 did not find what they were looking for

Why is Newt Gingrich's campaign manager able to edit out all references to infidelity and multiple marriages from this article???

Is this feedback helpful?  Yes  No  0 yes / 0 no

Flag as abuse

72.45.198.154 found what they were looking for
everthing.

Is this feedback helpful?  Yes  No  0 yes / 0 no

Flag as abuse

173.55.37.184 posted this comment

CNN: 1999 Report On Newt Gingrich’s Exoneration By The IRS Over Ethics Charges - http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qMpbBRUCMde8 The House Ethics Committee report, and the record of the House debate in January 1997 as recorded in the Congressional Record, supports Gingrich's contention that the $300,000 he paid was a "reimbursement" or "sanction" related to legal fees incurred, but not a fine or admission of any wrongdoing. Gingrich paid the cost of legal bills associated with the mul... More

Is this feedback helpful?  Yes  No  1 yes / 0 no

Flag as abuse
Feedback: Barack Obama

491 feedback posts on this article  51% found what they were looking for

Showing: Helpful (40)  Sort by: Date ▼ I Helpful ▲ I Rating

🌟 216.38.130.165 found what they were looking for

I like this article, but would like to see more info about his wife and children, and what he is like as a family man.

Is this feedback helpful?  Yes  No  11 yes / 0 no  Flag as abuse

🌟 Fabrice Florin found what they were looking for

Good article overall! It would be helpful to provide more info about his childhood, his family and cultural background.

Is this feedback helpful?  Yes  No  1 yes / 0 no  Flag as abuse

🌟 216.125.34.2 posted this comment

This bio states that Pres. Obama ended the war in Iraq. But as stated elsewhere, Forces are mandated to withdraw from Iraqi territory by December 31, 2011, agreement signed in 2008 by President Bush. The U.S. troop withdrawal fro
Feedback: Barack Obama

491 feedback posts on this article  51% found what they were looking for

Showing: Helpful (40)  Sort by: Date ▾ Helpful ▾ Rating

😊 216.38.130.185 found what they were looking for  4 minutes ago

I like this article, but would like to see more info about his wife and children, and what he is like as a family man.

Is this feedback helpful?  👍 Yes  👎 No  11 yes / 0 no

Flag as abuse

😊 Fabrice Florin found what they were looking for  6 minutes ago  (see old article)

Good article overall! It would be helpful to provide more info about his childhood, his family and cultural background.

Is this feedback helpful?  👍 Yes  👎 No  1 yes / 0 no

Flag as abuse

😊 216.125.34.2 posted this comment  5 hours ago

This bio states that Pres. Obama ended the war in Iraq. But as stated elsewhere, U.S. Forces are mandated to withdraw from Iraqi territory by December 31, 2011. The agreement signed in 2008 by President Bush. The U.S. troop withdrawal from Iraq.
Feedback Page Goals

- **Surface good feedback**
  Promote high-quality suggestions

- **Help editors use feedback**
  Create list of actionable tasks

- **Reduce the noise**
  Filter out low-quality feedback
Problems

- Only some of the feedback is **useful**.
- Moderating feedback is **more work** for editors.
- Bad feedback **harms** everyone.
Solutions

- Use **software** to pre-filter abuse or spam.
- Invite **readers** to pre-moderate (mark/flag).
- Have **editors** focus on using the best feedback.
Surface good feedback

FEEDBACK PAGE

1 Needs info
2 Needs a link
3 Needs a photo

Filtered by:
- Software
- Readers
- Editors
Help editors use feedback

**FEEDBACK PAGE**

- 1 Needs info ✓
- 2 Needs a link
- 3 Needs a photo
- 4 Needs editing

**Editor 1:**
Feature this post

**Editor 2:**
Mark as resolved
Reduce the noise

Different ways to block or decrease bad feedback.

**AUTOMATED**
- Software (before posting)
- Software (after posting)

**MANUAL**
- Readers
- Editors

Abuse Filter

Spam block

e.g.: Flag this post

Bad Feedback

Bad Feedback

Bad Feedback
Actions

I want to

read
article

post
feedback

view
feedback

mark
feedback

edit
article

talk
on article

mark as
helpful

mark as
unhelpful

flag as
abuse

feature
this post *

hide

request
oversight

oversight

< < <
readers

> > >

<<<< editors

>>>  << oversighters

* 'feature this post' is a proposed new feature
Next Release
Features for next release

• Feature this post
• Mark as resolved
• Relevance filter
• Abuse filter

Under consideration for future releases:
• Custom settings for each page
• Captcha on controversial articles?
• API / Tool server for developers
Feature this post

This new feature lets **editors** surface actionable feedback:

- in **default view**
- in **“featured” filter**

Who can feature posts?

- **Any auto-confirmed editor**

How does it work?

- Shared, a bit like **“Hide this post”**
- Toggle with **“Unfeature this post”**
Mark as resolved

This feature lets editors mark issues that have been solved:

• shown in “resolved” filter
• hidden from default view or “featured” filter

Who can mark posts as resolved?

• Any auto-confirmed editor

How does it work?

• Shared, a bit like “Hide this post”
• Toggle with “Unfeature this post”
• Only available for posts that have been “featured”
Relevance filter

Show readers a filtered view of the feedback page, with:

• **Helpful** posts

• **Featured** posts

• **Comments-only**

  (filtered first, then sorted by date, then by “relevance score”)

Remove from default view all posts that are:

• **Unhelpful** (if helpfulness score is negative - min. 2? users)

• **Marked as resolved**

• **Flagged as abuse, Hidden, or Oversighted**
Abuse filter

Automated software to filter abuse, spam and junk.

Can be used before or after posting:
- **before**: prevent users from posting bad feedback
- **after**: auto-flag questionable posts for monitors

Examples of items to be filtered include:
- **offensive words** (e.g.: 'f*** you')
- links to known [spam sites](#)
- **gibberish** (e.g.: the same characters repeated 10+ times?)
- **email addresses** (e.g.: anything with a '@' symbol?)

We aim to leverage these MediaWiki extensions:
- **AbuseFilter** by Andrew Garrett (Werdna)
- **SpamBlacklist** by Tim Starling
Questions

• Who can post feedback?
• Who can view feedback?
• What is the default view?
• What cannot be viewed?
• How is this monitored?
• Can settings be changed?
Who can post feedback?

**Everyone** can post feedback, except:

- **Blocked** users
- **Abusive** users (filtered out via Abuse filter)
- **Readers** of controversial pages (if protected by admins)
Who can view feedback?

- **Everyone** can view “filtered” feedback on default view

Restrictions:

- **Some users** cannot view controversial page feedback (if protected by admins)
- **Only monitors** can view hidden feedback
- **Only overseers** can view oversighted feedback
What cannot be viewed?

Readers cannot view these feedback posts:

• Flagged 5x or more  (auto-hidden)
• Hidden
• Oversight requested
• Oversighted
• Feedback on controversial pages  
  (if protected by admins)
How is feedback monitored?

Monitors can moderate feedback with these tools:

- Feature this post (proposed)
- Mark as resolved (proposed)
- Hide this post
- Request oversight

Oversighters can do the same, plus:

- Oversight this post
- Decline oversight
Can feedback settings be changed?

Admins can change feedback settings for a page:

- **Restrict posting** on this article
  - no posts
  - posts with captcha
  - unrestricted posting

- **Restrict viewing** of the feedback page
  - monitors only
  - editors only
  - unrestricted viewing

- Feedback settings would be added in “Protect” feature.
Our Vision

• Help **get readers more engaged.**

• Give them tools to **suggest article improvements.**

• Encourage them to **become editors** over time.

• Offer practical feedback tools to **experienced editors.**

• Get readers and editors to **collaborate,** so everybody wins!