

SecurePoll

Joe Sutherland for the Wikimedia Foundation July 2023



What is SecurePoll?

Uses of SecurePoll

- Board elections
- Other global elections (e.g. MCDC elections)
- Referenda (e.g. UCoC ratification)
- Local elections (e.g. English Wikipedia)





History

- **2004**: <u>First Board election</u> run with the Boardvote extension (undocumented)
- **2008**: Board elections move to Software in the Public Interest servers for added security
- 2009: <u>SecurePoll extension created</u>
- 2013: SecurePoll moves to votewiki
- 2021: "SecurePoll 2.0" launches





votewiki

- Used to host Wikimedia elections both global and local
- Users "jump" to the votewiki to cast their vote
- Lists of eligible voters are inserted into votewiki





	Special page	Search Wikimedia Q
U	Special page	
CIMEDIA	SecurePoll: Create	e poll
	< SecurePoll	
	Poll Title:	
d file		*
al pages	Eor wiki:	
ble version		~
		•
	Primary Language:	
	en - English	~
	Election Start Date:	
	Election End Date:	
	Return-to URL:	
	Poll type:	
	O Approval vote	
	Schulze vote	
	Plurality	
	Range voting (plurality)	
	Range voting (histogram range)	
	Single transferable vote with Dro	oon quota

Encryption: No encryption GPG
Prevent voters from changing their votes
Disable transparency features (e.g. voter list) to protect voter privacy
Admins:
Add more
Request free text comments at the end of the ballot
Shuffle questions on the voting page.
Shuffle options on the voting page.
Questions
Question
Question text:
Delete question
Options
Option text:
Delete option
Add another option
Add another question

Histogram range (AKA "support/oppose")

- Voters select "support", "neutral", or "oppose" for each candidate
- Easy to understand for voters...
- ...but easy to game, since "oppose"s are more powerful than neutrals



Sample histogram range ballot

Histogram range (AKA "support/oppose")

Sample histogram range results output. Note that this is usually refactored to be displayed as "Support / (Support + Oppose)".

	Oppose	Neutral	Support	Average score
Eagle	1	1	3	0.4
Fox	1	1	3	0.4
Dingo	2	1	2	0
Goldfish	3	0	2	-0.2
Aardvark	3	1	1	-0.4
Cheetah	3	1	1	-0.4
Bobcat	5	0	0	-1

Schulze

- Voters rank candidates from most preferred (1) to least preferred
- Voters can rank candidates at the same "level"
- Pairwise matrix determines the winners
- Can be difficult to parse the results

Cand	idates
1	Cheetah
3	Goldfish
2	Eagle
	Fox
2	Bobcat
	Dingo
4	Aardvark

Schulze

Sample Schulze results

1*	Cheetah
1*	Fox
3*	Aardvark
3*	Eagle
5	Dingo
6	Bobcat
7	Goldfish

	С	F	A	Е	D	в	G
Cheetah (C)	0	2	2	3	3	2	2
Fox (F)	2	0	3	3	3	3	3
Aardvark (A)	2	1	0	2	2	3	3
Eagle (E)	2	2	2	0	2	2	3
Dingo (D)	2	0	1	2	0	3	3
Bobcat (B)	1	1	1	1	2	0	1
Goldfish (G)	1	1	1	1	2	0	0

Path strength matrix

	С	F	Α	E	D	В	G
Cheetah (C)		(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(3, 2)	(3, 2)	(3, 2)	(3, 2)
Fox (F)	(0, 0)		(3, 1)	(3, 2)	(3, 0)	(3, 1)	(3, 1)
Aardvark (A)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)		(0, 0)	(2, 1)	(3, 1)	(3, 1)
Eagle (E)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)		(0, 0)	(2, 1)	(3, 1)
Dingo (D)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)		(3, 2)	(3, 2)
Bobcat (B)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)		(1, 0)
Goldfish (G)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	(0, 0)	

Single-transferable vote

- Voters rank candidates from most preferred to least preferred
- Voters cannot rank candidates at the same "level"
- Votes are transferred to lower preferences as candidates are elected or eliminated
- Can be difficult to understand the results

Candidates
Preference 1
Fox
Preference 2
Eagle
Preference 3
Dingo
Preference 4
Select an option
Preference 5
Select an option
Preference 6
Select an option
Preference 7
Select an option
Submit vote

Singletransferable vote

Sample single-transferable vote results output

Round Number	Tally	Result
1	 Mike Peel: 1,176 Michał Buczyński: 1,157 Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,032 Tobechukwu Precious Friday: 988 Kunal Mehta: 896 Farah Jack Mustaklem: 673 	Quota: 1,974.000001
2	 Mike Peel: 1,176 Michał Buczyński: 1,157 Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,032 Tobechukwu Precious Friday: 988 Kunal Mehta: 896 Farah Jack Mustaklem: 673 	Quota: 1,974.000001 Eliminated: Farah Jack Mustaklem
3	 Mike Peel: 1,176 + 137 = 1,313 Michał Buczyński: 1,157 + 102 = 1,259 Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,032 + 104 = 1,136 Tobechukwu Precious Friday: 988 + 144 = 1,132 Kunal Mehta: 896 + 91 = 987 	Quota: 1,942.333334 Eliminated: Kunal Mehta Transferring votes
4	1. Mike Peel: 1,313 + 344 = 1,657 2. Michał Buczyński: 1,259 + 154 = 1,413 3. Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,136 + 167 = 1,303 4. Tobechukwu Precious Friday: 1,132 + 150 = 1,282	Quota: 1,885.000001 Eliminated: Tobechukwu Precious Friday Transferring votes
5	1. Mike Peel: 1,657 + 338 = 1,995 2. Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,303 + 479 = 1,782 3. Michał Buczyński: 1,413 + 238 = 1,651	Quota: 1,809.333334 Elected: Mike Peel Transferring votes
6	 Shani Evenstein Sigalov: 1,782 + 53.047619 = 1,835.047619 Mike Peel: 1,995 - 185.666666 = 1,809.333334 (keep factor: 0.906934) Michał Buczyński: 1,651 + 87.482038 = 1,738.482038 	Quota: 1,794.287665 Elected: Shani Evenstein Sigalov Transferring votes



What is Single Transferable Vote?

Single Transferable Vote

- Allows voters to rank candidates in order of preference
- Aims for proportional representation
- Reduces "wasted" votes for candidates who are not elected
- Useful for multi-winner elections





Mechanics

- Voters rank any number of candidates in order, starting with their number one choice
- The quota for election is set with a formula (<u>Droop quota</u>)
- First-preference votes are counted; any candidate meeting the quota is elected
- Lowest-ranked candidate is eliminated and second-choice preferences are redistributed







Regular Single Transferable Vote example

Joe Sutherland for the Wikimedia Foundation July 2023

Example

- Suppose seven candidates for three seats:
 - Aardvark
 - Bobcat
 - Cheetah
 - Dingo
 - Eagle
 - Fox
 - Goldfish





Votes

• The votes are cast like this:

lst preference	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish
2nd preference	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Dingo		Fox
3rd preference		Dingo	Bobcat	Cheetah	Fox		
Number of ballots	4	7	1	3	1	4	3



Tallying: Regular STV

	Votes for each option									
Step	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish			
Setting the quota		The quota is 6 : total votes / (options to choose + 1) + 1, rounded down = 23 / (3 + 1) + 1, rounded down = 6.75, rounded down = 6								
Step 1	4	7 ELECTED (1 surplus vote)	1	3	1	4	3			



Tallying: Regular STV

			Vot	tes for each option				
Step	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish	
Step 2	4	ELECTED	٦	3	1	4	3	
Step 3	4	ELECTED	2	3 + 1 = 4	eliminated	4	3	
Step 4	4	ELECTED	eliminated	4 + 2 = 6 ELECTED (0 surplus votes)	eliminated	4	3	
Step 5	4	ELECTED	eliminated	ELECTED	eliminated	4 + 2 = 6 ELECTED (0 surplus votes)	eliminated	





Meek (or "Scottish") STV example

Joe Sutherland for the Wikimedia Foundation July 2023

Meek (or "Scottish") STV

- Meek STV introduces a "keep factor" and fractional transfers of surplus votes from elected candidates
- This is performed alogrithmically





Votes

The votes are cast like this:

lst preference	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish
2nd preference	Bobcat	Aardvark	Dingo	Eagle	Dingo	Goldfish	Fox
3rd preference		Dingo	Bobcat	Cheetah	Fox	Bobcat	
Number of ballots	201	198	171	189	182	176	149



The quota is 317:

total votes / (options to choose + 1) + 1, rounded down = 1,266 / (3 + 1) + 1, rounded down = 317.25, rounded down = 317



Nobody meets the quota, so we must first eliminate a candidate as normal.

Votes for each option Step Aardvark Bobcat Cheetah Dingo Goldfish Eagle Fox Step 1 201 198 171 189 182 176 149 Ouota: 317 176 + 149Step 2 eliminated 201 198 171 189 182 = 325 (149)Ouota: 317 ELECTED

Fox meets the quota and is elected.



Votes after Step 2

The ballots currently look like this:

lst preference	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish
2nd preference	Bobcat	Aardvark	Dingo	Eagle	Dingo	Goldfish	Fox
3rd preference		Dingo	Bobcat	Cheetah	Fox	Bobcat	
Number of ballots	201	198	171	189	182	176	149 (exhausted)



Quota change

When ballots become Total votes – Excess votes exhausted, the quota changes according to the formula:

Seats + 1

In our example, **Goldfish** was eliminated, leaving **149 exhausted ballots**:



Therefore, the new quota is 279.25. This is calculated after every step.



Surplus votes

When a candidate is **elected**, surplus votes are transferred using a formula:

Winning quota

Votes for that candidate

This number is different for every elected candidate. It is known as the "keep factor".

In our example, Fox was elected with 325 votes:



Therefore, **Fox** can "keep" ≈ 0.86 of their votes and still be at the winning quota.



So, let's transfer **Fox**'s surplus votes to the next choices on their first-preference ballots.

These are transferred using the formula (1 - keep factor) * total votes.

This can in theory include transfers to other elected candidates, but in this case it does not.

Bobcat 's initial vote total	+	1 - Fox 's keep factor	*	Fox 's total votes	=	<mark>Bobcat</mark> 's new total
198	+	(1 - 0.86)	*	325	=	243.5



	Votes for each option								
Step	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish		
Keep factor	1	1	1	1	1	0.86			
Step 3 Quota: 279.25	201	198 + (1 - 0.86) * 325 = 243.5	171	189	182	= 325 * 0.86 = 279.5	eliminated		



Nobody meets quota, so we eliminate the candidate with the least votes (**Cheetah**) and distribute to their next-preferences.

Dingo meets the quota and is elected.

	Votes for each option								
Step	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish		
Keep factor	1	1	1	1	1	0.86	—		
Step 4 Quota: 279.25	201	243.5	eliminated (171)	= 189 + 171 = 360 ELECTED	182	279.5	eliminated		

Note that the quota remains the same, since these actions do not exhaust any ballots.



Votes after Step 4

The ballots currently look like this:

lst preference	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish
2nd preference	Bobcat	Aardvark	Ðingo	Eagle	Ðingo	Goldfish	Fox
3rd preference		Dingo	Bobcat	Cheetah	Fox	Bobcat	
Number of ballots	201	198	171	189	182	176	149 (exhausted)



We work out a new keep factor for **Dingo** and transfer their votes.

In the next round, we eliminate **Aardvark** and transfer their votes as normal.

Step	Votes for each option									
	Aardvark	Bobcat	Cheetah	Dingo	Eagle	Fox	Goldfish			
Keep factor	1	1	1	0.78	1	0.86	—			
Step 5 Quota: 279.25	201	243.5	eliminated	= 360 * 0.78 = 280.8	= 182 + (1 - 0.78) * 360 = 261.2	279.5	eliminated			
Step 6 Quota: 279.25	eliminated (201)	= 243.5 + 201 = 444.5 ELECTED	eliminated	280.8	261.2	279.5	eliminated			

Bobcat now meets the quota and is elected.



Results as charts

The following slides depict the same information as charts, showing visually where the surplus votes were transferred.















Image credits

- <u>File:Aardvark (Orycteropus afer).jpg</u> by Theo Kruse, CC BY-SA 4.0
- <u>File:Bobcat (Lynx rufus) California.jpg</u> by Marlin Harms, CC BY 2.0
- <u>File:Gepard (Acinonyx jubatus) Tiergarten Schönbrunn.jpg</u> by Alexander Leisser, CC BY-SA 4.0
- <u>File:Female Dingo from close distance.jpg</u> by Majkalala, CC BY-SA 4.0
- File:Kaiseradler Aquila heliaca 2 amk.jpg by AngMoKio, CC BY-SA 2.5
- <u>File:Alaska Red Fox (Vulpes vulpes).jpg</u> by Gregory "Slobirdr" Smith, CC BY-SA 2.0
- <u>File:Fantail Goldfish Carrot.jpg</u> by Ry362, CC BY-SA 3.0

