

MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
13 January 1971

AM
10:00

CONVENE, 708 JACKSON PLACE, N.W.

ADMINISTRATION

1. Approval of Minutes of October 1970 Meeting
2. Date of Next Meeting: Wednesday, 17 February 1971
3. Lighting of Federal Triangle and White House - Status
4. Old Georgetown Act:

Administration and Policy Issues

- a. Regulation and Control of Exterior Colors
- b. Waterfront Development, Urban Design and Development Corporation proposal

SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

1. D.C. Government, Office of General Services
 - a. Shaw School Replacement, 10th and Rhode Island Avenue, N.W. - Revised Design
 - b. Benning Elementary School, 41st & East Capitol Sts., N.E. - Revised Design
 - c. Engine Company No. 6 and Rescue Squad No. 1, 4th & N Sts., N.W. - Revised Design
 - d. Rosedale Recreation Center Swimming Pool Replacement, 17th and Gale Sts., N.E. - Proposed Design
 - e. Benning Recreation Center and Swimming Pool - 17th St. and Southern Avenue, S.E.
2. D.C. Government, Office of Economic Development
 - a. Old Georgetown Act
 - (1) O.G. 71-47, 1715 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. - Add second floor, roof and stucco walls for Japan Inn Inc.

(2) Appendix 2

b. Shipstead-Luce Act

- a. Columbia Plaza Office Building, 24th and E Sts., N.W. - Revised Design
- b. Acacia Mutual Life Insurance Co. Parking Garage, 51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W. - Proposed Parking Garage Design
- c. Appendix 1

3. American Battle Monuments Commission

Distinguished Military Actions Commemorative Program - Revised Designs

LEGISLATION

H.R. 15587, "To amend the D.C. Redevelopment Act of 1945 by directing and establishing orderly procedures for the modification of an urban renewal plan and requiring adherence thereto by the D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency, by requiring that provision be made in each redevelopment contract for timely construction of public streets, etc.

INTERVIEWS

11:00 1. D.C. Government, Office of Economic Development

Old Georgetown Act

- a. Discussion with Architectural Board of Consultants reference O.G. 71-47, Japan Inn, 1715 Wisconsin Ave., N.W., and related matters.

11:45 b. O.G. 71-47, 1715 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. - Japan Inn Inc., Wilkes and Faulkner, architects

Shipstead-Luce Act

- a. Columbia Plaza Office Building, 24th and E Sts., N.W. - Revised Design
- b. Acacia Mutual Life Insurance Parking Garage, 51 Louisiana Ave., N.W. - Proposed Design

12:00 2. D.C. Government, Department of General Services

- a. Shaw School Replacement, 10th and Rhode Island Avenue, N.W. - Revised Design
- b. Benning Elementary School, 41st & East Capitol Sts., N.E. - Revised Design

c. *Engine Company No. 6 and Rescue Squad No. 1,
4th and N Sts., N.W. - Revised Design*

d. *Rosedale Recreation Center Swimming Pool Replacement,
17th and Gale Sts., N.E. - Proposed Design*

e. *Benning Recreation Center and Swimming Pool - Proposed Design*

3. *Freer Gallery of Art*

Inspection of Proposed Acquisitions

MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
13 January 1971

I. CONVENE, 708 JACKSON PLACE, N.W., WASHINGTON, D.C.

A regular meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts was held in its office on January 13, 1971. The members met pursuant to notice.

Present were: William Walton, Chairman
Gordon Bunshaft
Kevin Roche
Hideo Sasaki
Chloethiel Woodard Smith

Staff: Charles H. Atherton, Secretary
Mary Bean
Sibley Jennings
Jon Myer
Marylyn Shaw

II. ADMINISTRATION

a. The date of the next meeting was tentatively set for February 17, 1971.

b. The minutes of the meeting of October 14, 1970 were approved.

c. Lighting of Federal Triangle & White House, restudy (Exhibit A)

III. SUBMISSIONS - REVIEWS

a. D.C. Government, Office of General Services

1. Shaw Elementary School, 10th Street and Rhode Island Avenue, N.W., revised design. Sulton - Campbell, architects.

The school had been completely redesigned since it was first submitted at the July 1970 meeting. The perspective sketches gave the impression of a much improved overall design. Instead of being an arbitrary assemblage of geometric forms, it was now a straightforward response to the functional needs of the school. The major change was in the reshaping of the classroom or "learning center" elements, which were now

composed in three identical rectangular spaces. This scheme afforded much greater flexibility in the formation of teaching groups and resulted in greater simplicity of the structural frame. In addition, the service area had been relocated from P Street to an interior alley where it would be less obtrusive.

The members questioned the arbitrary shape and placement of the auditorium, but acknowledged that its placement away from the bulk of the school had been done in order to create an entrance to the building. The plan was approved.

2. Benning Elementary School, 41st and East Capitol Street, N.E., revised design. Berla, Abel, and Weinstein, architects.

Having first presented the design of this school in the October 1970 meeting and having it disapproved, the architects resubmitted a building similar in character to the original plan, but with a considerably improved site plan; i.e. the major building elements were all parallel to 41st Street and avoided the deep and awkward cuts into the hillside that resulted from the original design. While the architectural character was mundane and unimaginative, the members felt that there was little chance the design would be improved with further review, and therefore they approved it.

3. Rosedale Recreation Center Swimming Pool Replacement, 17th and Gale Streets, N.E., proposed design. Kent Cooper and Associates, architects.

Placed on the corner of the site so that it would serve both as a public forecourt accessible at all times and as an entrance to the remainder of the fence-enclosed lot, the building housed locker rooms and day care facilities. The architects proposed a roof of standing seam sheet metal and walls of "split face" masonry sheared to have a rough surface. The members felt the facility was well-organized, simple, and straight-forward. The design was approved.

4. Benning Recreation Center and Swimming Pool, 17th and Southern Avenue, S.E., proposed design. Nicolas Satterlee and Associates, architects.

The program for this recreation center was essentially the same as Rosedale, with the addition of a gymnasium. While the members approved the design, they questioned the need for numerous skylights over the craft studios, lounges, and gymnasium. In the gymnasium a clerestory was employed in addition to the skylight. The members pointed out that these clerestory windows would create unnecessary glare, and seemed redundant. They suggested that the skylights be simplified, and questioned the need of the clerestory. A resubmission was requested.

5. Engine Company No. 6 and Rescue Squad No. 1, 4th and N Streets, N.W., revised design. Duane, Duane and Cahill, architects.

This presentation was a revision of the first design presented in the July 1970 meeting. The reaction of the members was mixed, since some preferred the original design over this submission. They recommended that the concrete frames protruding from around the windows be eliminated. Agreeing that further study of the design would bring little improvement, the members waived further review of the project.

b. D.C. Government, Office of Economic Development

1. O.G. 71-47, 1715 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., new building for Japan Inn, Incorporated. Faulkner and Wilkes, architects.

Mr. Thomas Stolman and Mr. Wynant van der Pool represented the Georgetown Advisory Board. In its review of the design for the Japan Inn, the Advisory Board had questioned the appropriateness of the use of ~~the~~ style reminiscent of nineteenth century Japanese architecture. The materials proposed were stucco and dark wood.

While the Commission members acknowledged the possible stylistic comparisons that might be made, they approved the design because they felt the scale and design of the restaurant was appropriate to its site and was a good contemporary solution. Mr. Sasaki, speaking for the

Commission, suggested that large trees be planted across the south side of the building and along Wisconsin Avenue and R Street, screening the parking area from both the restaurant and the street. The members felt that the precedent of such a design would not be detrimental to the integrity of Georgetown, since each new case would be considered on its own merits, and the administration of the law would not be adversely affected.

2. Regulation of color in Georgetown

The members discussed the desirability of the Commission's control over the use of paint on structures in Georgetown. This control could be obtained by a change in the present building permit regulations so that a permit would be required before one painted a structure in Georgetown. The members decided that such a regulation would be most difficult to administer since most of the recent cases in question were in the commercial area where there is a high rate of turnover in ownership. It was also pointed out that painting did not constitute a permanent defacement. For these reasons, they recommended no change in the present code.

3. Acacia Mutual Life Insurance Company, parking garage, 51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W., proposed design. Shreeve, Lamb, and Harmon, architects.

The parking garage would be located on a site north of and immediately adjacent to the insurance company's office building. The proposed garage was faced with limestone similar to that used on the office building.

Mr. Bunshaft stated, and the other members concurred, that this garage should not have the appearance of an office building, but should make obvious by its exterior facade the purpose of the building. The Members suggested that the garage be made lower, by placing several stories underground, for these reasons: a lower garage would obstruct fewer windows in the neighboring office building; it would make fewer cars visible on the surface of the site; and it would create a more pleasing relationship of volumes with the existing office building. They suggested that a simple, free-standing wall might be used to screen the garage from Louisiana Avenue.

4. Appendix 1 - approved. **Exhibit B.**

c. American Battle Monuments Commission

Distinguished Military Actions Commemorative Program,
revised designs.

Two monuments, to be used as prototypes for markers in Europe and the Pacific, were presented for the Commission's consideration. One, to be used in the European theater, was an obelisque; the other, to be used in the Pacific theater, was a rectangular slab. Both were surrounded by large bases and had surfaces suitable for bearing appropriate inscriptions.

The members questioned the validity of two different designs for monuments to be used in the same manner. They also felt that the designs were unnecessarily complicated and suggested that a simpler volume, perhaps a stone cube, be used instead. Exhibit C.

LEGISLATION

H.R. 15587, "To amend the D.C. Redevelopment Act of 1955 by directing and establishing orderly procedures for the modification of an urban renewal plan and requiring adherence thereto by the D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency, by requiring that provision be made in each redevelopment contract for timely construction of public streets, etc."

The secretary stated there were a number of faults, in his opinion, in the legislation; among them, chiefly, the provision that anyone in a renewal area could veto changes to the plan, thus "freezing" it. The chairman agreed, but felt that the bill demanded no immediate action, and the members consented.

INTERVIEWS

D.C. Government, Office of Economic Development
Shipstead - Luce Act

Acacia Mutual Life Insurance Parking Garage, 51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W., proposed design. Shreeve, Lamb, and Harmon, architects.

Mr. Mears represented the life insurance company. Mr. Bunshaft explained the Commission's recommendations to Mr. Mears. He recommended that the elevations facing Louisiana and New Jersey Avenues be treated as simple screen walls, and that the materials be both complementary to the office building as well as appropriate for a garage. He suggested that poured concrete with a limestone aggregate be used.

The meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

Submitted,



Charles H. Atherton, Secretary

addenda: D.C. Government, Office of Economic Development

*S.L. 71-23 2301-2305 Virginia Ave. N.W. Office Building
for Columbia Plaza; James Cosgrove and Ass., architects.*

The Commission noted changes in the design, which had been reviewed previously. Some concern was expressed over the use of concrete, which was much stronger in the new design than in the existing components of the Columbia Plaza development. The new design was approved.

18 January 1971.

Dear Mr. Kunzig:

I have been slow in reacting to your great lighting project of the Federal Triangle, slow merely because I wanted the full Commission to have a look before we discussed it. As I said when we had lunch last fall to discuss the lighting, the Commission is very pleased that you are so actively expanding the lighted areas. I think there are some problems in the project as it stands now. The Commission was inclined to agree with some of the newspaper critics that the over all effect is terribly chilly, i.e. the color is too cold.

And then there is the matter of the space above the cornice line which has been lighted much too strongly. It seems to throw the rest of the lighting completely off balance. I would be happy if you would designate some member of your staff to discuss it with me and members of my staff.

With best wishes and congratulations on the big steps that you have made.

Yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Honorable Robert L. Kunzig
Administrator
General Services Administration
Washington, D.C.

Exhibit A.

January 13, 1970

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON OLD GEORGETOWN ACT APPLICATIONS

NO ADDRESS AND OWNER

PROJECT

OG 71-

22 1643 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.
Elias Namerdy

Lower floor of show window bay and replace door.

ACTION: Recommended provided existing and new framing, in addition to other wood features, remain painted white. 10/26/70.

23 1226 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.
Marriott Corp.

Install recess fixtures on outside of soffit 24" on center.

ACTION: No objection. 11/12/70

24 3015 Que St., N.W.
Joseph Passonneau

Cut one door and one window from basement opening out to driveway in side yard.

ACTION: Recommended. 10/27/70.

25 1039 31st St., N.W.
Yes, Inc.
t

A sign, approx. 4'x6 1/2', black and yellow on plexiglass, back lighted. It will fit into window area replacing the present sign that says Market Playhouse. The Yes! logo is in Japanese brush stroke, the remaining text in Helvetia type about 1 1/2" high.

ACTION: No objection. 11/12/70

26 1665 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.
Hair Inc.

Canopy over entrance made of vinyl coated canvas with galvanized pipe frame.

ACTION: Not recommended. Existing conditions and character of building not suitable for mounting of awning.

28 3406 R St., N.W.
Roger L. Stevens

Build concrete and gravel driveway.

ACTION: Not recommended. Suggest driveway and walls be constructed of brick, providing a more uniform appearance of materials throughout.

29 1510 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.
L. Frank

Brick up rear open porch.

ACTION: Recommended provided that exterior walls be faced with brick. 11/25/70

31 1512 34th St., N.W.
Mrs. Dudley Knox

Mrs. Dudley Knox. New brick steps, rail, gate & light.

ACTION: Recommended. 11/25/70

32 1514 26th St., N.W.
John O. Hedden

Remodel existing licensed 5 unit apartment building.

ACTION: Not recommended. Suggest ground floor windows be uniform in design with a better relationship to the rest of the facade. 11/25/70

33 1007 Thomas Jefferson St., N.W.
Mr. and Mrs. John Barnard

Preliminary review of proposed 3 story office building.

ACTION: Not recommended. Recommend further study of west elevation. 11/25/70

34 3421 R St., N.W.
Mrs. L. Sewell Thompson

Revamp existing bath, add new bath and move existing front entrance and yard work per plan. 11/25/70

ACTION: Recommended. 11/25/70

35 3016 O St., N.W.
Ralph Gerstle

Install three double hung windows overlooking alley.

ACTION: Recommended provided that 2 windows and entrance hallway are of the same character as those on front elevation. 11/25/70

36 1689 34th St., N.W.
Wenzella W. Ripley

Add bullseye dormers (2) in roof of garage addn. previously approved by Georgetown Fine Arts.

ACTION: Not recommended. Prefer simplicity of original design. 11/25/70

37 2928 M St., N.W.
Chichies Inc.

Sign

ACTION: Recommended with suggestion that red stars be eliminated.

38 1553 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.
Restaurant Industries

Sign

ACTION: Not recommended. Type of interior illumination, plastic materials, unsuitable. Also text should be limited to name of business.

39 1211 33rd St., N.W.
Nancy B. Reuter

Remove existing porch. Create steps to existing door in basement and install 2 windows beside basement door.

ACTION: Returned for accurate drawing of proposed work.

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON OLD GEORGETOWN ACT APPLICATIONS (CONT).

40 3327 M St., N.W. Replace existing pump island lighting and yard floodlighting
41 Humble Oil as per attached plan and rendering.
42
43

ACTION: Recommended as revised, omitting decorative lantern and brackets and cutting off pole flush with top of lamp housing. 1/7/71

45 3268 P St., N.W. Transpose existing door and window; remove porch; create off
Leith McLean street parking space; a
ACTION: Returned for additional information including site plan showing relation of driveway to porch and elevation showing revised openings. 1/7/71

48 3050 R St., N.W. Install 2 500 watt quartz fixtures at locations "A" in attached
American Security Corp. photos. Install 2 250-watt quartz fixtures at locations "B" in the attached photos.

ACTION:

49 3414 Prospect St., N.W. Remove and repair front porch
Harry & Mary Goodchild (deceased)

ACTION: No objection to repairing porch provided there are no changes to details of design. 1/7/71

50 1200 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. New windows and doors. New pilasters and superstructure above.
National Bank of Washington Removal of projecting bays on M St. Leave base under projections and turn into planting area. Precast planter at corner of Wisc. and M.

ACTION: Recommend that no change be made to existing entranceway. No objection to other changes such as removal of bays on M St. & new window sash on the 1st thru 3rd flrs. Recommend that plaques listing names of founders etc. be eliminated from outside of building. Request revised drawings. 1/7/71.

51 3015 M St., N.W. 2 faced outside sign 3'x4'.
Lee Dechter

ACTION: No objection. 1/7/71.

January 13, 1971

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON SHIPSTEAD-LUCE ACT APPLICATIONS

NO ADDRESS AND OWNER PROJECT

SL 71-

11 1709 New York Ave., N.W. Office Building
Rekab Inc.

ACTION: Approved. Request submission of material samples for review. 10/22/70

12 1750 New York Ave., N.W. 8 story Office Building
United Unions

ACTION: Approved. 10/22/70. Request submission of material samples for review.

13 603 15th St., N.W.
American Security Corp.

Use of public space for purpose of display and selling of printed publications.

ACTION: Returned without action. 12/10/70.

14 901-947 6th St., S.W.
Southwest #12 Corp.

To construct 432 dwelling units of which 414 units will be elevator served. High rise apts. and 20 units will be single family townhouses.

ACTION: No objection. Recommend roof structures be painted a light neutral color to mask them as much as possible. 12/10/70

15 600 N.Hampshire Ave., N.W.
Watergate Improvements

Temporary sign attached to floor "Planter" overlooking Rock Creek Parkway on the office building facade.

ACTION: Disapproved. Size, type of illumination, location of sign on building, are all inappropriate to this area. A much smaller sign mounted at grade on New Hampshire Ave. is recommended. 11/12/70

16 488 Indiana Ave., N.W.
D.C. Government

Parking of motor vehicles on public space.

ACTION: Disapproved. Recommend elimination of parking in public space and the construction of a 42" high wall or other suitable screen on property line. Space between property line and sidewalk to be sodded. 11/10/70

18 8157 E. Beach Dr., N.W.
Edward C. Neal

Single family dwelling.

ACTION: No objection. 11/12/70.

January 13, 1971

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON SHIPSTEAD-LUCE APPLICATIONS (Cont.)

SL 71-

19 8161 E. Beach Dr., N.W.
Lee Satterfield

Single family dwelling.

ACTION: No objection. 11/12/70

20 8165 E. Beach Dr., N.W.
James W. Johnson

Single family dwelling.

ACTION: No objection. 11/12/70

21 1307-09 E St., N.W.

Channing Phillips for Congress

Installation of a temporary banner type sign (32" high x 32'0" long)

ACTION: No objection as a temporary sign not to exceed Apr. 1, 1971. 11/12/70

22 612 17th St., N.W.
American Automobile Assn.

1 single faced metal sign w/opaque faced plastic letters.

ACTION: Approved provided letters are vertical and metal strip dividing text and emblem is omitted. 12/10/70.

24 25-49 Massachusetts Ave. N.W.

D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency

Parking of motor vehicles.

ACTION: Disapproved. Recommend elimination of parking in public space and construction of 42" high screen wall along property line. Request review of drawings. 12/10/70.

25 1735 New York Ave., N.W.
AIA

Test model for exterior wall and spandrel for new headquarters building of AIA to be built at same location.

ACTION: Approved. 11/30/70.

26 3111 Adams Mill Road, N.W.
Gary Martin

Repair rear wall of garage due to vehicle damage.

ACTION: No objection. 12/10/70

26 February 1971

Dear Colonel Jones:

I am sorry that there has been some mix-up in getting word to you on the Commission's action regarding Mr. Thiry's designs. As you probably know, I spoke to him following the Commission meeting and gave him a rough idea of the Commission's objections.

Briefly, they feel that one design would be simpler than two and that a simple rectangular slab or stele would be the best form. The obelisk is, after all, a bit overused. Practically every small unit in the European campaign has erected something along that order so that a simple rectangle would be much more distinctive. Of course this form lends itself much better to the placement of inscriptions.

Also the Commission would like to suggest a base of lighter design. It seemed unnecessarily heavy.

We hope to be meeting on the 17th of March. If there is anything I can do to expedite review by the Commission please let me know.

Sincerely yours,

Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Colonel William P. Jones
American Battle Monuments Commission
Room 2067
Tempo A Building
Washington, D.C. 20315

Exhibit C.

19/1-01, 2017
Jun 23, 2017