Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

Carlos Manuel Colina
[[lad:User:Jewbask]]

Haifa, Israel. August 5, 2011
What is an Endangered Language?

A language is **endangered** when it is on a path towards extinction. A language is in danger when its speakers cease to use it, use it in an increasingly reduced number of communicative domains, and cease to pass it on from one generation to the next. That is, there are no new speakers, adults or children. Without adequate documentation, a language that is extinct can *never be revived*.

According to the UNESCO Atlas of the World's Languages in Danger,

“It is estimated that, if nothing is done, half of 6000 plus languages spoken today will disappear by the end of this century. With the disappearance of unwritten and undocumented languages, humanity would lose not only a cultural wealth but also important ancestral knowledge embedded, in particular, in indigenous languages.”
Degrees of endangerment

These terminology is based on UNESCO’s Language Vitality and Endangerment framework that establishes six degrees of vitality/endangerment based on nine factors. Of these factors, the most salient is that of intergenerational transmission.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree of endangerment</th>
<th>Intergenerational Language Transmission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>safe</td>
<td>language is spoken by all generations; intergenerational transmission is uninterrupted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;&gt; not included in the Atlas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vulnerable</td>
<td>most children speak the language, but it may be restricted to certain domains (e.g., home)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>definitely endangered</td>
<td>children no longer learn the language as mother tongue in the home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>severely endangered</td>
<td>language is spoken by grandparents and older generations; while the parent generation may understand it, they do not speak it to children or among themselves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>critically endangered</td>
<td>the youngest speakers are grandparents and older, and they speak the language partially and infrequently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>extinct</td>
<td>there are no speakers left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;&gt; included in the Atlas if presumably extinct since the 1950s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

The languages used in this study

Wayuunaiki (Guajiro)
Wayuunaiki

An indigenous Arawakan language spoken mainly in the northern tip of South America, specifically in the colombian department of La Guajira, and the venezuelan state of Zulia, which share the border common to both countries. It is spoken by approximately 400,000 speakers.
Wayuunaiki

Approximately less than 1% of Wayuunaiki speakers are literate in the wayuú language, while 5 to 15% are literate in Spanish.
The languages used in this study

Ladino (Judaeo-Spanish, Espanyolit)
Judaeo-Spanish

A Romance language derived from Medieval Spanish that has been influenced heavily by Hebrew, Aramaic, Arabic, Turkish, French, Aragonese, Portuguese and to a lesser extent Greek and south Slavic languages where Sephardic exiles settled around the world, primarily all over the Mediterranean basin. Some linguists consider it a macro-language because its dialects form a language continuum expanding from Morocco to Turkey and from Israel to the Netherlands.
Judaeo-Spanish

Like many other Jewish languages, Judaeo-Spanish is in danger of language extinction. Most native speakers are elderly, many of them having emigrated to Israel where the language has not been transmitted to their children or grandchildren. However, it is experiencing a minor revival among Sephardic communities, especially in music.

In some expatriate communities in Latin America and elsewhere, there is a threat of dialect leveling resulting in assimilation into modern Spanish.
Judaeo-Spanish is experiencing a revival in music, and many *world music* artists have become well-known outside of the Judaeosphere, such as:

- Yasmin Levy, Mor Karbasi, Etty Benzaken, Smadar Levi, Kohava Levy, Ofri Eliaz (Israel)
- Françoise Atlan (France-Morocco)
- Fortuna Safdie (Brazil)
- Flory Jagoda (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- Consuelo Luz (Chile)
- Sami Levi (Turkey)
- Doris Benmamán (Venezuela)
- Judith Cohen (United States)
- Liliana Alcalay Treves (Argentina)

And groups like
- Sefarad, Janet i Jak Esim (Turkey)
- Aman Aman (Spain)
- DeLeon, Pharaoh's Daughter (United States)
- Los Desterrados (United Kingdom)
- Kol Oud Tof Trio (Israel)
Challenges faced by the wikimedians contributing in these languages
A few native speakers of the language, many of them elderly

Wayuunaiki: approx. 400,000 speak it at a native level, but people with some knowledge of the language may be up to 2,000,000. Most speak the language only at home and at family/community events, while using Spanish at work/school or anywhere a non-wayuu is present.

Judaeo-Spanish: approx 160,000. Out of these, approx. 20% speak it at a native level, mostly older than 70 years old. The younger generations are not “getting” the language through their parents, for various reasons.
The language is neither regulated nor standardized

Wayuunaiki is mostly an oral language; only recently education efforts have been made by the colombian and venezuelan governments and some NGOs to make the wayuú people able to read and write in their own language. There is no regulation, albeit the Centro Integral Etnoeducativo Kamusuchiwo'u, in Colombia, has designed a series of educational books.

Judaeo-Spanish is a language scattered around the Mediterranean basin, with several small dialects that form a language continuum expanding from Morocco to Istanbul, to the point that the dialects in the extremes of it are not mutually intelligible to each other.
Most of the Wayuunaiki speakers belong to the lowest socio-economic level of the Venezuelan and Colombian societies; many live in a rural environment earning a living from goat husbandry and artesanal fisheries, while most of the urban wayuus engage in small trade and work as construction workers. Like in most of the Latin American societies, the use of an aboriginal language is frowned upon, as it is seen as backwards and low-class.

Albeit most of the Judaeo-Spanish speakers belong to the medium and medium-high class levels of society, the language is rarely use by the younger generations because the local language is preferred in order to better assimilate in the surrounding society; in Latin America the language of the younger generations has been leveled due to the mutual intelligibility of Modern Spanish and Judaeo-Spanish, resulting in the usage of mostly isolated words in a Modern Spanish conversation.
The use of more than one writing systems

Judaeo-Spanish uses 17 different writing systems, such as:

- Rashi/Solitreo system
- “Square” Hebrew alphabet
- Aki Yerushalayim orthography
- “Turkish” Ortography
- “French” Ortography
- “Anglo” Ortography
- “Balcanic” Ortography
- Cyrillic-based orthography
- “Greek” orthography
- “Romanian” orthography
- “Castillian” ortography
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

A lack of language regulator

The *Autoridad Nasionala del Ladino* is a national Israeli organization created in 1997 with the goal of preserving and safeguarding Judaeo-Spanish. It publishes media in Judaeo-Spanish and helps propagating the knowledge and awareness of the Judaeo-Spanish culture.

In Colombia, the *Centro Etnoeducativo Kamusuchiwo’u* promotes education in Wayuunaiki while at the same time raising awareness of the wayuyú culture.

But neither is a language regulator.
Marginalization of the group of speakers

Even though Colombia and Venezuela are considered among the least racist countries in Latin America, the association with a native American Indian background is often equated with belonging to a backward community. In order to minimise this association, the members of the community “disguise” their relationship to wayuunaiki in several ways:

- Changing last name to a less “native”-sounding name:
  Uriana to Rincón, Jusayú to Morillo, Epiyú to Semprún, Uriana to Carrillo

- Reduce the usage of traditional clothing to family gatherings and events in the hometown

- Reduce the usage of wayuunaiki to family gatherings and events in the hometown
Speakers belong to an aboriginal group

The Wayuús are considered among the few south american aboriginals that have resisted and evolved through the Spanish Colonization, adapting some influence that came from Spain while not leaving their traditions aside.
Judaeo-Spanish speakers can be found in countries all over the Mediterranean basin, the Netherlands, the Americas and the Balkans. The largest communities can be found in Israel, Turkey, France and the US.
Speakers are “immersed” into a dominant language

Judaeo-Spanish and Modern Castilian (Spanish) are considered to have around 80% of mutual intelligibility.
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

Limited availability of printed/online media in the language

**Judaeo-Spanish:**
- Aki Yerushalayim – biannual magazine published in Israel
- Şalom – weekly bilingual (tr/lad) journal published in Turkey
- El Amaneser – monthly magazine published in Turkey
- Los Muestros – tri-monthly multilingual (fr/en/lad) magazine published in Belgium
- Maguén–Escudo – tri-monthly bilingual (es/lad) magazine published in Venezuela

**Online forums and communities**
- Sefaradimuestro
- eSefarad
- Ladinokomunitá
- Tapuz.co.il has a forum where all posts are in Judaeo-Spanish
- Several Judaeo-Spanish Groups in social networks like Facebook and Orkut

**Radio**
- Kol Israel (Israel) has a program in Judaeo-Spanish
- Radio Exterior de España (Spain) has a program in Judaeo-Spanish
- Radio Sefarad (Spain) has programs in Judaeo-Spanish
Limited availability of printed/online media in the language

Wayuunaiki
• Wayuunaiki: Monthly journal published in Venezuela in Spanish and Wayuunaiki
• Online forums on social networking such as Facebook

Radio
• Radio Fe y Alegría (Venezuela) has a daily program in Wayuunaiki
The lack of a local chapter does not help

Who is going to deal or collaborate with a private individual, anyway?
New users *come and go* quickly

This is an issue we share with the rest of wikis :-(

Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

Wayuunaiki Wikipedia

In the Incubator since 7 August 2008
118 Articles. 3 active users. None is a native speaker.
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

Wayuunaiki Wikipedia

Most articles are stubs or written in a mix of Spanish and Wayuunaiki. The interface has not been translated yet.
El Conocimiento Libre como pieza clave en el desarrollo de la cultura wiki

Judaeo-Spanish Wikipedia

Available since June 2006
2,736 Articles and 26 active users out of 5,110; 9 of these are admins and 7 are native speakers.
The interface has been translated using a phonemic variant that has not been accepted by many users.

¡Venidos buenos á la Vikipedya!
La Ansiklopedya Libera
que todos pueden trocar y desvelopar

26 Enero 2012, Jueves

Número total de artículos en la Vikipedya Judeo-Española: 2,736

Akí podemos usar la grafía latina i también la ebrea!

Buenas venid@es á la Vikipedya en Español, la versión en Judeo-Espanhol de la Vikipedya. Ésto es un proeycto enternasional hecho de la parte de voluntarios, kon el buto de hazer una ansiklopedya libera, aksesível, kolaborativa i en munchas liguas. El objektivo es la plena transmisión de saviduria i konosimientos sin reströckiones edditoriales ni komerciales. El desenvolopamiento de la Vikipedya en Español está aviento a todos los enterecestados a ajustar artículos akí en Judeo-Espanhol.

Si puede ser, mira Vikipedya:Kómo melder i escribir para poder melder o escribir kon la ortografía latina, eskojida akí para la Vikipedya.
Judaeo-Spanish Wikipedia

Some articles are long and complete, while some others are mere stubs

Ortaköy

**Ortaköy** es un kazal en el bocde del **Bosfor** ke apartenke a la sivdad **Beşiktaş**. La **meskita** de Ortaköy ez el sembol del lugar. Ay una famoza plasa ke se vende kozas, ez un emportante lugar popular del tiempo de loz otomanos. En su tiempo era un lugar de kampania de los sultanes. Los palacios son famozos kon suz natural ermozuras.

Aya se topa el **palasio de Çirağan**, el liseo de Kabataş, la **universite de Galatasaray** i el **Hotel Princess**. En el markado de Ortaköy se topa kal, meskita i eglesia. En el centro de la sivdad ay botikas ke venden kozas de regalos, kafe, restorantas i bares. En el kamino ke seva a la mar ay botikas ke azen gozlemes, i esto ez la espezialidad de Ortaköy.

El problem maz grande de Ortaköy ez el trafiko, i lugar para meter loz **otomobiles**. Aparte de esto ay unos kuantos Auto-parkos privados, ke loz diaz de Alhad ez yeno de otomobiles, i ez dificil de topar lugar. El pueblo piedra munchi tiempo en loz kaminos a kavza del trafiko. Loz moradores de este lugar estan muy keshodos de esta situasion.

Entre el pueblo ke bive en Ortaköy ay djente ke tienen **motosikletas**. En la entrada de Ortaköy ay un lugar ke apartenke a eycs nombrado Harley Davidson.

Laz guertas de chay en frente de la mar ez el lugar maz preferado de todo el pueblo, chikos i grandes.

En Ortaköy ay un klub de spor fundado en el 1930, Se yama Ortaköy Spor Kulübü. La kolor de laz vistimientas es kolorado i blanko.

**El simiteryo djudio en Ortaköy**

El **simiteryo djudio** en Ortaköy se topa en Estambol en el kazal **Beşiktaş** en la maae **Balmumcu**. Kome es el simiteryo sorka de Ortaköy sasta yamando el simiteryo de los djudios de Ortaköy. Este lugar se uza para enterrar los djudios en los lugares ke no se estan uzando. Aya fueron frecuadas i ez apropiado para djente partikular. Por modo de las luvis ke ay den vez en vez, unas kuantas de las tumbas trokaron de lugar, o ke se espresieron. Dainda se uza este simiteryo para enterrar defuntos.

Katöggoñas: Maales de Istanbul | Estambol | Ortaköy
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

Still, there is light at the end of the tunnel
NGOs helping propagate Wayuunaiki

Centro Integral Etnoeducativo Kamusuchiwo'u: Each one of its schools are made out of a traditional structure, made of clay, plants and dry wood. This educational institution has presence in Carrizal, Iraipa, Cardón and Cabo de la Vela, with a total of about 2,800 students. Its system combines wayuú language learning, knowledge and traditional culture with the pedagogic strategies of the Western world. This initiative, known in the native language as Sukuaipa Anoita Kamusuchiwo'u or Management for the Welfare of Kamusuchiwo'u, has become a benchmark in Colombia for bi-cultural education.
NGOs helping propagate Wayuunaiki

Wayúu Tayá Foundation: an NGO founded by fashion model and Hollywood actress Patricia Velásquez (also a wayuú) to focus on assisting the Wayúu people. Its star program is Technology for Wayúu Education (TEW), an education project designed to improve Wayúu children’s writing, reading and speaking skills in Spanish as well as Wayuunaiki, strengthening their identity as Wayuús and encourage leadership for community development through the use of information technologies. It recently released a Dictionary of Technology terms developed jointly with Microsoft.
NGOs helping propagate Wayuunaiki

**Fundación Belloso:** NGO promoting several causes in the state of Zulia, in Venezuela. Together with the University Hospital of Maracaibo and La Universidad del Zulia, designed and publishes the FAQ/Pocket Wayuunaiki-Spanish Dictionary, for those patients who do not speak Spanish and require medical attention and the program included a basic course of wayuunaiki to the physicians working at this center and the signalization of the areas at the Hospital in both languages.
NGOs helping propagate Judaeo-Spanish

Centro de Estudios Sefardíes de Caracas: NGO conceived with the purpose of helping in the rescue, research, preservation and dissemination of Sephardic culture - and therefore its revitalization and enhancement, with an emphasis in its various forms, not just in Venezuela but also in the Caribbean basin and the rest of Central and South America.
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

NGOs helping propagate Judaeo-Spanish

**Casa Sefarad-Israel:** NGO resulting from the alliance between the Municipality of Madrid and the Spanish Ministry of Foreign Affairs aimed at promoting the further study of the legacy of the Sephardic culture and live as an integral part of Spanish culture, greater awareness of Jewish culture, and the development of the ties of friendship and cooperation between Spanish and Israeli societies.
NGOs helping propagate Judaeo-Spanish

Naime & Yehoshua Salti Center for Ladino Studies: Part of the Faculty of Jewish Studies at Bar-Ilan University (Israel), its aimed at encouraging Jewish studies and research in Israel and throughout the world to preserve Judaeo-Spanish heritage.
Challenges encountered on Wikimedia projects for endangered languages

NGOs helping propagate Judaeo-Spanish

Moshe David Gaon Center for Ladino Culture: Part of the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences at Ben Gurion University of the Negev (Israel), its aimed at encouraging Jewish studies and research in Israel and throughout the world to preserve Judaeo-Spanish heritage.

 Sentro Moshe David Gaon de Kultura Djudeo-Espanyola

/ http://cmsprod.bgu.ac.il/humsoe/centers/gaon/mivne
Now, it’s time to make questions and throw stones and/or flowers at me ;-)