

F 68

.M43

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS



00001384946





THE TERM
PILGRIM FATHERS

BY
ALBERT MATTHEWS

REPRINTED FROM
THE PUBLICATIONS
OF
The Colonial Society of Massachusetts
VOL. XVII

CAMBRIDGE
JOHN WILSON AND SON
University Press
1915

F68
M43

Gift
Author
(Personal)
APR 8 1915

16-7129

THE TERM
PILGRIM FATHERS
AND
EARLY CELEBRATIONS OF FOREFATHERS' DAY

UNDER the auspices of the Cape Cod Pilgrim Memorial Association, on August 20, 1907, was laid the corner-stone of the monument at Provincetown commemorating the landing there of the Mayflower passengers on November 11-21, 1620. In his address delivered upon that occasion, President Roosevelt said:

The coming hither of the Puritan three centuries ago shaped the destinies of this continent, and therefore profoundly affected the destiny of the whole world. . . . We cannot as a nation be too profoundly grateful for the fact that the Puritan has stamped his influence so deeply on our national life. . . . The splendid qualities which he left to his children, we other Americans who are not of Puritan blood also claim as our heritage. You, sons of the Puritans, and we, who are descended from races whom the Puritans would have deemed alien — we are all Americans to-day. We all feel the same pride in the genesis, in the history of our people; and therefore this shrine of Puritanism is one at

which we all gather to pay homage, no matter from what country our ancestors sprang.¹

In the early part of this address, which later became political, the speaker used the words Puritan and Puritanism frequently, but the terms Pilgrim and Pilgrim Fathers not once; and his hearers listened in vain for a contrast between the Pilgrims of the Plymouth Colony and the Puritans of the Massachusetts Colony. There was considerable dismay in this part of the country — a dismay not allayed when it became known that the President had only just learned of the existence of such a distinction.²

¹ Boston Evening Transcript, August 20, 1907, p. 1/7. An editorial note in the Boston Evening Transcript of August 23, 1907, reads:

The Springfield Republican says: "It is as much popular impression that the Pilgrims were Puritans as that the witches of Salem were burned at the stake." If so, it is a good thing the mistake has been publicly made in high circles. It will tend to dispel a gross popular error (p. 8/2).

This paragraph is so awkwardly expressed as to leave its precise meaning somewhat uncertain, but apparently the "gross popular error" is the belief that the Pilgrim Fathers were Puritans.

The following skit appeared in the New York Sun of September 10, 1907, p. 4/6:

THE REVISED CONSTITUTION.

I, the President of the United States, in order to form a more decent government, provide for the common regulation, promote the welfare of desirable citizens and secure the blessings of My Policies to posterity, do ordain and establish this Constitution for the United States of America: . . .

ARTICLE VI.

Section 1 — The "Pilgrims" shall be called "Puritans" after this date.

² I refer to and quote from the speech as actually delivered and given to the press by Mr. Roosevelt. It appears, however, that the two following remarks were made by the President as an extemporaneous introductory to his oration:

Men and women of Massachusetts: Let me at the outset ask to be excused for one error in my speech of which I was unaware until I read it to a Massachusetts man. I have mixed up the Pilgrim and the Puritan.

Out in a remote region like New York we tend to confound men. I ask your pardon for not having appreciated the difference between them. When, therefore, I speak of the Puritan, I speak in the large generic sense that takes the Pilgrim in (Boston Herald, August 21, 1907, p. 31).

And in the speech as afterwards (1911) printed in E. J. Carpenter's *The Pilgrims and their Monument*, the first sentence quoted in the text was altered so as to read as follows: "The coming hither of the Pilgrims three hundred years

It is perhaps well for us New Englanders, who are too apt to insist that the Mayflower Compact¹ was the beginning of constitutional government in this country, and too prone to forget that a legislative assembly met in Virginia a year before the sailing of the Mayflower, to have our cherished notions challenged or ignored. For, after all, the distinction that we in New England now so sharply draw between the Pilgrims of the Plymouth Colony and the Puritans of the Massachusetts Colony is one of somewhat recent growth, is more or less local, and is still far from being universally recognized.

It is not a little singular that, in spite of the numerous volumes that have been written about the Pilgrims and the Puritans, it has hitherto occurred to no one to investigate the term Pilgrim Fathers. What is the history of this term? What is its origin? Is its application appropriate? What is its precise meaning? Why are the settlers who came before 1692 to what is now the State of Massachusetts differentiated as the Pilgrims of the Plymouth Colony and the Puritans of the Massachusetts Colony? The present paper is an attempt to answer these questions.

HISTORY OF THE TERM

Forefathers' Day was first celebrated at Plymouth in 1769 and in Boston in 1797 or 1798. Accounts in some detail will be given of the celebrations at Plymouth down to 1820 and of the early Boston celebrations. It will perhaps be thought that these accounts are unnecessarily long. Ordinarily, in illustrating the history of a term, it is necessary to quote only the sentence containing the term in

ago, followed in far larger numbers by their sterner kinsmen, the Puritans, shaped the destinies of this continent, and therefore profoundly affected the destiny of the whole world" (pp. 74-75).

¹ The word "compact" was first applied to this document, as I am informed by Mr. George E. Bowman, in 1793 (1 Massachusetts Historical Collections, ii. 6 note). A few earlier terms may be given: "an Association and Agreement," 1622 (Mourt's Relation, in Arber's Story of the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 409); "a combination," 1630, Bradford (History of Plymouth Plantation, ed. Ford, i. 189), and 1636 (Plymouth Colony Records, xi. 6, 74); "a Solemn Contract," 1736 (T. Prince, Chronological History of New-England, i. 73); "the covenant," 1773 (C. Turner, Sermon, 1774, p. 21 note); "a solemn contract," 1793 (C. Robbins, Sermon, 1794, p. 33). The exaggerated language usually applied to the compact apparently originated with John Quincy Adams in 1802 (Oration, 1803, pp. 17-18, 20), before which time little attention was paid to it.

question and enough of the context to show clearly its exact meaning. The present case, however, is an unusual one in that passages which do not contain the term Pilgrim Fathers may yet be of value in showing exactly what those who did employ the term meant by it. There are other reasons, too, which make it desirable to quote in full many of the accounts. The half-century from 1769 to 1820 was a momentous one in our history. The writers about to be quoted witnessed the American Revolution, the adoption of the Federal Constitution, our strained relations with France at the close of the eighteenth century, the transfer of the national government from the Federalists to the Republicans or Democrats, the purchase of Louisiana, the abolition of slavery in some of the States and the prohibition of the importation of slaves into the country, the War of 1812 with England, and "the era of good feelings" which was ushered in by the inauguration of President Monroe.¹ Moreover, it was a period when people took their politics very seriously, when party feeling was extremely bitter, and when antagonists applied to one another epithets that now, fortunately, are seldom encountered in political warfare. In addition, that period saw the introduction of an American episcopate, the spread of Unitarianism, and many departures from the customs and manners of "the fathers." The feelings engendered by these great political, religious, and social changes are reflected in the discourses delivered on Forefathers' Day and even more in the newspaper accounts of the celebrations.

PLYMOUTH CELEBRATIONS

On January 13, 1769, twelve young men, —

having maturely weighed and seriously considered the many disadvantages and inconveniences that arise from intermixing with the company at the taverns in this town of Plymouth, and apprehending that a well regulated club will have a tendency to prevent the same, and to increase not only the pleasure and happiness of the respective members, but also

¹ These historic words headed an editorial note in the *Columbian Centinel* of July 12, 1817, beginning: "During the late Presidential Jubilee many persons have met at festive boards, in pleasant converse, whom party politics had long severed. We recur with pleasure to all the circumstances which attended the demonstrations of good feelings" (p. 2/3).

will conduce to their edification and instruction, do hereby incorporate ourselves into a society by the name of the Old Colony Club.¹

On Wednesday, December 20, 1769, it was —

Voted, That Friday next be kept by this Club in commemoration of the first landing of our worthy ancestors in this place.² That the Club dine together at M^r Howland's,³ and that a number of gentlemen be invited to spend the evening with us at the Old Colony Hall.⁴

Accordingly on December 22⁵ the celebration took place:

¹ 2 Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society, iii. 389. The Records of the Old Colony Club are printed in this volume, pp. 381-444. References in this paper to these Records are to that volume.

² The Mayflower passengers who landed at Provincetown on November 11-21 landed from the Mayflower itself. The popular notion that those who landed at Plymouth on December 11-21 also landed from the Mayflower is a mistake. There were three expeditions — or “discoveries,” as the term then was — from the Mayflower. The first, consisting of Standish and sixteen men, was a land expedition and lasted from November 15-25 to November 17-27. The second, consisting of thirty-four men, was in the shallop, and lasted from November 27-December 7 to November 30-December 10. The third, consisting of seventeen men (of whom John Alden was not one), also in the shallop, started on December 6-16; reached Clark's Island on Friday, December 8-18; landed at Plymouth on Monday, December 11-21; and returned on December 12-22 to the Mayflower, which reached Plymouth on Saturday, December 16-26. (Narrative and Critical History of America, iii. 270-272 and note.) Hence those traditions are without foundation which state that the first person to land on Plymouth Rock was either Mary Chilton or John Alden. The landing from the Mayflower, it may be added, was not completed until about March 21-31, 1621: see Mourt's Relation, ed. Dexter, p. 90.

³ Thomas Southworth Howland.

⁴ Records, p. 400.

⁵ The legal change in England and the American colonies from Old Style to New Style took place in September, 1752, there then being a difference of eleven days. The members of the Old Colony Club, all of whom were young men, were probably not aware of the fact that in the seventeenth century the difference was ten days, not eleven. Hence the error in the date of celebrating Forefathers' Day. In a sermon delivered in Boston December 22, 1820, the Rev. James Sabine said: “The reader must bear in mind, that all the dates and events, in relation to our Fathers, are Old Style, an allowance of eleven days therefore must be made; as, for instance, the Fathers landed the 11th. December, which in New Style, is the 22d” (The Fathers of New England, 1821, p. 31). The error was apparently first pointed out in 1832 by Dr. James Thacher in his History of the Town of Plymouth (pp. 15 note, 25 note). In his Discourse (p. 53) delivered at Plymouth December 22, 1832, the Rev. Convers Francis also called attention to the error,

Old Colony Day.

Friday, December 22. The Old Colony Club, agreeable to a vote passed the 20th instant, met in commemoration of the landing of their worthy ancestors in this place. On the morning of said day, after discharging a cannon, was hoisted upon the Hall an elegant silk flag with the following inscription, "Old Colony 1620." At eleven o'clock A.M. the members of the Club appeared at the Hall, and from thence proceeded to the house of M^r Howland, innholder (which is erected upon the spot where the first licensed House in the Old Colony formerly stood). At half after two a decent repast was served up, which consisted of the following dishes; namely, —

citing Thacher. On December 15, 1849, the Pilgrim Society appointed a committee "to consider the expediency of celebrating in future the Landing of the Pilgrims, on the twentyfirst day of December, instead of the twentysecond;" in 1850 the committee made its Report (see p. 390, below, for full title); and on May 27, 1850, the Pilgrim Society "Voted, That this Society will hereafter regard the twentyfirst day of December, as the true anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrims" (Report, p. 2; New England Historical and Genealogical Register, iv. 350). In a discourse delivered at Dedham December 21, 1851, the Rev. Alvan Lamson (The Memory of John Robinson, 1852, pp. 4-5, 39-40) noted the old error, citing Thacher.

The practice of the Pilgrim Society has been somewhat erratic. In October, 1862, the New England Historical and Genealogical Register remarked: "We believe, however, that the force of habit has proved stronger than the love of truth, and that the Pilgrim Society has rescinded its vote [of May 27, 1850], and again celebrates the 22d of December" (xvi. 347-348). In July, 1871, the same journal said: "The Pilgrim Society have lately again given their sanction to the celebration of the true day, the last anniversary . . . having been commemorated by them on the 21st of December, 1870" (xxv. 302-303 note). But on May 29, 1882, the Pilgrim Society voted: "While we recognize the historical fact that the passengers on the shallop of the Mayflower landed on Plymouth Rock on the 11th of December, 1620, and that the twenty-first of the new style corresponds to the day of landing, yet in view of the fact that the twenty-second has been hallowed by an observance during a period of over one hundred years, and consecrated by the words of Winslow, Webster, Everett, Adams, Seward and many other great orators of our land, it is hereby resolved that hereafter the twenty-second of December be observed by the Pilgrim Society as the anniversary of the landing of the Pilgrims" (Register, xxxvi. 327). This vote led the Register to remark: "This action is surprising. It seems that the anniversary henceforth to be celebrated at Plymouth is not that of the landing of the Pilgrims, but of the orations of their eloquent eulogists." A singular error occurs in the vote of the Pilgrim Society: Seward's oration in 1855 was delivered on December 21st, not the 22d. By 1895, however, the Pilgrim Society had returned to its vote of May 27, 1850, and December 21st is now the anniversary day.

1. A large baked Indian whortleberry pudding.
2. A dish of sauquetash.¹
3. A dish of clams.
4. A dish of oysters and a dish of codfish.
5. A haunch of venison roasted by the first jack brought to the Colony.
6. A dish of sea-fowl.
7. A ditto of frost-fish and eels.
8. An apple pie.
9. A course of cranberry tarts, and cheese made in the Old Colony; dressed in the plainest manner (all appearances of luxury and extravagance being avoided, in imitation of our worthy ancestors whose memory we shall ever respect).

At four o'clock P.M., the members of our Club, headed by the steward carrying a folio volume of the laws of the Old Colony,² hand in hand marched in procession to the Hall. Upon the appearance of the procession in front of the Hall a number of descendants from the first settlers in the Old Colony drew up in a regular file and discharged a volley of small arms, succeeded by three cheers, which were returned by the Club, and the gentlemen generously treated. After this appeared at the Private Grammar School opposite the Hall a number of young gentlemen, pupils of M^r Wadsworth,³ who to express their joy upon this occasion, and their respect for the memory of their ancestors, in the most agreeable manner joined in singing a song⁴ very applicable to the day. At sun setting a cannon was discharged and the flag struck.

In the evening the Hall was illuminated, and the following gentlemen (being previously invited) joined the Club; . . .

¹ Succotash as made at Plymouth is a soup. For the following recipe I am indebted to Miss Catherine E. Russell:

Boil two fowls in a large kettle of water. At the same time boil in another kettle one-half pound of lean pork and two quarts of common white beans, until like soup. When the fowls are boiled, skim off the fat and add a small piece of corned beef, one-half of a turnip sliced and cut small, and five or six potatoes sliced thin. When cooked tender, take out the fowls and keep them in the oven with the pork. The soup of beans and pork should be added to the water the fowls and beef were boiled in. Add salt and pepper. Four quarts of hulled corn having been boiled soft are added to the soup. Before serving, add the meat of one fowl. The second fowl should be served separately, as also the corned beef and pork.

² Folio editions of the Plymouth Colony Laws were printed in 1672 and 1685.

³ Peleg Wadsworth (H. C. 1769) taught a private school in Plymouth.

⁴ This was apparently John Dickinson's famous Liberty Song, written in 1768. "The song was recently discovered among the papers of the late Benjamin M. Watson, Esq. of this town, with a memo. appended, stating it to have been sung at the *first* public celebration of the anniversary, by the O. C. Club, Dec. 22d, 1769" (W. S. Russell, *Airs of the Pilgrims*, appended to his *Guide to Plymouth*, 1846, p. 14).

The President (being seated in a large and venerable chair which was formerly possessed by William Bradford, the second worthy Governor of the Old Colony, and presented to the Club by our friend Dr. Lazarus LeBaron of this town) delivered the following toasts successively to the company; namely, —

1. To the memory of our brave and pious ancestors the first settlers of the Old Colony.
2. To the memory of John Carver and all the other worthy governors of the Old Colony.
3. To the memory of that pious man and faithful historian Mr. Secretary Morton.¹
4. To the memory of that brave man and good officer Cap^t Miles Standish.
5. To the memory of Massasoit, our first and best friend and ally of the natives.
6. To the memory of Mr. Robert Cushman, who preached the first sermon in New England.²
7. The union of the Old Colony and Massachusetts.
8. May every person be possessed with the same noble sentiments against arbitrary power that our worthy ancestors were endowed with.
9. May every enemy of civil or religious liberty meet the same or a worse fate than Archbishop Laud.
10. May the Colonies be speedily delivered from all the burdens and oppressions they now labor under.
11. A speedy and lasting union between Great Britain and her Colonies.
12. Unanimity, prosperity, and happiness to the Colonies.

After spending the evening in an agreeable manner in recapitulating and conversing upon the many and various adventures of our forefathers in the first settlement of this country and the growth and increase of the same, at eleven o'clock in the evening a cannon was again fired, three cheers given, and the Club and company withdrew.³

On December 19, 1770, it was —

¹ Nathaniel Morton came in the Anne in 1623.

² Robert Cushman arrived in the Fortune in November, 1621, and, though a layman, preached a sermon on December 9–19 following which was printed in London in 1622. The statement that this was "the first sermon preached in New England," though often made, is a mistake. On Sunday, August 9, and again on August 19, 1607, the Rev. Richard Seymour preached sermons at St. George's Island, Maine, to the Popham colony. (Collections Maine Historical Society, 1853, iii. 298, 301.) In 1820 the Rev. J. Sabine expressed the opinion that the 1620 sermon was written by Brewster, not Cushman (*The Fathers of New England*, 1821, pp. 10–11, 31).

³ Records, pp. 400–405. This account, substantially as given in the text, was printed in the Boston Gazette of January 22, 1770, p. 2/1; and in the Boston News Letter of January 25, 1770, p. 1/1.

agreed upon and resolved that the twenty-second day of December, being the day of the first landing of our pious forefathers in this town, and which has been kept as a solemn festival in commemoration of the heroic transaction, falling in this year upon Saturday,¹ being an unsuitable time for that purpose, it was therefore resolved that Monday the 24th of this instant be set apart and religiously kept for that purpose.

On December 24 the members met at ten at Mr. Howland's house, where they were joined by others; at twelve, "after having amused themselves in conversation upon the history of emigrate colonies and the constitution and declension of empires, ancient and modern, they were served with an entertainment foreign from all kinds of luxury, and consisting of fish, flesh, and vegetables, the natural produce of this Colony; after which, the company being increased . . . a number of toasts were drank grateful to the remembrances of our ancestors, and loyal to those kings under whose indulgent care this Colony has flourished and been protected."

On this occasion two or three new features were introduced, among them an oration — or, as the records of the Club say, "words . . . spoken with modesty and firmness" — by Edward Winslow, Jr., and a poem by Alexander Scammell.²

In 1771 December 22 fell on Sunday, and so —

Monday the 23d of December . . . was celebrated as a day of festivity in commemoration of that important event, *The landing of our forefathers in this place*. . . . At noon the Club, being joined by a number of the most respectable gentlemen in town, met in a spacious room at the house of M^r Wetherell, innholder, when they partook of a plain and elegant entertainment, and spent the afternoon in cheerful and social conversation upon a variety of subjects peculiarly adapted to the time. At sunset . . . the members of the Club, with the gentlemen of the town, repaired to the Hall, where the aforesaid subjects were re-

¹ This was the only year between 1769 and 1780 that the 22d fell on a Saturday. In 1798 it again fell on a Saturday, and that day the celebration took place in Plymouth. In 1804 it once more fell on a Saturday, but in that year the celebration occurred on the 21st — presumably because the 22d was Saturday. I am informed that as late as about 1840 Saturday evening was regarded at Plymouth as part of the Sabbath. In 1804 the Boston celebration was held on Saturday, and gave rise to criticism: cf. p. 345, below.

² Records, pp. 413, 414–415, 416. Edward Winslow, Jr., was in the Harvard class of 1765, and Alexander Scammell in that of 1769.

assumed, and several important matters relative to the conduct of our ancestors were discussed with freedom and candor, and a number of pleasing anecdotes of our progenitors were recollected and communicated by some of the aged men who favored us with their company. An uncommon harmony and pleasantry prevailed throughout the day and evening, every person present exerting himself to increase the general joy. The Old Colony song¹ with a number of others was sung, after which the company withdrew.

On the same day the Rev. Chandler Robbins addressed a letter to the Club in which he said:

I'm told it was expected by some that as the anniversary of our forefathers' arrival in this place fell out on the Sabbath past, I would have taken some public notice of it in the pulpit. I must acknowledge I think there would have been a great propriety in it, and I am sorry it was entirely out of my mind that *that* was the day till I was reminded of it to-day; otherwise I should certainly have taken notice of it, and attempted to say something suitable to the occasion. However, 't is past now; but I would on this occasion, if it would not be esteemed assuming in me, humbly propose to the gentlemen of your Society whether it would not be agreeable, and serve for the entertainment and instruction of the rising generation more especially, for the future on these anniversaries to have a sermon in public some part of the day peculiarly adapted to the occasion, wherein should be represented the motives that induced them to undertake such an enterprise, the amazing dangers and difficulties they conflicted with and overcame, the piety and ardor with which

¹ Exactly what "the Old Colony song" was I have been unable to ascertain. Possibly it was "Our FOREFATHER'S SONG. *Composed about the year 1630,*" which was first printed, so far as I am aware, in the Massachusetts Magazine for January, 1791, iii. 52-53, where a note says: "*The above, was taken memoriter, from the lips of an old Lady, at the advanced age of 92.*" The first two lines read:

THE place where we live is a wilderness wood,
Where grass is much wanting that's fruitful and good.

It was again printed in 1838 in 3 Massachusetts Historical Collections, vii. 29-30, where a note says: "Composed about 1630, author unknown; *taken memoriter, in 1785, from the lips of an old Lady, at the advanced period of 96.*" It was also printed in 1846 by W. S. Russell in his *Airs of the Pilgrims*, pp. 1-3, where likewise appears a letter dated December 15, 1817, in which Dr. Benjamin Waterhouse says: "Who the author was I know not; nor do I *when* it was written; neither have I been informed who the old lady was who repeated these verses in 1767, when 94 years of age."

they persevered through numberless discouragements and opposition, the time, manner, and other circumstances of their first arrival, with all the train of surprising events that ensued, the appearances of the Divine Providence and Goodness for them, the noble and godlike virtues with which they were inspired, so worthy the imitation of their posterity, etc., etc., with many other things that would naturally fall in upon a discourse of this kind. . . . I do *but* propose the thing, gentlemen, for your consideration this evening, and if it should prove agreeable I would beg leave to suggest one thing further; namely, that the minister to preach the sermon be chosen by your Society somewhere *within the Old Colony*, . . .

In their reply, dated December 31, 1771, and approved by the Club January 7, 1772, the committee to whom this letter was referred said in part:

We have impatiently waited for a proposal of this kind to be made to some gentleman of the clergy by persons whose ages and situations and life have given them greater influence than ourselves; but as it has been hitherto omitted, we would modestly request (as you are the pastor of the first church that was gathered in the Old Colony, have the greatest advantages and opportunities for collecting all the *historical facts* and other materials that may be necessary for this work, and in every other respect are peculiarly qualified therefor) that you would upon the ensuing anniversary prepare and deliver a discourse "suitable to the time."

Accordingly, on December 22, 1772, "(to show our gratitude to the Creator and Preserver of our ancestors and ourselves, and as a mark of respect justly due to the memories of those heroic Christians who, on the 22d of December, 1620, landed on this spot) the members of this Club joined a numerous and respectable assembly in the meeting-house of the First Parish in Plymouth, and after an hymn of praise and prayer to God, the Reverend M^r Chandler Robbins delivered an historic and pathetic discourse." His sermon "closed with an address to the audience which did honor to humanity and himself;" the "New England Hymn, composed by Doct^r Byles,¹ sung with uncommon melody, finished the exercise;" then "the members of the Club, together with the reverend gentlemen of the clergy and others the most respectable of the congregation,

¹ See Rev. A. W. H. Eaton's *Famous Mather Byles* (1914), p. 110.

repaired to the house of M^r Howland, where a table was spread and abundantly furnished with the various productions of this *now fruitful* country, at which the Hon^{ble} General John Winslow presided;” and “after partaking of these bounties, and spending a few hours in the most social conversation upon the history of our country, the adventures of our ancestors, etc. (subjects at this time peculiarly pleasing), the company proceeded to Old Colony Hall, where the same sociability and harmony prevailed throughout the evening.”¹

This celebration was thus noticed in the Boston Gazette of December 28, 1772:

Tuesday the 22d of this instant December, was observed in the ancient Town of Plymouth, as a Day of public Festivity, in Commemoration of the important Event, the Landing of their Forefathers in that Place. In the Morning the Rev'd. Mr. Robbins (having been previously requested) delivered to a numerous and respectable Congregation, (consisting of a Number of the Reverend Gentlemen of the Clergy and others, Inhabitants of Plymouth and the Towns in the Vicinity,) a Discourse adapted to the Occasion, from those remarkable Words of the Psalmist,² . . . — The profound Silence and solemn Attention which was observable thro'out this vast Concourse of People, sufficiently demonstrated their Approbation of the Sentiments of the Speaker. — A plain and elegant Entertainment was prepared at a public House, at which the Gentlemen of the Clergy, and a large Number of others, the most respectable of the Congregation, were present. The Afternoon passed in recapitulating and recollecting a Variety of curious Anecdotes of our venerable Predecessors, Subjects at this Time peculiarly pleasing. — The Evening was spent at OLD COLONY-HALL, in the most social Manner. — Joy, Gratitude and Pleasure were apparent in the Countenances of every Person, through the whole of this agreeable Day and Evening (p. 2/2).³

On January 6, 1772, the Rev. Charles Turner was invited by the Club to preach the next anniversary sermon; but the “uncommon harmony and pleasantry” that prevailed in 1771 had, owing to the

¹ Records, pp. 421-422, 424, 434-435.

² Here follows Psalms, lxxviii. 5-7.

³ The same notice also appeared in the Boston News Letter of January 7, 1773, Supplement, p. 1/2.

growing political turmoil, disappeared before the anniversary day was reached, and the records of the Old Colony Club itself, most of whose members were Loyalists, came to an abrupt end with an entry dated December 15, 1773.¹ It is certain, however, that Mr. Turner's sermon was duly preached; and probably it was delivered before the Club, the town, and the First Parish.²

The celebration in 1774 was thus noticed in a Boston newspaper:

Messieurs EDES & GILL,

THE 22d of December was celebrated at Plymouth, in commemoration of the first landing of our ANCESTORS in New-England: — A learned and ingenious Discourse was delivered on the Occasion, by the Rev. Mr. GAD HITCHCOCK, of Pembroke, from Genesis 1, 31; and Psalms 119, 134; which, for the honor of the dissenting Clergy, and for the benefit of mankind, will speedily be published. A splendid entertainment was provided at Mr. Howland's, and propriety and decorum marked the conduct of the day. We the Posterity of those illustrious Heroes are now suffering under the galling pressure of that power, an emancipation from which, was one grand object they had in view, in the settlement of this Western World; in the prosecution of which divine enterprize, they, with christian magnanimity, surmounted the most discouraging obstacles; and it may safely be affirmed, that all the potent thunders of Britain, cannot reduce us to more tremendous sufferings, than those distinguished patrons of religion and freedom, animated by a sacred ardour, patiently endured. But, wonderful as it may seem, a pitiful number, who bear the names, and descended from the loins of these ever to-be-revered Patriots, by their infernal intrigues, and persevering obstinacy, have involved their native Country, enriched with the Blood of their Fathers, in accumulated Calamities and Distresses; but (by the gracious munificence of Heaven) many rays of light breaks through the gloom which surrounds us; and, Nil desperandum, Deo duce, et auspice Deo.³

From 1774 to 1780, both included, Forefathers' Day was celebrated by the town of Plymouth. For the next twelve years —

¹ Records, p. 444.

² The dedication reads: "To the ancient and respectable town of PLYMOUTH, To all the descendants from the first PLANTERS of the OLD PLYMOUTH COLONY, and To his native Country, The following SERMON is inscribed By their assured Friend, and very humble Servant, C. TURNER."

³ Boston Gazette, January 2, 1775, p. 2/3.

from 1781 to 1792, both included — there was no celebration. In 1793 the day was again celebrated, when a sermon was preached by the Rev. Chandler Robbins.¹ Of the celebration in 1794, we have the following account:

FEAST OF GRATITUDE.

PLYMOUTH, *december 23, 1794.*

YESTERDAY, being the anniversary of the landing of our ancestors at this place, which was the first lasting settlement, made in New-England, a number of gentlemen of this and the neighboring towns convened to celebrate the day. With social glee and harmony, they partook of a frugal meal, which was designed to bring to remembrance the circumstances of those good and great men, whose memories they were assembled to revere. Various anecdotes, respecting their emigration and settlement, were related by those, acquainted with the early history of the country; and the mind was led to recollect, with veneration and sublime pleasure, the daring enterprise, the noble zeal, and the determined valor, of that illustrious band, who, in this place, laid the foundation of empire; and who prepared, in this western clime, an asylum for the persecuted and oppressed of the old world. — Several toasts were given, pertinent and sentimental; and the following ode, written for the occasion, was sung and repeated, with the most sensible satisfaction and pleasure.²

Then follows the ode written by Judge John Davis.³ If the day was celebrated in 1795 and 1796, no accounts have been found; but the celebration in 1797 was thus described:

¹ The only celebrations previous to 1797 of which I have found accounts in the newspapers are those of 1769, 1772, 1775, and 1794.

² Federal Orrery, December 25, 1794, p. 2/2.

³ Much confusion exists in regard to this ode, which is variously said to have been written in 1792, 1793, 1794, or 1799. The statement in the text would seem to be decisive in favor of 1794. It was printed not only in the Federal Orrery of December 25, but also in the Columbian Centinel of December 27, 1794 (p. 4/1), and very likely in other newspapers. It was also printed in the New England Palladium of December 25, 1801 (p. 1/2), under the heading "Native Poetry" and with this introductory note: "The following chaste and elegant production we believe has never been published. It deserves to be handed down with the memory of the interesting occasion which gave it birth." The "interesting occasion" is said to have been "*the celebration of the Festival of the Sons of the PILGRIMS, at Plymouth, 1793;*" but Judge Davis's name is not attached to

MR. RUSSELL,

Plymouth, Dec. 23, 1797.

I AM aware it will be a political apostacy with some people to trace up a descent from the wicked island of Great-Britain. But from no country wicked as it is, had I rather be descended than from that. The

the ode. Neither Pilgrim nor Pilgrim Fathers occurs in the ode, which consists of eight stanzas, the first and sixth as follows (as printed in the Federal Orrery):

AN ODE,

*for the 22d of december, the anniversary of our
ancestors' landing at Plymouth, 1620; —*

BY

JOHN DAVIS, ESQUIRE:

SUNG BY

CAPTAIN J. THOMAS.

SONS of renowned sires,
Join in harmonious choirs,
Swell your loud songs: —
Daughters of peerless dames,
Come with your soft acclaims;
Let their revered names
Dwell on your tongues!

Columbia, child of heaven —
The best of blessings, given,
Rest on thy head:
Beneath thy peaceful skies,
While prosperous tides arise,
Here turn thy grateful eyes —
Revere the DEAD!

In every version of the ode I have seen from 1794 down to 1835, when it was included in the second edition of Thacher's *History of the Town of Plymouth* (pp. 342-343), the sixth stanza reads as printed above. But in *Airs of the Pilgrims*, appended to W. S. Russell's *Guide to Plymouth*, 1846, pp. 20-22, the sixth stanza reads as follows:

Columbia, child of heaven,
The best of blessings given,
Be thine to greet;
Hailing this votive day,
Looking with fond survey,
Upon the weary way,
Of Pilgrim feet.

Russell adds the following —

NOTE. This copy has received the revisal of the venerable author of the composition, and is entirely conformable to the original, excepting in

manners, the religion, and the future policy of a country are influenced for ages by the manner, the religion, and the sciences of the country of the first settlers. To the country of our *forefathers*, long illustrious for their treatment there, as well as the virtue and sufferings in this, are we indebted, with our own improvements, for the most of our civil enjoyments. Accordingly it has been a custom to commemorate their landing in this town, on the 22d Dec. 1620, by some public testimony of a grateful recollection. This year it was likely to pass over in silence *by the gentlemen* — sensible of this advantage, the *young Ladies* took up the neglected outcast like the daughter of PHAROAH, and *nourished it for their own*. In the evening they gave the Gentlemen an elegant Ball; and the taste and decorations of the entertainment, were equalled only by the splendor of the usual constellation of beauty in the hall. In the midst of festivity our pleasures were by no means destitute of sentiment. A beautiful Ode, composed sometime since by J. DAVIS, furnished an agreeable interlude, in which the fanciful antiquarian might think himself conversant with his “rude forefathers.” Indeed, the whole went on with the regular confusion that gives fluidity to mirth, and dancing and careless conversation, and charming good humour gave way only to a spirited song composed by B. SEYMOUR, which finished the evening.

A. B.¹

the fifth [error for sixth] verse, in which a variation has been introduced by him (p. 22).

It thus appears that the word Pilgrim was introduced into the ode at some time between 1835 and 1846. In 1871 the late William T. Davis prepared for the press the “Proceedings of the Celebration by the Pilgrim Society at Plymouth, December 21, 1870.” In this volume (pp. 17–18) Judge Davis’s ode is printed, as it appears in Russell’s *Airs of the Pilgrims* (1846). At p. 198 Mr. Davis says: “The ode of Hon. JOHN DAVIS is here printed as revised and corrected by its author about fifty years after it was written;” and then proceeds to give the sixth stanza as originally written. This statement, made by Mr. Davis himself in 1871, had, not unnaturally, completely gone from his mind by 1906, in which year he published his *Plymouth Memories of an Octogenarian*, for in this work he said (p. 28): “The word Pilgrim, as applied to the Plymouth settlers, was never used, as far as I can learn, for more than a hundred and seventy years after the landing. They were called ‘first-comers’ or ‘forefathers’ until 1794, when Judge John Davis, in his ode written for the anniversary celebration in that year first used the word ‘Pilgrim’ in the following verse.” Mr. Davis then quotes the *revised* version of the sixth stanza of the ode.

Judge John Davis graduated from Harvard College in 1781.

¹ *Columbian Centinel*, December 27, 1797, p. 2/4.

Of the celebration in 1798, the following account has been preserved:

Celebration of our *Forefathers*.

Plymouth, Dec. 25.

THE 22d inst. being the anniversary of our forefathers landing in this place, was celebrated with every demonstration of decent conviviality and filial respect. This was not confined to a few individuals, but excited a general joy, that pervaded the bosoms of hoary age and prattling childhood. A discharge of cannon announced the dawn, and the vessels in the harbour, among others the Governor CARVER and MILES STANDISH, displayed their colours, in honor of those venerable worthies, whose names they bear.

At 11 o'clock, the inhabitants of the town, accompanied by several respectable gentlemen from the vicinity, assembled in the *meeting-house*, where the Rev. Dr. ROBBINS, in a reverential and impressive manner, peculiar to himself, offered a solemn tribute of thanks to the Supreme Ruler of the Universe, for his divine and providential patronage, extended to the small though illustrious band of heroes, who at this inclement season began *here*, and by their indefatigable perseverance, effected a settlement, which, considered in all its circumstances, has scarcely a parallel in the annals of mankind. Doct. ZACHEUS BARTLETT, in an oration, replete with good sense and a knowledge of antient history, traced the general principles of emigration, feelingly pointed out the striking events which distinguished the enterprise of our ancestors, and introduced and enforced many excellent political observations.

A hymn adapted to the occasion, and the *appropriate Ode* of "*Sons of renowned Sires*," composed for a former celebration, closed the exercises. In the afternoon a large company partook of a dinner, provided by Mr. WETHRELL, in which were to be found all the varieties, that our *bays, shores* and *woods* afford, and the pleasures of the social board, decorated with a piece of the *consecrated rock*, were heightened by commemorating the eventful scenes, of which our mother town has been the theatre. The favorite songs of "*Adams and Liberty*," "*Hail Columbia*,"¹ and the aforementioned Ode were sung with great animation and applause, and among others the following toasts were drank.

¹ Of these two "favorite songs," one was famous in its day and the other remains so. The following advertisement appeared in Claypoole's American Daily Advertiser (Philadelphia) of April 25, 1798:

New Theatre. MR. FOX'S NIGHT. This Evening, April 25, BY DESIRE. Will be presented, . . . The Italian Monk. . . . After which, an intire new

T H E D A Y.

Our Forefathers. May the blessings purchased by their perseverance, sufferings and toils, enkindle a flame of gratitude in the bosoms of their descendants, that shall be extinguished only by the last beat of their hearts.

The antient town of *Plymouth*. May every view of the *consecrated rock*, excite in its inhabitants, an emulation of the enterprize and industry of the first settlers.

The venerable Sachem MASSASOIT, whose unshaken adherence to treaties, forms a dignified contrast, to the "punic faith" of modern Frenchmen.

song, (written by a Citizen of Philadelphia) to the tune of the "*President's March*." Will be sung by Mr. Fox; accompanied by the full band, and a grand chorus (p. 3/1).

In the same paper of April 27 we read:

NEW THEATRE. MRS. FRANCIS'S Night. THIS EVENING, April 27, Will be presented a new Comedy, . . . called TIT FOR TAT. . . . In the course of the Comedy Mr. Fox will, for the second time and by particular desire, sing a new SONG (written by a Citizen of Philadelphia) to the tune of the *PRESIDENT'S MARCH* (p. 3/3).

Under the title of "SONG," the words were printed in the same paper of Saturday, April 28 (p. 1/2), and in the same issue it was stated that "On Monday afternoon will be published *At Carr's Musical Repository*, The very favourite New Federal Song As sung by Mr. Fox at the New Theatre, written by J. Hopkinson, Esq — adapted for the voice, piano forte, flute, violin, guitarr and clarinet, and ornamented with a very elegant *Portrait of the President* Price 25 cents" (p. 2/2). Under the title of "NEW SONG," Hail Columbia was printed in the *Columbian Centinel* of May 2, preceded by this note: "*The following has been sung on the boards of Philadelphia. Every man of the least musical talents, ought to learn it, and sing it to his fellow citizens*" (p. 3/1).

The following advertisement appeared in the *Columbian Centinel* of Wednesday, May 30, 1798:

Adams and Liberty. ON FRIDAY Morning will be published from the press of THOMAS and ANDREWS, and sold at all the Book-stores, The BOSTON PATRIOTIC SONG, Called, ADAMS & LIBERTY. Written by THOMAS PAINE, A. M. To be sung at the Anniversary Meeting of the *Massachusetts Charitable Fire Society*, on that day (p. 3/2).

The same paper of June 2 stated:

CHARITABLE FIRE SOCIETY. Yesterday, at the Anniversary of the *Charitable Fire Society*, an excellent and well adapted Oration was delivered by Judge TUDOR, to the most numerous and brilliant Assembly we have seen on any similar occasion. The Boston patriotic song of "ADAMS and LIBERTY," written by Mr. PAINE, was sung and re-echoed amidst the loudest reiterated plaudits. Dr. FAY did great justice to its merits (p. 2/4).

In the same paper of June 2 (p. 3/2) Mr. Barrett announced that he would sing the song at his benefit on June 4, and it was printed in the same paper of June 9 (p. 1/3). Dr. Nahum Fay (H. C. 1790) and Giles Leonard Barrett are the persons alluded to.

Success to the Fisheries, and unfading laurels to the able negotiators, who secured to the *United States* this incalculable source of wealth, and nursery of seamen.

Governor SUMNER. May his Administration be as wise and pure, and his memory as lasting and precious, as the first Governor of the Old Colony.

The memory of Dr. JEREMY BELKNAP. May some future Biographer, render that justice to his exalted merit, which his masterly historic pages, have done to our illustrious ancestors.

Congress. May it be purged from the unblushing perfidy of *Mason*,¹ and the polluted saliva of *Lyon*.²

The warm political feelings of the time were hinted at by the Plymothean who wrote the account of the 1797 celebration. The main exercises of the day were always conducted with dignity at Plymouth, but the informal entertainments which followed afforded opportunities for the display of partizanship which were not neglected; and the toasts offered in 1798 drew from a Boston newspaper the following criticism:

THE CELEBRATION OF OUR FOREFATHERS AT PLYMOUTH

By their truly pious and worthy Minister and others of the *primitive* stamp as to Religion and Politics (as given in Saturday's Centinel) does real honor to the memory of their departed worthies. The doings of some Federalists of the *modern* stamp after Dinner, is a melancholy discovery that in Plymouth as well as Boston, there are too many of their Posterity who dishonor them by their sentiments and practises, and are melancholy evidences that they are indeed the DEGENERATE *Plants of a NOBLE VINE*.³

The Rev. Chandler Robbins died in 1799 and was succeeded by the Rev. James Kendall, who was ordained on January 1, 1800. Hence in 1799 "The day was so near that appointed for the ordination of the Rev. Mr. KENDALL, that it was not celebrated by a public

¹ Stevens Thomson Mason, United States Senator from Virginia; Matthew Lyon, Member of Congress from Vermont. The following toast was offered at the celebration of Washington's birthday at Concert Hall: "May the Lion of the Green Mountains be considered by every good citizen as the meanest reptile in creation:— the pismire of America" (Columbian Centinel, February 24, 1798, p. 2/4).

² Columbian Centinel, January 5, 1799, p. 1/3.

³ Independent Chronicle, January 7, 1799, p. 3/2.

discourse;”¹ nor, apparently, by a private meeting. Of the celebration in 1800, we read:

FEAST
OF THE “SONS OF THE PILGRIMS” AT
PLYMOUTH.

Plymouth, Dec. 24, 1800.

THE anniversary of the first landing of our Fore-fathers in this town, which forms a distinguished era in the history of our country, was celebrated on the 22d instant, in a manner worthy the interesting occasion. . . .

When assembled in the sanctuary, the Rev. Mr. KENDALL, introduced the exercises, with an appropriate prayer, . . . After singing an ode, composed for the celebration, by a gentleman of the town, who has taken deep draughts at the “castalian fount;” JOHN DAVIS Esq. delivered a discourse, in which with his accustomed ability and delicacy, he traced the heaven born Pilgrims,² through the immense toils, hardships and perils, they were compelled to conflict with, from debilitating scarcity, and pestilential disease, from the rage of the elements, and the desolating sword of the wilderness, from the first impression of their feet, on the shores of this new world, until their settlement assumed the face of security, and in a natural as well as moral sense, “the wilderness blossomed as the rose.” In fact, this discourse, will be a valuable acquisition as a picturesque and correct historical epitome, of one of the most stupendous enterprizes, recorded in the annals of time, and effected by a set of *worthies*, who exhibited a hardihood of character, and a dignified christian philanthropy, unknown in the systems, or to the feelings, of *infidel* philosophers.

The services concluding, with another ode, sung on former similar occasions; a very large number of the inhabitants of *Plymouth*, with strangers of the first distinction, both of the clergy and laity, met at Mr. *Wetherell's* and were richly regaled, from a table plentifully furnished, . . .

¹ T. M. Harris's Discourse (1808), p. 32.

² This word appeared for the first time at Plymouth in the oration delivered that day by Judge Davis, who said: “Driven by storms, or deceived by their ship master, instead of their place of destination, this spot is selected for settlement, and this day completes one hundred and eighty years, since your soil was first impressed by the weary feet of those illustrious pilgrims” (in J. Morse and E. Parish, *Compendious History of New England*, 1804, p. 375).

After this congenial entertainment, the following toasts were drank by the company with great cordiality. . . .

The memory of the governors *Carver*, *Winslow*, *Prince* and *Bradford*. In whom were eminently combined, the suavity of a *Sumner*, the intelligence of a *Bowdoin*, the fortitude of a *Trumbull*, and the energy of a *Gilman*.¹ . . .

The memory of the intrepid Captain MILES STANDISH, who, by his active vigilance, in shielding the illustrious Pilgrims, from the remorseless tomahawk, merited, like *Lincoln*² the appellation of the *christian hero*. . . .

The Boston pilgrim society.³ Descended from the same renowned origin, may no other emulation be known, than a solicitude of superior excellence.

Toasts were also drunk to John Adams, Governor Strong, Massasoit, Uncas, the memory of Dr. Belknap; and "A splendid ball in the evening, in which the ladies, brightened by their charms, the scene of hilarity, closed the celebration; and perfect decency and rational enjoyment were the order of the day."⁴

In 1801 an interesting piece of pageantry⁵ was performed:

¹ Increase Sumner, Governor of Massachusetts; James Bowdoin, Governor of Massachusetts; Jonathan Trumbull (H. C. 1759), Governor of Connecticut; John Taylor Gilman, Governor of New Hampshire.

² Presumably the reference is to Gen. Benjamin Lincoln.

³ Though called the "Boston pilgrim society," I do not understand that those who celebrated Forefathers' Day in Boston had a regular organization.

⁴ *Columbian Centinel*, December 31, 1800, p. 1.

⁵ In a book just published Ralph Davol says:

A procession through the streets of floats, on which historic occasions are rigidly impersonated by "live people trying to look like dead ones," is commonly called a pageant in America, for example at Philadelphia, or the Hudson-Fulton celebration. . . . Research as to the beginning of modern American Pageants indicates that the spirit was manifest as early as 1627 at the Merry Mount revels. The Meschianza given by British soldiers at Philadelphia in the Revolution was an old English pageant. The first use of the name "pageant" the writer has been able to find applied to a community festival in America was at Marietta, Ohio, (1888). This was before modern pageants became the rage in England (*Handbook of American Pageantry*, 1914, pp. 27, 31).

Mr. Davol does not say when the procession of floats at Philadelphia took place, but perhaps he refers to the one that occurred there on July 4, 1788, of which a description, beginning as follows, will be found in the *Columbian Magazine* for July, 1788:

ON Friday the fourth day of July, 1788, the citizens of Philadelphia, in commemoration of the great event of AMERICAN INDEPENDENCE, and in honour of the ratification of the FEDERAL CONSTITUTION by TEN of the UNITED STATES, presented the most brilliant and interesting spectacle that ever occurred in the annals of the new world, and which has scarcely been surpassed by

Plymouth, Dec. 25.

The anniversary of the landing of our ancestors, at *Plymouth*, was celebrated here on the 22d inst. with filial piety, and affectionate regard. The usual procession was formed, headed by the public officers, and consisting of the inhabitants of all ages, with many gentlemen of distinction from the vicinity, preceded by Capt. TURNER'S independent company, in complete uniform; and making a circuit round the town, escorted the officiating clergyman, accompanied by several of his respectable brethren, to the meeting-house of the Rev. Mr. KENDALL. After a solemn address to Heaven, and singing an appropriate ode, the Rev. Mr. ALLYNE, of *Duxborough*, in a well chosen discourse, delighted a crowded audience, by portraying with great energy of illustration, the exalted character of the Pilgrims, . . . The solemnities of public worship being ended, the gentlemen were sumptuously regaled with all the varieties of fish and wild meat the climate affords at this season, at *Old Colony*, and *Freedom Halls*; no one room being spacious enough to accommodate the whole company. After dinner, the following toasts were drank at *Old Colony Hall*: . . .

the splendor of the ancient or modern triumphs of Asia or of Europe (ii. 391-400).

Fifty-eight trades and professions were represented, and "The number of persons in the procession has been calculated (but we think too low) at 5000, and it is likewise said that there were about 17,000 on *Union Green*" (ii. 400). This, however, was not the earliest procession of the sort. The Federal Constitution was ratified by the Massachusetts Convention on February 6, 1788, and on February 8th a huge procession of trades took place in Boston. This, declared the Massachusetts Centinel of February 9th, was "an exhibition, to which America has never witnessed an equal; and which has exceeded any thing of the kind, Europe can boast of" (viii. 169. See also the issue of February 13th, viii. 174). "The Processions in our Capitals," said the Massachusetts Spy of August 7, 1788, "have hitherto been novelties in this country. That at Boston, on account of the State's adopting the Federal Constitution, was the first — since which almost every capital town in the United States, among other demonstrations of joy for the Federal Constitution, have produced a Procession" (p. 1/4).

The word "pageant," which Mr. Davol has not found in this country earlier than 1888, was employed in a somewhat unexpected quarter in 1852, when Lieutenant John W. Gunnison described under that name the dedication by the Mormons of their temple at Nauvoo just before being driven from that place in 1846, and "the presentation" at Salt Lake City, a few years later, "to the governor of Deseret of the Constitution of the United States, and their own, for his and his successors' guardian care" (The Mormons, or, Latter-Day Saints, pp. 132, 138). The word also occurs, applied to celebrations on Pope Night, as early as 1752 (Massachusetts Archives, xlvii. 357.)

An Indian, dressed in the habiliments of a sachem, met Capt. TURNER in the place where *Massasoit* was first discovered, and the emblems of peace and friendship, which were interchanged, brought into view, an interesting scene, that existed soon after the arrival of our ancestors. A sprightly ball at Old Colony Hall, in which the ladies, by their participation, heightened the social enjoyment, crowned the anniversary festival.¹

In 1802 among the toasts were the following:

Christianity and the Clergy:— Washington believed—Adams believes, and what if *Tom Paine* and *his friend*² do not believe?

May the New-England sun of federalism, which illumines a *Strong*, a *Trumbull*, a *Gilman*, and a *Tichenor*, no longer suffer a partial eclipse in the state of Rhode-Island.³

Our *Sucktash* and our *Chowder*:⁴— May they never be supplanted by the *soup-meagre* of France, or the *revolutionary whiskey* of the *ancient dominion*.

The memory of a *Belknap*, a *Phillips*, a *Lowell*, and a *Minot*⁵— Worthy of being enrolled among New-England Sages.

The President of these United States— May he, by his *future* administration, prove that he has at heart the good of his country.⁶

In 1803 the Rev. John T. Kirkland delivered “a pathetic prayer and very excellent discourse;” from “this mental feast, about one hundred gentlemen, with grateful hearts, retired to the ‘Feast of Shells,’⁷ which displayed a sumptuous variety, consisting, not of clams and succatash alone, but of the more delicious rarities of the soil and forest:— nor was the table abandoned until the cheering glass, accompanied by the usual number of toasts, both appropriate and patriotic, closed the interesting scene;” in the evening, “the

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 30, 1801, pp. 2-3.

² The allusions here are to the English Thomas Paine and Thomas Jefferson.

³ Caleb Strong, Governor of Massachusetts; Isaac Tichenor, Governor of Vermont.

⁴ The earliest example of chowder quoted in the Oxford English Dictionary is under date of 1762. Versified “*Directions for making a CHOUDEUR*” were printed in the Boston Evening Post of September 23, 1751, p. 2/1.

⁵ Rev. Jeremy Belknap; Samuel Phillips (H. C. 1771), Lieutenant-Governor of Massachusetts; John Lowell (H. C. 1760); George Richards Minot (H. C. 1777).

⁶ New England Palladium, December 28, 1802, pp. 2-3.

⁷ For this term, rarely met with at Plymouth, see p. 327, below.

decorated Hall was crowded by a brilliant assembly of ladies and gentlemen, the progeny of the Pilgrims;" and among the "*toasts drunk by the younger sons of the Pilgrims in the Town House*" were the following:

3. "The enlightened government of *France*." — May it be remunerated for the *quit-claim* of *Louisiana*, while our citizens "manage their *own* affairs in their *own* way, unopposed by *fiscal exactions*."

7. "The daughters of pierless dames."¹ — May they never put off the swaddling clothes of their pristine virtue, in exchange for the habiliments of a WALSTONCRAFT.²

In 1804 it was "a proud reflection, that *native* hymns and *odes* furnished the songs, and the joy of the day;" and in the afternoon "a large company of citizens, and literary strangers, partook of an elegant dinner, where the moral and votive festivity of the entertainment was occasionally enlivened by the following toasts; and a brilliant Ball '*sent away the night in song*:'"

6. JOHN ADAMS, late President of the United States: — Whose private rectitude and honor, the slanderous tongue of party has never dared to assail. . . . 8. The memory of Gen. HAMILTON — "whose development of truth, was lucid as its path." . . . 12. The constitutional power of impeachment. "It poisons Justice, when the rancour of party tinctures her current." . . . The *Upas* of *Monticello*. May Judge CHASE³ keep to the windward. . . . *Johnny Randolph*.⁴ May he find it a hard *chase* to run down an independent Judge.⁵

These toasts drew from a Boston Republican paper the following comment:

THE federalists, in every transaction, evidence the folly and inconsistency of their conduct. The *Plymouth* pilgrims have carefully confined their approbation of John Adams to his *private* character; and under this distinction, have presumed to screen their disapprobation of his public acts. Their toast is, "John Adams, late President of the U. S. whose *private* rectitude and honor, the slanderous tongue of party

¹ See Judge Davis's ode, p. 306 note 3, above. The allusion at the close of the toast is of course to Mary Wollstonecraft Godwin (1759-1797).

² New England Palladium, December 30, 1803, p. 2/5.

³ Judge Samuel Chase was impeached.

⁴ John Randolph of Roanoke.

⁵ Columbian Centinel, December 29, 1804, p. 2/4.

has never dared to assail." This is altogether applied to his private "rectitude and honor." But, in a subsequent toast, they reprobate in the strongest terms his public conduct; which is thus evinced — "the memory of Gen. Hamilton, whose developement of truth, was lucid as its path." — Every man knows what Hamilton wrote about Mr. Adams: if then he was accurate in what he said, surely Mr. A. was of all men the most improper person for President. Thus glares the inconsistency of these modern pilgrims — Hamilton was "lucid in the developement of truth," when he calumniated Mr. Adams in his political reputation!!¹

In the following letter we have a suggestion that was not carried into effect until twelve years later:

PILGRIMS.

THE important achievements and pious examples of illustrious characters of former times, are both interesting and instructive to rising generations. Among the glorious events recorded in our history, none claim our grateful recollection more, than the pilgrimage of our venerable fore-fathers. As a testimony of high respect for their characters and memory, the anniversary of their landing and establishment on our shores, should be commemorated as "the glory of children are their fathers." What scene can be more interesting to the best feelings of the human heart, than a social union, celebrating the virtues and recounting the sufferings of our pious ancestors. While in the full enjoyment of their inestimable inheritance, let it not be imagined that prosperity has contracted our hearts, or debased our character; but, let us pay our annual tribute to their shrine, and perpetuate the theme to future generations. *Plymouth* should be the consecrated spot; there the footsteps of our fathers, the revered rock, and their more sacred relics are proper objects to employ our contemplations and animate our zeal. The duties of the anniversary have for several years past devolved upon a few individuals, and although we express no apprehension that the *genuine* sons of the Pilgrims will "be weary in well doing," yet *inauspicious circumstances* may exist by which the occasion may be *perverted*, or the celebration discontinued. It is therefore extremely desirable, that an institution for the purpose should be established, upon principles honorable to ourselves, and to those whose virtues we commemorate. The writer would propose, that an association be formed, to be denominated the *Pilgrim Society*. The number of members to

¹ Independent Chronicle, January 3, 1805, p. 2/4.

consist of 101, corresponding with the number of the first settlers. Whether the members should be selected from the native inhabitants of the late *Old Colony* exclusively, the writer is not prepared to determine; nor is he tenacious of the precise number, should that be deemed inadequate to the purpose intended. The first object of the society should be, to render permanent the celebration of the anniversary. — By assessment or subscription, a fund should be raised, and a proper edifice erected for the festive occasion. In one of its apartments may be deposited such appropriate portraits and antiquities, as can be procured. A valuable collection might probably be obtained, by donations from those who are generously disposed to promote the views of the institution. A monument, erected contiguous to the edifice, and inscribed to the memory of the Pilgrims, would be a valuable acquisition. But the particular objects which the institution may embrace, as also the necessary arrangements for its formation, are reserved for future consideration. The foregoing observations are intended merely to solicit attention to the subject. The scheme is at present immature — it is expected that it will receive improvement, or a more eligible one be devised.

A. B.¹

Plymouth, Jan. 3, 1807.

In 1816 the sermon was preached on December 22, which that year fell on Sunday; but on Monday “a large and respectable number of citizens and strangers, partook of an excellent dinner,” at which “appropriate toasts and occasional songs added to the pleasure of the festival;” and “A splendid Ball in the evening graced with the beauty and elegance of a brilliant collection of the ‘Daughters of peerless Dames,’ concluded the celebration.”²

The following accounts of the celebrations in 1817, 1818, and 1819 are given, because they indicate the nature of the discourses delivered in those years, which were never printed.

THE PILGRIM ANNIVERSARY

Was celebrated at Plymouth, on Monday last, in the usual appropriate style, and with undiminished interest. The severity of the weather did not prevent a full attendance on the exercises and entertainments of the day. The address by the Rev. Mr. HOLLEY, corresponded to the

¹ *Columbian Centinel*, January 7, 1807, p. 2/3.

² *Columbian Centinel*, December 28, 1816, p. 2/3.

high expectations which were entertained, and his admiring audience will long cherish the remembrance of a performance in which just and elevated sentiments, embodied in the happiest expression, were delivered with peculiar grace and oratorical ability. It was the first visit of Mr. HOLLEY to the *Old Colony*. Early in the morning of the anniversary he viewed the places, which, from any peculiar circumstance, are considered as the most striking memorials of *The Fathers*, and in the short interval between the return from his walk about town and taking his assigned place in the desk, he was introduced to some aged inhabitants, whose communications suggested considerations, which he thought applicable to the occasion. The reflections originating from these sources, and from ascertaining his own descent from an ancient settler in the territory, formed an apt and pleasing introduction to his Discourse, and created a sympathy of the happiest tendency. The eloquent speaker was followed by his audience with cheerful, animated and unremitting attention through the train of refined and weighty considerations which he ingeniously associated with the subject. It will not be attempted, in this notice, to analyze the Discourse. With its fine polish, there was a solidity of material, rendering it a most acceptable intellectual entertainment, and we hope that the request of the Selectmen, of a copy for publication, will not be denied.¹ . . .

LANDING OF OUR FOREFATHERS.

Plymouth, Dec. 26, 1818. The Landing of our Forefathers at Plymouth was celebrated at that place on the 22d inst. by the inhabitants of that ancient town and its vicinity. — The descendants of the Pilgrims, forgetting all differences of party and opinion, united to celebrate the occasion with an affectionate remembrance of their common origin. A procession was formed at 11 o'clock, and escorted to the Meeting-House the Rev. Mr. KENDALL by the *Standish Guards*, a new military corps, under the command of Capt. WESTON,² who now made their first public appearance, and by their correct discipline and military appearance proved themselves worthy of their illustrious name and descent. — The anniversary oration was delivered by the Hon. WENDELL DAVIS, of Sandwich, and gave high satisfaction to a crowded audience. It was an animated and eloquent description of the toils and sufferings, the pious resignation and triumphant perseverance of our venerable Ancestors.³ . . .

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 27, 1817, p. 2/3.

² Coomer Weston.

³ Columbian Centinel, December 30, 1818, p. 2/3.

Plymouth, Dec. 25, 1819.

THE landing of our Forefathers, at Plymouth, was celebrated at that place by their descendants on the 22d, with filial gratitude and joy. The celebration was conducted by the *Pilgrim Society*, which has recently been established to commemorate this distinguished enterprise, and to perpetuate the respect, which is due to those illustrious men, who, surrounded by danger and exalted by religion, became the founders of an empire. . . . An eloquent and interesting address was delivered by FRANCIS C. GRAY Esq. of Boston, who delighted a crowded assembly by displaying the toils and sufferings, the ardent piety and triumphant perseverance of our venerable ancestors, connected with impressive inculcations of maxims, principles and practice corresponding to the illustrious model suggested by the occasion.¹ . . .

It is usually stated that the first celebration under the auspices of the *Pilgrim Society*² was in 1820, when Daniel Webster delivered

¹ *Columbian Centinel*, December 29, 1819, p. 2/2.

² In 1832 Thacher said: "1820. — As the present year closes the second century since the pilgrim fathers first landed on our shores, a respectable number of inhabitants of this town, impelled by a sense of duty and pious gratitude to divine Providence, have instituted a society, which was by our legislature incorporated February 24th, by the name of *Pilgrim Society*" (p. 246). In 1847 a writer stated that "a society was formed, November 9, 1819, by the name of the 'Old Colony Pilgrim Society,' and immediately went into operation. . . . On February 24, 1820, the Society was incorporated and made a body politic, by the name of the 'Pilgrim Society.' . . . The 'Landing of our Forefathers' was first celebrated by the Pilgrim Society December 22, 1820, that being the completion of the second century since the settlement of New England, or the landing of the Pilgrims" (*New England Historical and Genealogical Register*, i. 119).

The following is a correct statement of what occurred. The first entry in the records of the Pilgrim Society states that at a meeting of certain citizens of Plymouth at the house of Joshua Thomas on November 9, 1819, it was voted "To form a society for the above purpose (to commemorate the Landing of the Fathers in the Town of Plymouth)." The next entry is, "Voted, That the name of the society be the Old Colony Pilgrim Society." A committee was then appointed to obtain an act of incorporation at the next session of the General Court, which began on January 12, 1820; and "An Act to incorporate the Pilgrim Society" was passed, and was approved by the Governor on January (not February) 24, 1820. The first section enacted "That John Watson, Joshua Thomas, Beza Hayward, William Davis, and Barnabas Hedge, . . . be, and they hereby are incorporated into a society, by the name of the Pilgrim Society," etc. The second section enacted "That the time and place, for holding the first meeting of said society, may be appointed by any three of the aforementioned persons, by giving their notice thereof, in the *Columbian Centinel*, printed in Boston," etc. (*Laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, 1822*, pp. 309-310; *Private and Special Statutes of the Commonwealth of*

his famous oration; but the last extract shows that the celebration of 1819 was "conducted by" the Pilgrim Society, on which occasion Mr. Gray, the orator, gave a toast to "The *Pilgrim Society* — instituted in honor of the Forefathers, may it be durable as their fame." On the same day, also, "an elegant standard, with appropriate emblems, the gift of some gentlemen of Plymouth, was presented to the Standish Guards, from the rock of our Forefathers, by JOHN WATSON, Esq.;" and "the usual sequel to the entertainments of this anniversary, a Ball, in the evening, gave a cheerful close to the exercises of the day."¹

Massachusetts, 1823, v. 334). Accordingly, the following notice was inserted in the *Columbian Centinel* of May 10, 1820 (p. 3/1):

PILGRIM SOCIETY.

THE Subscribers being authorized by an act, entitled, an act "to incorporate the Pilgrim Society," to appoint the time and place for the holding the first meeting of said Society; hereby give notice, that a meeting of said Society will be held at the Court-House, in Plymouth, on THURSDAY, eighteenth day of May instant, ten of the clock, A.M. for the purpose of choosing such Officers as may be deemed expedient; of establishing such bye-laws, as may be necessary to regulate said Society, and of acting and doing all other matters and things, requisite to carry the objects of the association into effect.

JOHN WATSON,
JOSHUA THOMAS,
BEZA HAYWARD,
WILLIAM DAVIS,
BARNABAS HEDGE.

Plymouth, May 5, 1820.

No meeting of the Society was held between November 9, 1819, and May 18, 1820; and the records of the Society state that the latter meeting was "To organize the Society under the act of incorporation." Hence it is impossible to say exactly when the committee appointed to obtain an act of incorporation concluded to alter the name from the Old Colony Pilgrim Society to the Pilgrim Society; but the passage quoted in the text shows that the change must have taken place before December 22, 1819. A notice, beginning as follows, was printed in the *Columbian Centinel* of June 21, 1820 (p. 2/3):

PILGRIM SOCIETY.

The Anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrims at Plymouth, in the month of December, 1620, has been publicly celebrated in that ancient town for a series of years. Considerations connected with that memorable event, have given rise to the "*Pilgrim Society*." . . .

The following officers of the Society were chosen the 29th May: . . .

¹ Mr. Watson's address and the reply of Ensign Randall are printed in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 29, 1819, p. 2.

Of the celebration in 1820 we read that "The ball in the evening was attended by more than 600, of all ages; and the costume of the Ladies was at once beautiful and uniform; uniting to real elegance the simplicity of their venerable foremothers;" and that among the toasts drunk were the following:¹

8. *New England's Worthies* — and the memory of their illustrious biographers — *Belknap* and *Eliot*.

9. The character of *William Penn*.

The memory of Lady ARABELLA JOHNSON,² the Queen of the Pilgrims, and a Martyr in their cause.

The memory of Gov. WINTHROP; the friend and protector of the Plymouth Pilgrims.

The memory of Gov. ENDICOTT; worthy to be the Chief Magistrate of a Colony of Puritans.³

BOSTON CELEBRATIONS

The following letter was printed in the Boston Gazette of December 28, 1772 (p. 2/3):

MESSI'RS EDES & GILL,

I Was Yesterday informed that the Inhabitants of the ancient Town of Plymouth celebrated the Anniversary of the Landing of their Ancestors in that Town, in a Manner which demonstrated their Sense of the invaluable Blessings of that Liberty for which their Fathers left their native Country; and also their Gratitude to the supreme Disposer of all Events, under whose Direction they steered to this new World, and by whose Assistance their arduous Undertaking was so happily accomplished — The whole Colony of Plymouth are under indispensable Obligations to be ever mindful of those Vertues which so eminently distinguished their illustrious Progenitors.—Nor can it be supposed that the respectable Town of Salem, the most ancient Settlement in what was called the Massachusetts Colony, can suffer the memorable Day to pass unnoticed, in which their ever honored Predecessors first reached

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 27, 1820, p. 2/5-6.

² Lady Arbella Johnson, daughter of Thomas Clinton (alias Fiennes), third Earl of Lincoln, and her husband Isaac Johnson came with Winthrop in 1630, the admiral (or most considerable ship) of his fleet having received her name. Both she and her husband died shortly after their arrival.

³ For a bibliography of the Plymouth discourses, see pp. 384-391, below.

the American Shore: And the most publick Demonstration of their Thankfulness to the great Governor of the Universe, as well as a firm and steady Resolution to do all in their Power to transmit to their Posterity the noble Birthrights derived from those Ancestors—is what God and their Fellow Countrymen have the justest Right to expect from them.

PHILADELPHUS.

Nahant Beach, Dec. 24, 1772.

This suggestion appears to have fallen on deaf ears. But in 1797 the Rev. Jeremy Belknap and others are said to have held a private celebration in honor not of the first settlers at Salem or at Boston but of those at Plymouth, though of this I have been unable to find a contemporary account. In 1798, however, a public celebration took place. Up to this time, as already pointed out, the Plymouth celebrations had always been dignified and free from partizan politics, but at once the Boston celebrations became a high Federalist carnival. In an interleaved copy of Thomas's Almanack for 1798, the Rev. John Eliot recorded: "Dec. 22. Dined Concert Hall. Feast of Shells."¹ In the Massachusetts Mercury of December 25 appeared this —

APOLOGY.

☞ It is with regret that we feel ourselves obliged to omit the details of the celebration of the most important day in our History — the arrival of our Forefathers. They are in Press and situated exactly in the place of the preceeding News — and was the only matter which could be withdrawn without a total derangement of our form. ☞ They shall appear on Friday (p. 2/4).

In the Columbian Centinel of December 26 was printed this announcement:

TO OUR READERS.

☞ We are necessitated to defer many articles intended and prepared for this day — Amongst others the particulars of "*The Feast of the Sons of the Pilgrims*" (p. 2/4).

¹ I am indebted to our associate Mr. Worthington C. Ford for suggesting that something might be found in Eliot's interleaved almanacs, but unfortunately there was nothing in them relating to the meeting said to have taken place in 1797.

The following account appeared in the Massachusetts Mercury of December 28:

TOASTS
DRANK AT THE CELEBRATION OF OUR
COUNTRY'S NATIVITY.

The 177th Anniversary of the arrival of our Forefathers at *Plymouth*, was celebrated by a respectable Company at Concert Hall, on Saturday last. Gen. LINCOLN presided, and JOSEPH RUSSELL, Esq. was Vice President. A Dinner, composed of similar food to what sustained our renowned Predecessors, in the arduous task of *commencing our Country*, was provided. The Hall was decorated with the sacred Portraits and bright Swords of our pious and brave Ancestors. The Independent Spirit of their Sires, is fully inherited by their sons. The innovations of the *Mother Country* were opposed with a Courage which commands Success — — — nor is the same energy wanting to repel the attempts of any *other* Power. The Genius, Integrity and Patriotism of this large and respectable Company is amply evidenced by the following Toasts.

"The Pilgrims of Leyden." — May the Empire which has sprung from their labours be permanent as the *rock of their landing*.

John Robinson, of whom it was declared hard to judge whether he delighted most in having such a *people*, or they in having such a *pastor*.

Governor *Carver* — The leader of the illustrious band, and an early victim to the hardships of their enterprize.

Governor *Bradford*. — Who sought to avoid, not to obtain office; a man of fidelity and honor.

William Brewster, *ruling elder* — to whom his *Bible* and his *arms* were alike familiar.

Edward Winslow. — Who, "excellent in parts and wisdom," in all his diplomatic conduct, "cleared the country from blame and dishonor."

Miles Standish. — The military commander of the *Pilgrims*, foremost in every hazardous enterprize, brave in combat, and forbearing in victory.

John Winthrop. — Father and Governor of *Massachusetts*, "who overcame others by overcoming himself," and also had the honor of being callumniated by the *Jacobins*¹ of his time.

The swords of *Endicott* and *Standish*, by which the first *Sedition Pole* in New-England was demolished.

The goodly land, which *God* has given us. May we never surrender it to *Satan*.

The Liberty of our Forefathers, "a civil, moral, federal liberty," a liberty for that only which is just and good.²

¹ Those who sympathized with France were so called by the Federalists.

² In 1645 Winthrop said: "For the other point concerning liberty, I observe a great mistake in the country about that. There is a twofold liberty, natural (I mean as our nature is now corrupt) and civil or federal" (Journal, 1908, ii. 238).

May all movers of *Sedition*, and lords of mis-rule, whether native or imported, meet the fate of *Oldham* and *Morton*, of *Mount Wallaston*!¹

Our *Fore-Mothers*: — let their heroism, patience, and conjugal love be consecrated to everlasting esteem and imitation.

To the revered memory of our lamented *divine*, *biographer*, and *historian*, Dr. BELKNAP, who has conducted us thro' the pleasant paths of ancient times.

The spirit of the *Old Colony Executive*,² who for a present of *Arrows and a Snake-skin*, from a *savage enemy*, returned *powder and ball*, with this answer — "*If you wish war, you may have it*"!

The Federal Constitution: like the "shallop of our fathers," may it find a "*Rock*" and a shelter in *Old Colony* virtues and principles!

The President of the United States.³ — In the glorious work of animating and guiding the patriotic spirit of his country, may he *go on and prosper*!

Lieut. General *Washington*. — May his sword be successfully wielded against foreign insolence and oppression, and the hero of American liberty yet have the satisfaction of again contemplating in his retirement, the independence and prosperity of his country.⁴

John Jay. — May the lasting happiness and gratitude of his country, and the plaudits of an admiring world, be the recompense of his talents, patriotism, and services.

Alexander Hamilton. — May the future services of this luminary of our western hemisphere be as useful and brilliant as the past.

Governor *Sumner*. — May he long enjoy the rich reward of the love and reverence of his countrymen.

Chief Justice *Dana*.⁵ — May his fame be as permanent as our law, and our law as pure as his integrity.

Timothy Pickering. — The Rock of State, firm while Frenchmen froth around its base.

Oliver Wolcott.⁶ — When French men or the friends of Frenchmen come to our treasury, may he keep the key.

Buonaparte, and his army. — May they wander in the wilderness of Egypt without *mana* to feed, or the *brazen serpent* to heal them,

The *Red Sea*. — May it continue faithful to the cause of God and men, if the modern Egyptians should attempt its passage.

The military and naval establishments of the United States. — May they be increased and supported in proportion to our exigences.

The strong arm of government — May it be felt by *intrigaing aliens*, and *seditious citizens*.⁷

¹ John Oldham, who came in the Anne in 1623; and the notorious Thomas Morton of Merrymount.

² Bradford. The "present" came early in 1622 from Canonicus, the great sachem of the Narragansetts: see Bradford's History (ed. Ford), i. 240-241.

³ John Adams.

⁴ Washington had accepted the position of Lieutenant-General and Commander-in-Chief on July 13, 1798.

⁵ Francis Dana (H. C. 1762).

⁶ Secretary of the Treasury.

⁷ An allusion to the Alien and Sedition Acts, passed by Congress in 1798.

The Apostate *Talleyrand*¹ — a man by *chance*, a bishop by *grace*, and a knave by *instinct*.

The following elegant and patriotic Ode written for the occasion by Mr. THOMAS PAINE was repeatedly sung amidst the most unbounding applause.²

Paine's ode, to the tune of the "*President's March*,"³ contained eight stanzas, of which the second and fourth are as follows:

Round the consecrated rock,
 Conven'd the patriarchal stock,
 And there, while every lifted hand
 Affirmed the charter of the land,
 The storm was hush'd, and round the zone
 Of heaven the *mystic meteor* shone;
 Which, like the *rainbow* seen of yore,
 Proclaim'd that SLAVERY'S FLOOD was o'er;
 That pilgrim man, so long oppress'd,
 Had found his promis'd *place of rest*.

CHORUS.

Sons of glory, patriot band,
 Swear to guard this chosen land!
 To your *Children* leave it *free*,
 OR A DESERT LET IT BE!

Heirs of Pilgrims, now renew
 The oath your fathers swore for you,
 When first around the social board,
 Enrich'd from Nature's frugal hoard,
 The ardent vow to heaven they breath'd
 To shield the rights their sires bequeath'd!
 Let FACTION from our realm be hurl'd; —
United, you defy the world; —
 And, as a TRIBUTE, scorn to yield
 The *Worm*, that blights your blossom'd field!

¹ In 1797 John Marshall, Charles Cotesworth Pinckney, and Elbridge Gerry had been sent on an unsuccessful mission — commonly known as the "XYZ Mission" — to France to treat with Talleyrand. It was then that Pinckney used an expression that has become famous: "'Millions for defence,'" said the *Independent Chronicle* of January 28, 1799, "'but not a cent for tribute.'" This has been the language of those who are in favor of War [with France]" (p. 2/3).

² *Massachusetts Mercury*, December 28, 1798, p. 2/4. Thomas Paine (H. C. 1792), who afterwards (March 8, 1803) changed his name to Robert Treat Paine, was the son of Robert Treat Paine (H. C. 1749) the Signer.

³ See p. 310 note, above.

CHORUS.

Sons of glory, patriot band,
 Swear to guard your native land!
 To your *children* leave it free,
 OR A DESERT LET IT BE!¹

The account promised by the Columbian Centinel duly appeared in the issue of December 29, and began as follows:

"THE HEIRS OF THE PILGRIMS"

Celebrated on Saturday Dec. 22, the 177th Anniversary of the landing of their Forefathers at Plymouth Rock. — As it was the day of the nativity of *New-England*, the commemorating banquet was attended by a very numerous and respectable company, most of whom were lineally descended from the first settlers of the *Old Colony*. Gen. LINCOLN presided, and JOS. RUSSELL, Esq. was Vice-President, at the board of the "*Pilgrims*," which was amply and characteristically furnished with every species of *wild* food, which the elements afford, at this period of the year. The portrait of the pious WILSON, and the swords of CARVER and STANDISH were conspicuous among the embellishments of the hall; and the following toasts evinced that the spirit of the *Old Colony* patriots had been bequeathed to the inheritors of their soil (pp. 2-3).

It is thus seen that the term Feast of Shells² at once made its appearance, and that the word Pilgrim, as specifically applied to

¹ Massachusetts Mercury, December 28, 1798, p. 4/1.

² The Boston celebration perhaps received this name (see p. 347, below) in allusion to the shell-fish so often mentioned in early days. It should be pointed out, however, that the expressions "the shells of the feast," "the shells of joy," "the shell of feasts," "to rejoice in the shell," "the hall of shells," "the feast of shells," occur in the Ossianic poems; Macpherson explaining that "*To rejoice in the shell*, is a phrase for feasting sumptuously, and drinking freely;" and further says: "The ancient Scots, as well as the present Highlanders, drunk in shells; hence it is that we so often meet, in the old poetry, with *the chief of shells*, and *the halls of shells*." See Poems of Ossian, London, 1805, ii. 154, 161 note, 201 note, 235 and note, 297 and note, iii. 6-7. Cf. Notes and Queries, 11th Series, ix. 108, 175. Oscar and Malvina, a pantomime "taken from the Poems of Ossian," was given at the Boston Theatre on March 14, 1796. "At the opening of the Piece the Theatre represents the Hall of Fingal at the Feast of Shells" (Oscar & Malvina, Hamburg, 1795, p. 6).

At all events, the Boston celebration was not called the Feast of Shells in reference to the scallop-shell as a pilgrim's badge. In 1896 W. T. Davis said:

The corner stone of the canopy over the Rock was laid on the 2d of August, 1859, and the structure was completed in 1867. . . . The use of scallop shells on

an early settler, was first used by Thomas Paine and immediately caught the popular fancy.¹

It was not to be expected that the gross partizanship displayed by the participants in the celebration should have escaped criticism. A communication signed "Propriety" appeared in the Independent Chronicle of December 31:

The "Feast of Shells."

FOR THE CHRONICLE.

"*Several of the Rev. Clergy were present.*" No doubt recommended by their politicks, suitable persons for such a feast, they *boast* of feasting on such a dish once in their lives. But *politicks* gave even shells a relish. — Their parishioners complain that these shepherds feed them with the *husks* of *politicks* once a week, without the least tincture of *truth* to season husks — though they pay them weekly and well, to be served with Christian truth, and not with the *fib*s and artifices of the *Politician*.

The Feasts *all Shell and no Fish*, as one would conclude, must have ended with — *all Bottle and no Liquor*. — But that was not the case. It was necessary there should be *wine* and that the *best of priests' wine*, sufficient for *twenty-nine Toasts* from their priestly lips, which last served to fit them for a song of the *American Tom Paine* to the *tune* of the President's march. . . .

Strange it was that the managers of that feast, should imagine that those Heavenly Pilgrims could approve of the practice of *toasting*, to which they were so much averse on earth. They thought it to be of evil tendency, and immoral, and therefore not to be countenanced; they thought it could be borne with only by *Bachanalian Topers*. To have *heard* 29 toasts given, must immediately have ended their journey

its top was suggested by the fact that this shell was the emblem worn by the Pilgrims on their way to the Holy Land. . . . The first use of the scallop shell associated with the Plymouth Pilgrims was at the anniversary celebration in 1820, when at the ball in the evening some young ladies hung a shell suitably decorated on the breast of Mr. Webster, the orator of the day (Plymouth Memoirs of an Octogenarian, pp. 27, 28).

¹ In E. C. Stedman and Ellen M. Hutchinson's Library of American Literature (1888, iii. 185) are quoted, under the heading "To the Heirs of the Pilgrims," twenty-six lines from a poem written by Dr. Benjamin Church in 1765. The lines are correctly quoted from pp. 7-8 of "The Times. A Poem. By an American" (1765), but the heading under which they appear in the work cited is of course due to the editors.

through this then howling wilderness, and carried them strait to their desired home.¹

But those men of sobriety only perceive that they led to tipling, but not that they might be improved by Tories and Courtiers to injure the essential interests of a free and virtuous People. The publisher of the toasts given at the *Feast of Shells*, says that justice is done to our *first* and *later* worthies with affection, cordiality, and sincerity. Yet as to some of those toasts, tho' called federal, they surely do not discover the *features* of a *Pilgrim*, — I mean of one traveling to the land of *purity* and *peace* — Such were our venerable Ancestors. . . .

Let us take a look at some of the Toasts and see if they discover more judiciousness. . . .

"*Alexander Hamilton. May the future services of this Luminary of the Western hemisphere be as useful and brilliant as the past.*" — Astonishment almost stops my pen. What! and was there no Phineas present, to take up the faithful sword of one of the chiefs of the first Settlers and which helped to decorate the Hall, and with a laudable zeal have avenged the shameful insult offered in this toast to the conjugal purity of those Ancient Worthies?² And why in the name of common decency did not the brave and virtuous General then in the Chair, give out immediate orders to his Drum Major to go round the Hall and beat to the tune of — "Drunk or sober, go to bed Tom — go to bed Tom" (pp. 2-3).³

¹ In a letter to Sir Robert Naunton dated November 28, 1619, Sir Dudley Carleton, referring to Thomas Brewer, who had charge of the Pilgrim press (cf. p. 384 note 1, below) at Leyden (though he did not come to this country), said:

The states fleet now prepared against the pirates could not possibly put to sea until this day; which is the first easterly wind we have had for these six weeks past. I hope it will carry over sir WILLIAM ZOUCHE with mr. BREWER to your honour, who have lain long together at Flushing; and his fellow Brownists at Leyden are somewhat scandalized, because they hear sir WILLIAM hath taught him to drink healths (Letters from and to Sir Dudley Carleton, 1775, p. 423).

² The reference is to Hamilton's *Observations on Certain Documents, etc.*, 1797, usually known as the "Reynolds Pamphlet," in which he explained his public conduct at the expense of his private character. In the *Independent Chronicle* of January 27, 1803, there is an allusion to "*Maria's financier*" (p. 2/4).

³ In the same paper of January 10, 1799, "Propriety" again wrote: "The *Salem Gazette* contains the celebration of the Feast of shells, and the printer has honoured himself by shewing his regard to *Propriety*, in leaving out the *exceptionable* toasts, given at that feast" (p. 2/4).

The celebration of 1799 was thus described in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 25 (p. 3):

FEAST OF THE "SONS OF THE PILGRIMS."

The anniversary of the landing of our Ancestors, at *Plymouth*, in 1620, was celebrated in this town, on Monday last, by a large number of gentlemen, who dined together at *Concert-Hall*. The guests were several immediate descendants of the first company of emigrants, with a large number of native citizens sprung from the early settlers of *Massachusetts*, or the Old Colony; or connected with them by the affection and respect they bear to their memory. STEPHEN HIGGINSON, Esq.¹ presided; and JOSEPH RUSSELL, and PELEG COFFIN, Esquires, officiated as Vice-Presidents.

The tables were covered with a choice collection of fish, wild meats, and birds: And a shell of uncommon size, borrowed from the Museum of the Historical Society,² adorned the head of the table, containing the *appropriate succatash*, sufficient for the numerous company.

The following toasts were given. [*They shall be given to the public on Saturday.*]

After the first toast, an Ode, in honor of the Fathers, was sung, with suitable solemnity by the company to the tune of *Old Hundred*. Lines adapted to this ancient tune were conceived to be well adapted to the occasion. It was pleasing to recollect that our ancestors sang together their sacred hymns in this tune; which on good ground is supposed to have been composed by the celebrated Reformer, MARTIN LUTHER. — The "*Plymouth Ode*," composed for the celebration of the anniversary there, in 1793,³ was also performed; and Mr. PAINE'S admired song of "*Sainted Shades*," composed for the last anniversary.⁴

¹ Born November 28, 1743; died November 22, 1828. In his *Life and Letters of Stephen Higginson* (1907), the late Col. Thomas Wentworth Higginson gave a brief account (pp. 219–229) of the celebrations in 1801–1804, drawn from notes furnished by the present writer. Oddly enough, "No allusions to these festive occasions are apparently to be found in Stephen Higginson's correspondence" (p. 229).

² Mr. Grenville H. Norcross writes me: "When the Massachusetts Historical Society began, it had a Natural History attachment, the remains of which, consisting of two pairs of horns and two big 'oyster' shells, remained down to my time as Cabinet Keeper. We offered the horns and shells to the Boston Society of Natural History, but they were declined." Later, they were all given to Dr. Edwin H. Brigham, who informs me that they are at his house at South Hanover, that "one shell is much the larger," that it weighs two hundred pounds, and that its capacity is "at least a bushel, perhaps more."

³ An error for 1794: see p. 306 note 3, above.

⁴ See p. 326, above.

The celebration of this anniversary leads us to the tombs of our Fathers; and naturally excites some degree of not unpleasing sensibility; — But it was the lot of the company who assembled on Monday to have the soothing contemplations on the deeds and characters of the Fathers, overwhelmed by the intelligence of a most afflicting event, which will excite the sympathy of the whole civilized world. In the forenoon of the day, a rumor prevailed, that WASHINGTON was dead! Before noon it was rendered *painfully certain*.

Common festivals upon such intelligence would have been omitted: But the impressions arising from the celebration were thought not inconsistent with a due sensibility to the sad event which was announced. The usual expressions of gaiety had no place; and the guests appeared assembled rather for condolence than festivity. Had it been possible, none could wish to exchange his tender emotions, for thoughtless hilarity; since every heart capable of sympathy will pronounce,

“The broadest mirth unfeeling folly wears,
“Less pleasing far than even Virtue’s tears.”

At the close of the first Ode to the memory of *the Fathers*, a tribute of respect was attempted to the memory of the Great Man who has fallen. As the Ode was originally prepared, it concluded with the following verse: —

Hail Pilgrim Fathers of our race,
With grateful hearts your toils we trace,
Oft as this *votive Day* returns,
We’ll pay due honors to your urns.

After the afflicting intelligence of the day arrived, the following lines were added,

Ah! while we gather round your urn,
Joins your blest band, great WASHINGTON. —
Hark, to that knell * — a NATION’S sighs
Waft his PURE SPIRIT to the skies.

* *The bells were then tolling.*¹

In this ode, written by Samuel Davis, the term Pilgrim Fathers occurs for the first time.² The list of toasts promised by the Columbian Centinel, duly appeared in the issue of December 28:

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 25, 1799, p. 3.

² For a memoir of Samuel Davis, who was a brother of Judge John Davis, see 3 Massachusetts Historical Collections, v. 253–255. As there has been confusion in regard to Judge Davis’s ode of 1794, so too has there been with respect to Samuel Davis’s ode of 1799. An account of the 1845 celebration at Plymouth,

TOASTS.

The following are the toasts given at the Feast of the "*Sons of the Pilgrims*," at Concert-Hall, on Monday last.

1. THE 22d of December, 1620. — May its perpetual celebration be a monument to the virtues of our fathers, durable as the *rock of their landing*.
2. *The President of the United States* — The venerable Chief, who sustains our empire, by toils and virtues, like those by which it was acquired.
3. *The Administration of the United States*. — May it display the wisdom of CARVER, the integrity of BRADFORD, the firmness of WINSLOW, the piety of BREWSTER, and the spirit of STANDISH.
4. *The Commonwealth of Massachusetts*. — May it ever find Governors like the last;¹ resembling BRADFORD and WINTHROP. — Men who did not seek office, yet whom office sought; who were willing to rule, and not less willing to be ruled.
5. *The Fathers of New England*. — May the healthful stamina of their institutions resist the infection of insidious *philosophism*.
6. *Antient maxims and antient manners*. — May they be duly respected by modern policy and modern philosophy.
7. *The memory of our Ancestors*. — May their ardour inspire and their success encourage their descendants to maintain their birth-rights, and may all their enemies be converted like MASSASOIT, or suffer like PHILLIP.
8. *The American Judiciary*. — Lord COKE's benediction to them, "The gladsome light of jurisprudence, the loveliness of temperance, and the solidity of justice."
9. *The American Navy*. — Let it be remembered, that the *ocean* it is to defend bore our *sires* on its bosom.
10. *Those Foreign Ministers*, who, like CARVER, "carry themselves with good discretion," and like WINSLOW, "clear the country from blame and dishonor."
11. *Our Envoys to France*,² who will remember that the sons, like the fathers, would rather be blotted from the book of that republic, than "become marginal notes to a French text, which is yet but apocryphal."
12. *The sixteen United Fires*.³ — May they burn bright and pure; full of genial warmth to the friends of our country, and of deadly heat to its enemies.
13. Correct systems in *politics* and *religion*; and sharp swords to defend the one, and sound sense to maintain the other.
14. May the doctrine older than our fathers never be forgotten, that *liberty of the people is inseparable from the authority of the magistrate*.
15. *The prudent policy of our*

written by the Rev. John Pierce, is printed in 2 Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society, x. 393-403. "Then the choir," wrote Mr. Pierce, "sung the ode by Judge Davis, written in 1799" (p. 396). An editorial note says, "Here follows the well-known ode, written by the Hon. Judge Davis, third President of the Historical Society, beginning 'Sons of renowned sires.'" This editorial statement is correct, though Mr. Pierce gave the year 1799 instead of 1794 (see p. 306 note 3, above). Mr. Pierce continued: "The hymn then for 22 December, written by Judge Davis, was sung to Old 100." An editorial note says, "Here follows Judge Davis's scarcely less familiar hymn, beginning 'Hail, pilgrim fathers of our race!'" The attribution of this hymn to Judge Davis was a mistake.

¹ Increase Sumner died while in office June 7, 1799.

² William Vans Murray, Oliver Ellsworth, and William Richardson Davie.

³ Vermont, Kentucky, and Tennessee had been admitted into the Union in 1791, 1792, and 1796 respectively.

fathers — welcoming worthy emigrants and refusing to the sons of sedition a resting place for their feet. 16. *The antient Town of Plymouth*. — Prosperity to those who dwell around the cradle of our country. 17. GEORGE WASHINGTON — “My father, my father; the chariots of Israel, and the horsemen thereof.”

VOLUNTEER TOASTS.

From the Chair. Whilst we celebrate the memory of our Fore Fathers, may we imitate their virtues, that we also may be had in remembrance.

The memory of the Historian of our Ancestors, Dr. BELKNAP. — Devouring time or barbaric fury shall destroy marble monuments; but nothing shall demolish his labours.

The *virtuous Matrons*, who attended the Pilgrims. — The image of their fair example of conjugal love and simple manners will never be wanting in their daughters (pp. 1-2).

The names of those who presided or were present in 1800 do not appear in the newspaper accounts of that celebration, but among the toasts drunk were the following:

6. May *Federalism*, like the *Live Oak*, though prostrate prove the country's best defense.

8. May the *exulting* notes of antifederalism, like those of the swan, prove the *prelude of its death*.

10. May the *ghosts* of our pious forefathers *walk* during the approaching reign of infidelity, and deter the daring philosophists from attacking the sacred temple of religion.¹

A correspondent who signed himself “A. X.” thus freed his mind in the Independent Chronicle of December 29 (p. 2/3):

The fag end of the Faction described.

THE first settlers in New-England fled from the cruel hand of persecution. . . . When, therefore, the day of their arrival is celebrated as a festival, it ought to be done in a temper suited to the principles which brought them to this country. But in a late assembly, which stiled their entertainment *The Feast of Shells*, that very spirit of persecution, that malignity of heart, that superb haughtiness of spirit, and that same claim to lawless rule and uncontroled domination, which drove our Ancestors from Europe, were exhibited at full length.

The Feast of Shells was introduced some years ago by a number of

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 24, 1800, p. 2/3. In the presidential election of 1800, Jefferson and Burr received each 73 electoral votes, the election thus being thrown into the House of Representatives, where Jefferson was successful.

men, who wished to perpetuate the honor of the first American emigrants. It was not intended as a political engine, to contaminate and wound the true principles of civil liberty. Nor was it intended as a political measure, or for any other purpose, than that of doing honor to the virtues of those who fled to these shores for the enjoyment of freedom.

The public ought to be informed, that the men who assumed the feast this year, are not the men who originated it. That a number of men, whose politics have poisoned the sources of science, have made even their public devotion subservient to the vilest party purposes — have dissolved the bands of friendship — have subverted all sincerity and truth in political communications — have, under the mask of Federalism, attempted to overthrow the best Constitution on earth. These men contrived to collect themselves, as a party in opposition to the great body of the people. To countenance their indecency and contemptible abuse, they invited others, who perhaps did not know their intentions. The toasts they drank, and all their arrangements was an insult upon the President, the Republic of America, and upon the great body of the Citizens.

The fact is, that this festival, as they celebrated it, was the overboilings of their chagrin and disappointment. They came forward with the torch of discord in their hand; and the flame was increased by the oil of revenge and disappointment.

The man who presided at the festival,¹ has been the avowed enemy of John Adams. He was no greater friend to Washington before the capture of Burgoyne, than he was to Samuel Adams, John Hancock and Thomas Jefferson.

The feast was supported by the same men, who feasted Gen. Hamilton, when he was lately in Boston. It was arranged with a view to support the interest of a man, whose morals are as infamous, as his politics are dangerous to the American Republic. . . .

In 1801 Stephen Higginson presided, while Joseph Russell, Martin Brimmer, and Peleg Coffin assisted as vice-presidents; and among the guests were "the Hon. JOHN ADAMS, Hon. TIMOTHY PICKERING, the President of the Senate, the Hon. Judges of the Federal and State Courts, the President and Professors of Harvard University, several of the Rev. Clergy, the Hon. JOHN Q. ADAMS, GEORGE CABOT, and FISHER AMES, Esquires."² The presence of John Adams,

¹ Possibly Stephen Higginson.

² *Columbian Centinel*, December 23, 1801, p. 2/4. Broad-sides containing songs to be sung at the Boston celebrations were sometimes printed. Professor

Timothy Pickering, and Fisher Ames led the Independent Chronicle of December 24 (p. 3/1) to declare:

THE "*feast of shells*," we understand, was celebrated in this town, on Tuesday last, by a number of *rare* characters. "Strange times, strange times indeed," have come to pass! when we can behold the *Braintree* Lion,¹ the *Essex* Hyena, and the *Dedham* Watch-Dog QUIETLY feeding in open day within the same enclosure!!!

The celebration of 1802 was thus described in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 25:

"SONS OF THE PILGRIMS."

On Monday, the 22d December, was celebrated in this town, the Anniversary of Our Fathers' landing at *Plymouth*, Anno Domini 1620. A hundred and one gentlemen, the number that arrived in the first ships, sat down at the "Feast of Shells," with those joyous and elevated emotions that rise from contemplating the characters of great and good men. Among the distinguished guests were His Honor the LIEUT-GOVERNOR,² Gen. LINCOLN, The Hon. TIMOTHY PICKERING, the Officers

Kittredge calls my attention to one (owned by the Massachusetts Historical Society) that was evidently prepared for the celebration in 1801. It is headed "*FESTIVAL of the SONS of the PILGRIMS*," and contains four songs: that of Judge Davis in 1794 (wrongly dated 1793), that of Samuel Davis in 1799 (without date or name of the author), that of Paine in 1798 (wrongly dated 1800), and that "*Composed for the Festival at Plymouth, 1800*." The last was printed in the *New England Palladium* of January 27, 1801, p. 3/2, and is stated in W. S. Russell's *Airs of the Pilgrims* (1846, p. 39) to have been written by Samuel Davis. The Boston Public Library also owns a mutilated copy of the same broadside, on which is written in pencil "Four odes and hymns for the anniv. festival at Plymouth." But clearly the broadside was printed for the Boston celebration. The Boston Public Library also owns a broadside that was evidently prepared for the celebration in 1802. It is headed "*FESTIVAL of the SONS of the PILGRIMS*," and contains five songs: the above four, and in addition an ode "*Composed for the Anniversary Festival of the SONS of the PILGRIMS, 1801*." This last was printed in the *New England Palladium* of December 29, 1801, p. 1/2.

¹ In later years John Adams was also called Duke of Braintree and Old Brimborion (*Columbian Centinel*, November 4, 1812, p. 2/4; October 28, 1812, p. 1/4). In a former communication to the Society I inadvertently stated that "the sobriquet of 'the Duke of Quincy' was sometimes applied to John Adams" (*Publications*, x. 180). For a curious collection of nicknames current early in the nineteenth century, see *Proceedings American Antiquarian Society*, xix. 23-29.


² Edward Hutchinson Robbins.

of the University, several of the Revd. Clergy of this and the neighboring towns, the Hon. Judge PAINE, Hon. MESSRS. CABOT, AMES, DWIGHT and BRIGHAM.¹ STEPHEN HIGGINSON, Esquire, was President of the day, JOSEPH RUSSELL, PELEG COFFIN and MARTIN BRIMMER, Esquires, were *Vice Presidents*. The Hall was appropriately ornamented with the portraits of WINTHROP, ENDICOTT, LEVERETT, HIGGINSON, BRADSTREET, and WILSON; together with an historical painting, "The Landing of the Fathers,"² from the pencil of Mr. SARGENT, and many curiosi-

¹ Probably Thomas Dwight (H. C. 1778), and Elijah Brigham (Dartmouth College 1778).

² This is the earliest allusion I have found to Henry Sargent's painting, now called *The Landing of the Pilgrims*. A very long advertisement appeared in the *Columbian Centinel* of March 4, 1815 (p. 3/1), which begins as follows:

Landing of the Fathers.

THIS celebrated Painting by H. SARGENT, Esq. is now exhibiting near the corner of *Walnut* and *Beacon Streets*, back of the unfurnished buildings belonging to Mr. Cotting. The doors will be open every day for a few weeks, Sundays excepted, from the hour of 9 in the morning, until 4 in the afternoon.— Admittance 25 Cents. Free Tickets of Admission, (\$1 each,) will admit the bearer at all times when exhibiting; to be had at the room. . . .

In the same paper of June 21, 1815 (p. 2/3) was advertised —

Col. SARGENT'S New Painting.

Our FATHERS intend speedily, we are informed, to visit the Southern States. — They hold their levee however, at the accustomed dwelling for a few days. . . .

In the same paper of July 8, 1815 (p. 2/1) is an advertisement headed "*Close of the Exhibition of the Fathers.*" But in September following the picture was here again. In his Discourse on December 22 of that year, the Rev. James Flint suggested that the picture should be bought and placed in Plymouth, adding, "It would gratify many sons of the pilgrims, to see measures taking to carry this suggestion into effect" (p. 22). Presumably Sargent was unable to sell his picture, for in 1834 he himself presented it to the Pilgrim Society (New England Historical and Genealogical Society, 1850, iv. 193). For notices of the picture, taken from Boston newspapers of 1815, see 2 Massachusetts Historical Collections, iii. 225-232. Mr. Lord calls my attention to a letter written March 9, 1830, by G. O. Verplanck to Washington Allston: "But does our ante-revolutionary history present no subject? The 'Landing of the Pilgrims,' a threadbare subject in some respects, has never been viewed with a poet's and painter's eye." On March 29th Allston replied: "To the first subject you propose, 'The Landing of the Pilgrims' (not unpicturesque), I have a personal objection. It has already been painted by an old friend of mine, Colonel Sargent, a high-minded, honorable man, to whom I would on no account give pain; which I could not avoid doing were I to encroach on what, at the expense of

ties connected with the manners and persons of the time. At proper intervals several Odes and Songs, written for this occasion, were sung with the spirit which inspired them, and the festival was concluded with a propriety and gladness of heart becoming the "Sons of the Pilgrims" (p. 2/4).

Among the toasts were:

4. BREWSTER, COTTON, NORTON, HIGGINSON, ELIOT,¹ and the venerable Elders of New-England: . . .

5. New-England:—Here may *Republicanism* ever be at home—*Democracy* ever be an alien. ["*Yankee Doodle.*"]

14. Our Sister Virginia:—When she changes the three-fifths² of her Ethiopian Skin, we will respect her as the head of our *white* family. ["*Go to the Devil and shake yourself.*"]

The memory of Dr. BELKNAP, the founder of this Celebration: May he be revered with the monuments of our Ancestors, and live in the virtues of their Sons.

*Volunteer by Judge PAINE.*³

Great-Britain: May that Nation, which stood the Friend of Liberty when Liberty had no other Friend among the Nations, be refined and confirmed, and remain the JACHIN, while the *United States of America* stands the BOAZ, of True Political and Social Liberty, until Sun and Moon shall be no more (p. 2/4).

This account was the cause of great hilarity among the Democrats. One critic remarked:

THE *Toasts* given at *Vila's* are worthy a serious notice, but as there are so many *degenerate* Sons of our worthy Forefathers, we could not expect a more decent collection.—The only one which we now

several years' labor, he has a fair right to consider as his ground. I do not like rivalry in any shape, and my picture on the same subject would seem like it" (J. B. Flagg's *Life and Letters of W. Allston*, pp. 235, 236).

¹ Elder William Brewster of Plymouth; Rev. John Cotton, Rev. John Norton of Boston; Rev. Francis Higginson of Salem; Rev. John Eliot, the Apostle to the Indians.

² The framers of the Constitution avoided the use of the word slaves. Hence Article i, section 2, reads: "Representatives and direct Taxes shall be apportioned among the several States which may be included within this Union, according to their respective Numbers, which shall be determined by adding to the Number of Free Persons, including those bound to Service for a Term of Years, and excluding Indians not taxed, three fifths of all other Persons."

³ Robert Treat Paine, the Signer: cf. p. 326 note 2, above.

particularly notice, is JUDGE PAINE'S; what the old man means is somewhat difficult to explain; his BOAZ and JACHIN is a new species of Federal nonsense. At the next meeting, we expect he will give *Gog and Magog*.¹

He concluded by asking "whether it is decent" for a man holding an office worth from ten to fifteen thousand dollars a year to associate with those who throw odium on the President. Another writer said:

It is asked whether Judge PAINE is a *Jew* or a *Christian*? One would suppose neither; unless it can be proved that Jews and Christians may drink *profane* TOASTS at Bacchanalian revels. — To introduce Scripture allusions at a carousal, is a new thing under the sun. But we will not say what the intellectual condition of the learned judge was, after he had voluntarily borne his part of *eighty* bumpers in honour of our pious & venerable Forefathers!²

"Plymouth Rock" declared that —

THE Federal troops seem to be totally disbanded; and the "GRAND KING," with all his subalterns, are crying out to the champions of their cause, to appear on the parade of the newspapers. The scribblers in these several papers, are charged with tardiness; they are called on to rally, and bring into the field all their ammunition. Even STEPHEN, the *Shell-President*, the man whom they describe as the most powerful antagonist, seems to betake himself to the back-ground, and, coward like, entices an Old Man to expose his folly, in the uncouth dialect of Jewish phraseology. *Stephen* has long been an old "Rat," he smells the *trap* as well as the *cheese*, and generally adopts some cunning artifice, when he intends to spring it; but who would think that he should persuade an *old fox* to his purpose, or should be so artful as to make an old man lug into Vila's two such heavy pillars as *Jachin and Boaz*? . . . Stephen, . . . if the old Judge was really under the pressure of *Jachin and Boaz*, or the whole *Porch of the Temple*, . . . would not have put forth his *little finger* to relieve him; but would let him "*Go to the Devil and shake himself!*"³

"MUST private character," asked "Spintext," "be constantly lacerated by the forked tongue of the envenomed slanderer?" Then, remarking upon the persons present, he continued:

¹ Independent Chronicle, December 27, 1802, p. 3/1.

² Ibid. January 6, 1803, p. 1/4.

³ Ibid. January 6, 1803, p. 2/1.

The officers of CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY. These are the men to teach the "young ideas how to shoot" — to fan into life, the expiring spark of ambition — and to blow the coal of genius into a flame. . . . Was it to inculcate such illiberal principles, that our enlightened Ancestors planted the tree of life in Cambridge? — Would they have nurtured and fostered the tree, if they had been apprehensive of such fruit? — What will be the sensations and reflections of those southern Gentlemen, who have placed their children under the instructions of such men? — Will they feel obliged, when they read, that their enlightened Instructors were regaled at this mock feast of the Pilgrims? — and, with federal devotion and savage glee, drank a full glass to the damnation of more than eight hundred thousand souls! — "Father, forgive them, for they know not what they do."¹

"Cotton Mather" made the following —

Observations on a late Toast at the Feast of Shells.

IT would be matter of curiosity, if we could have the names of the Sons of the Pilgrims who celebrated at Vila's the emancipation of our Forefathers from the British house of bondage; we could then form some idea of Judge Paine's *Jachin and Boaz*. . . . If the Judge did not mean to confine his idea solely to the Pilgrims present, but intended to embrace *Great-Britain* as the great *Ally of America*, in support of the *Liberty* of the world; yet even this sentiment must be foreign from the intentions of Solomon; . . .

The whole proceeding of the late *Feast* seems a jumble of inconsistencies; the Toasts are made up of a farrago of nonsense and impropriety. The Constitution of the United States, or the respective States, are not even mentioned; we can't say these persons are in favor of either by what they declare; they seem only intent to the elevation of particular men, and these are so strangely connected and designated as to shew the folly of the *Baccanalian Pilgrims*: — . . . The whole proceeding discovers a paltry attempt to deceive the public in the political views of the *Lacôites* by leading *honest Pilgrims* from the right road.² . . .

But the most ludicrous part of the whole business commences at the moment when they give "*The State of Virginia*:" — This ancient State,

¹ National Ægis, quoted in the Independent Chronicle of January 27, 1803, p. 2/1.

² An allusion to the Writings of Laco, attacking John Hancock, attributed to Stephen Higginson. They appeared in the Massachusetts Centinel in February and March, 1789, and were reprinted in a pamphlet in the same year.

the birth-place of WASHINGTON, is stigmatized with every degrading epithet, and to top the climax, it is accompanied by the tune of "*Go to the Devil and shake yourself!*" This is a pretty ditty for the Sons of our pious Forefathers: — what an appearance must Gen. Lincoln & Judge Paine, in company with Stephen Higginson, Fisher Ames, Timothy Pickering, Dr. Parker,¹ the *Reverend* Mr. John Gardner,² &c. &c. make, while attentively listening to the music of *Go to the Devil and shake yourself?* . . . What a figure must these *pious* Pilgrims make, while listening to a tune, the appellation of which strikes every man of morality with disgust and horror? . . .³

In 1803 Stephen Higginson again presided, while Peleg Coffin, Martin Brimmer, and William Tudor were vice-presidents. Among the toasts were the memories of Brewster, Cotton, Norton, Higginson, and Eliot, "the five burning and shining lights in 'golden candlesticks' in the early churches of *New-England*;" and "*Louisiana* — a country without patriots — May our *Patriots without a country* occupy what *they have bought*, and leave us to enjoy what *we have inherited*."⁴ A satirical poem was printed in the *Independent Chronicle*, of which a few lines follow:

The modern Clam-Eaters.

THE *Pilgrim's Sons* who dwell on earth,
 God knows from *whom* they claim their birth;
 On some pretence, as rumour tells,
 Each year renew their *feast of shells*,
 At faction-hall, where *tories* meet,
 Apostate *whigs* and *priests* to greet; — . . .
 For there the living act their part,
 And lay the bottle close to heart.
 Whilst clams and oysters round are spread,
 And wine to rouse some drooping head.
 Old Stephen mounted in the chair
 Of *federal feasts and toasts* lord mayor,
 Proclaims again their cause of meeting
 Once more his brother *tories* greeting.⁵

¹ Rev. Samuel Parker, rector of Trinity Church, later Bishop.

² Rev. John Sylvester John Gardiner, then assistant of Dr. Parker at Trinity Church.

³ *Independent Chronicle*, December 30, 1802, pp. 1-2.

⁴ *New England Palladium*, December 27, 1803, p. 1/5.

⁵ January 9, 1804, p. 4/1. In the same paper of December 26, 1803, a writer remarked (p. 2/4):

In 1804 Stephen Higginson once more presided, Christopher Gore, Peleg Coffin, and William Tudor acting as vice-presidents. The hall was decorated with portraits of Winthrop, Endicott, Higginson, Bradstreet, and Rogers, and with busts of Washington and Hamilton. One account reads:

LANDING OF THE FATHERS.

The 184th anniversary of the landing of the first settlers of *New-England*, was celebrated on *Saturday* last, in this town, by a numerous company, who dined together, in the usual appropriate style, at *Concert-Hall*. About 35 years since, this anniversary began to be celebrated, by the Inhabitants of *Plymouth*, where the first settlement in *New-England* was effected in 1620. In 1797, it was first noticed in this town, by a small company, of whom the late Dr. *Bellknapp* was one. Since that time, it has been annually observed, by increased numbers. The recent enlargement of the *Hall*, afforded accommodation to a larger collection, the present year, than had ever before assembled on a similar occasion. Nearly two hundred gentlemen partook of the entertainment, among whom were many of the Clergy of the Town and Vicinity, Officers of the University, the President of the Senate, and several other respectable guests. . . . Sentiment and Song enlivened the feast; and appropriate music accompanied the *Toasts*, a copy of which we have procured. . . .

3. *The New-England Minority* — Like true *Puritans*, not intimidated, though involved in the "sin and danger of *Non-conformity*."

16. *The memory of Lady Arabella Johnson*, and all the *primitive Dames of New-England*, who cheered the toils of the *Pilgrims*, and participated in the hardships of their *arduous enterprise*.

Louisiana — A country of *golden dreams* and *leaden realities*.

The memory of Dr. *BELEKNAP* — The American *Plutarch*; the distinguished Biographer of the *PILGRIMS*.¹ . . .

AMONG the guests who attended the feast of shells are said to be, the judges of the Supreme Court! — *Quere*, if they can find time to attend at *Vila's*, why cannot they fulfil the duties of their office? . . . Oh! the rare sons of the pilgrims! *eating* and *carousing* to celebrate the *hardships*, *toils*, and *dangers* of their forefathers! *CARVER* and *STANDISH*, we believe, were more respected by these *young pilgrims* for their appropriate names to a dissected *wild fowle*, and a *haunch of venison* than for their political principles. . . .

¹ The two volumes of *Bellknapp's American Biography* (1794, 1798) contain the lives of many early explorers and settlers, among the latter *Carver*, *Bradford*, *Brewster*, *Cushman*, *Winslow*, *Standish*, *John Winthrop*, and *John Winthrop, Jr.*

The pleasures of the feast were greatly enhanced by a number of excellent songs and catches by Mr. *Shaw* professor of music, and Messrs. *Fox* and *Bernard* of the Theatre.¹

¹ Gilbert Fox and John Bernard, the noted English actor. The latter had made his first appearance in Boston a year before, as appears from an advertisement in the *Columbian Centinel* of November 5, 1805:

On Monday Evening, Nov. 7, will be presented for the first time these four years, a Play in 3 acts, (interspersed with Singing,) called, *The Battle of Hexham*; — or *Days of Old*. Written by *Colman*, the Younger. Gondibert, Mr. Bar-ratt; Gregory Gubbins, Mr. Bernard; (his first appearance in *Boston*) From the Theatres of *Philadelphia* and *Baltimore* (p. 3/1).

Of the twelve who formed the Old Colony Club in 1769, five were graduates of Harvard College: Oakes Angier, 1764; John Thomas and Edward Winslow, Jr., 1765; John Watson, 1766; and Alexander Scammell, 1769. Plays were acted by the students, sometimes with the sanction of the college authorities, as early as 1758 (*Nation*, March 19, 1914, xviii. 295); and some if not all of the above five may well have taken part in them. At all events, though the Boston Theatre was first opened on February 3, 1794, it is interesting to note that on February 8, 1770, "This evening was read at the Hall the 'Provoked Husband,' a comedy, by M^r M. A. Warwel, to a company of about forty gentlemen and ladies, by invitation of the Club" (*Records*, p. 407). Among the guests of the Club present on July 29 and August 5, 1772, was Joseph Crowell, "a shop-keeper in Plymouth" (*Records*, pp. 430-431, 431 note). In later years Crowell wrote a play entitled: "A New World Planted; or, the Adventures of the Forefathers of New-England; who landed in Plymouth, December 22, 1620. An Historical Drama — in Five Acts. By Joseph Crowell. Boston: . . . 1802." A notice in the *Boston Weekly Magazine* of Saturday, December 18, states that "On Monday next, will be published . . . an Historical Drama, . . . By Joseph Crowell" (i. 31). The play, which is the earliest known to me on the subject of the Pilgrims, deals chiefly with the conspiracy of John Lyford and John Oldham; but among the characters are Pocahonte, a daughter of Massasoit, and "Hampden, a young gentleman, who came to view the country, in love with Pocahonte." So far as I am aware, Crowell's play was never acted.

It was stated in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 21, 1808, that "A new Melo Drama, entitled 'The Pilgrims,' is in rehearsal, and will speedily be brought forward" (p. 3/3) at the Boston Theatre. It was given on December 23d, 1808; on December 26th "for the second time;" and on January 2, 1809, "for the 3d and last time this season . . . (with alterations)." Among the Indians are Massasoit, Squanto, Samoset, Chickatawbut, and "Yankee, an Indian Woman;" and among the "English Pilgrims" are Governor Carver, Capt. Standish, "Boat-swain Blunder," Mr. Winslow, Mr. Cushman, and Juliana. Also, the "Genius of Columbia." Among the performers who played "Other Pilgrims" occurs the name of "Mrs Poe," who, seventeen days after the last performance, became the mother of Edgar Allan Poe. I have been unable to ascertain who the author of this play was, or whether it was ever published. The following description is taken from a copy of the play-bill owned by the Boston Public Library:

It will appear strange to many, that a festival originating in a grateful sense of the virtues of our forefathers, and a desire to perpetuate their memories, should not escape the malignity of democratic opposi-

The Pilgrims, a new Melo Drama, never performed.

On FRIDAY EVENING, DEC. 23, 1808,

Will be presented, Tobin's celebrated Play, in 3 Acts, called the

CURFEW:

OR, THE DANISH BANDITTI.

.

*To which will be added, a new Melo Drama, written by a gentleman of Boston,
in 3 acts, called*

THE PILGRIMS,

Or, the LANDING of our FOREFATHERS at

PLYMOUTH ROCK.

.

In the course of the Melo Drama, the following Scenery, Incidents, &c.

- A View of the Rock and Plymouth Bay, and the landing of the Pilgrims. The whole scene represents Winter, with a snow storm. After returning thanks to Heaven for their safe arrival, Carver orders one of the Pilgrims to cut on the Rock, DECEMBER 22d, 1620, the day of their landing.
- An alarm of Indians; the Pilgrims place themselves in an attitude of defence; Squanto and Samoset enter, and by the friendly disposition of the former, an arrangement is made; the Indians are loaded with presents and depart well satisfied.
- A comic scene between an Irish Boatswain and an Indian Woman. The perilous situation of Juliana through the treachery of one of the Pilgrims. The act concludes with a GLEE and CHORUS.
- In act II — Scene 1st Represents, several half finished Houses, at the end the Store House, with the Standard fixed — a shell sounds to announce the arrival of Massasoit. A Grand INDIAN MARCH. A Treaty of Peace and Amity made and confirmed between Carver and Massasoit. The treachery of Samoset, who attempts to carry off the person of Juliana. She struggles and seizes his Tomahawk and pursues him — he implores her pardon — which she grants — he wrests the Tomahawk from her and aims a dreadful blow, when Winslow rushes in to her rescue — his gun misses fire — he draws his sword and a combat ensues — in the mean time Juliana takes the gun and fires at Samoset without effect — Winslow is wounded, and Samoset pursues Juliana — who is seen ascending a rock — she reaches the summit, and as Samoset is following, she strikes him with the fuzee, and he falls headlong down the precipice. Juliana is at length rescued by Massasoit.

tion. But so it is. The feast of the Sons of the Pilgrims is detested by the ranting Innovators of the present day, and the very mention of the habits and principles of those, to whom we owe many of our best institutions is *a rock of offence*.¹

The following satirical piece appeared in the Independent Chronicle of December 27, 1804 (p. 2):

THE PILGRIMS — *A DREAM*.

IN consequence of the parade that is made previously to this mock-celebration, by our *eating Aristocracy*, I was induced to reflect upon the subject, and was lamenting that such a solemn, providential and virtuous occurrence as that of the landing of our forefathers, at Plymouth, should be thus satirized and rendered into burlesque, by men who neither possess their principles of pious thought nor liberal action; who would rather welcome a British tyrant to our shores, than retreat here from one. In this state of rumination and regret, I fell asleep; and, methought I was translated to the *Concert-Hall*, where a great number of well-fed, well-dressed *Pilgrims*, who had never endured penance beyond a drunken head-ache, were walking about with some impatience, looking at their gold watches, and demanding the dinner forthwith. At length the folding-doors of this magnificent banquet room were thrown open, and the perspiring cooks entered, with all the rarities of the season. . . .

At the upper end of the room was written, in letters of gold,

Eamus quo ducit gula, peregrini!

and at the lower end was inscribed,

“’Tis merry in the hall,
“When chins wag all.”

THE INDIAN METHOD OF LYING IN AMBUSH.

And the act concludes with a Procession of Indians, carrying Winslow and Juliana on their boughs.

In act 3, The Indians preparing to sacrifice one of the Pilgrims. Scene 2d, *A dreadful Combat with Clubs and Shields, between Samoset and Squanto.*

Scene last — A View of an Indian Encampment. A Marriage and Nuptial Dance.

AFTER WHICH,

The Genius of Columbia descends in a Magnificent Temple, surrounded with Clouds.

¹ New England Palladium, December 25, 1804, p. 2/5; Columbian Centinel, December 26, 1804, pp. 1-2.

I observed that the company attempted to eat their soup, at first, with cockle shells, (*a la Palerin*) but his honor, the moderator, having spilled some fat broth on a new pair of black satin breeches, he called for spoons, and the antique fashion was abandoned. . . . When they filled a bumper to the memory of our oppressed but honored forefathers, I observed that some quizzing Pilgrims leered in derision, while they gulphed down the votive potation!

When the cloth was removed, the presiding actor at the serio-tragic comic, annual farce, called on Pilgrim *Ben* for a sentiment; who archly gave, "in gaining a pint, may we never lose a gallon." — Some of the party began to murmur at this idea, as a sarcasm, retrospectively levelled at the recent misfortune of the *Aristocracy*. At length order was restored, by the president calling for the following annual commemorative song or hymn: —

The PILGRIMS *in* MASQUERADE,

OR

FEDERALISM *in* the SUDS!

IN penance for *past folly*,

We Pilgrims, melancholly,

Get drunk to make us jolly,

And laugh at Liberty!

Th' *Electoral Ticket* fails us,

Abhorrent Truth assails us;

Now what the Devil ails us,

Is known 'twixt you and me! . . .

Nor did the fact that the celebration this year occurred on a Saturday escape the notice of the Democrats, as appears from two criticisms:

Forefathers. — In celebrating the arrival of our forefathers, it is proper, not only that their political, but religious principles should be venerated. — *Quere*, whether our pious ancestors spent their Saturday evenings in a bacchanalian repast, and trespassed on the solemnities of the Sabbath, by jocular songs, and other demonstrations of irreligion. — But this is *modern religion* under the sanction of federalism.¹

Say, ye Priests, ye ministers of the pure, peaceable, and holy religion of Jesus, how can you mingle, in the laugh of revenge, the toasts of slander, and the song of personal contempt, on a Saturday evening, and bend with confidence over the board of devotion on the day following!²

¹ Independent Chronicle, December 24, 1804, p. 3/1.

² Ibid. December 27, 1804, p. 2/4. Cf. p. 301 note 1, above.

In 1805 the day was celebrated on December 21st, as the 22d fell on Sunday. "Among the gentlemen present," we read, "were the descendants of BRADFORD, WINSLOW, BREWSTER, STANDISH, WINTHROP and HIGGINSON, the most prominent characters among those who established the oldest colony in this part of *America*;" but neither their names nor those of the presiding officers were printed in the newspapers.¹

The Independent Chronicle of December 26 remarked:

ANNIVERSARY.

It has been announced in our papers, that a number of the "*most respectable*" gentlemen celebrated the anniversary of the landing of our forefathers at Plymouth. Who these *most respectable* characters are, we are not told. . . . The toasts on this occasion are a kind of enigmatical declaration of political principles, which would puzzle any man to comprehend. Their volunteers are not promulgated; being, it is supposed, either too absurd for perusal in a *cool moment*, or too *high seasoned* for the *present taste* of the public. We understand, however, that the favorite song of "*Rule Britannia*," was sung among the sons of the pilgrims; in honor, no doubt, of the late "glorious victory,"² which enables the British navy to extend its sovereignty over the ocean. . . . How a merchant³ could sit with composure to hear a song in praise of a nation which had interdicted almost the whole commerce of this country, is as remarkable as any narrative we could find in Mather's *Magnalia*. How wonderfully profound must these "wise men of the east" have appeared. A lawyer on one side, a priest on the other, and a merchant on the centre, all joining a chorus — "*Rule Britannia, Britannia rules the waves!*" . . . Callipee and callipash, clams and oysters, succatouch and pumpkin puddings, turkies, ducks, chickens, beef, venison, meat pies, custards, and other *sweet meats*; the whole *interlaid* and *dove tailed* with cider, punch, wine, brandy, and other *mouth waters*, forming a salutary repast most grateful to the delicate stomachs of jovial pilgrims in honor of their ancestors.

How would a Higginson, Broadstreet, Bradford, Winslow, Brewster, Standish, or a Winthrop, have looked, after partaking of such a ponderous meal as these "most respectable" gentlemen carried away under their jackets on Saturday night last! Our worthy forefathers would

¹ Columbian Centinel, December 25, 1805, p. 2/3.

² Battle of Trafalgar, October 21, 1805.

³ Perhaps an allusion to Stephen Higginson.

not have been able to stagger under such a load, especially if some of them had to preach on the next day. *Alack a-day*, (some of their parishioners would cry) our parson looks as if he had been a *husking!*

It is understood, however, that the song was not generally applauded, though some who ought to imbibe the spirit of their ancestors were more elated than others of their brother pilgrims (p. 3/1).

Under the signature of "Agricola" appeared in the Independent Chronicle of January 2, 1806 (pp. 1-2), the following —

Reflections on a late Feast of Shells in Boston.

. . . Some years ago, a number of persons, who had been engaged in the toils, dangers and anxieties of the revolution, proposed to celebrate, annually, the origin of our country, and to honor the memory of the men, who fled to these shores to secure their natural, civil & religious rights. In honor to the ancestors of the country, who were fed with clams, and other bounties of the sea, they called it a *feast of shells*. There were no parties in politics or religion among them; but all was love, peace, and harmony. No offensive or abusive toasts were given, no irritating, obscene or lascivious song was heard; but a cheerful, and dignified gravity, adorned the priest and the people, while decent sacrifices were offered, and the libations of temperance and chaste propriety were poured at the passover of New England. . . .

The terrible party, united under the auspices of colonel Hamilton, held all the ideas of republicanism in derision; . . . He died in the field of murder, in a duel, yet his party, the party at the late feast of shells, celebrate his character, and his praises have even tinged the forms of public devotion with the pollution of guilt.

This party have crowded themselves into every public place, where impudence can remove the bars of decency and patriotism; and having gained the seats at the feast of shells; having polluted the anniversary, with the principles of monarchy,¹ and having served up the leeks, the onions, and the flesh pots of Egypt, on the alter of the New England passover — the men who love the principles of our ancestors, retired from their noisy uproar, and do not appear at the irregular Jubilee.

But as these men have published their toasts to the world, and have

¹ "Q. What is the chief end of Federalism? A. Federalism's chief end is to glorify the Pope and enjoy him in a free land" (The Federal Catechism Metamorphosed: or, the Natural Spirit of Federalism Exposed, from the Works of their Federal Holiness, '1805, p. 3. On the same page is an allusion to "the reign of John Adams").

had the audacity to call themselves the principal men of the town of Boston, their indecency of conduct merits some serious remarks. . . .

This renders it necessary, that the public should know who those heroes of the bottle are, that have the confidence to call themselves the principal men of the town of Boston. Were there any senators, counselors, or representatives there? . . . Were ministers of religion there? if they were, let it be known. Did they smile on the obscene song, or join in the chorus of *Brittania rule the waves?* . . .

Besides this, while we are contending for the important and enriching privileges of national neutrality, what will other nations conceive of us, when they shall read in our gazettes, that the principal men of Boston, at a public feast, openly, in the noise of the loud chorus, and in the riotous huzza of the pointed toast, appeared to be already inlisted on one side of the belligerent powers, had realed, by political inclination, over the line of neutrality, and avowed themselves the decided, though intoxicated, volunteers of one party in the European war? . . .

To this a Federalist replied:

MR. RUSSELL,

THE toasts given at the last "*Feast of Shells,*" in this town, which the *Chronicle* first found innocent or, at worst, enigmatical, are now pronounced, by an infuriated "AGRICOLA," to be *sedition, a profanation of the principles and characters of our ancestors,* "an abuse of our happy constitutions and of those who formed and are determined to maintain them."

Such wanton perversion of language, such malignant and unqualified calumny of good citizens and respectable men, can only proceed from the pen of an occasional contributor to the *Chronicle*, whose delirious effusions exhibit a melancholy picture of human extravagance and folly; and who generally interlards his miserable productions with an affected parade of historical learning, of which he knows little;—and with scraps of Latin, of which he knows *nothing.* . . .

"AGRICOLA" makes a clamorous call for the names of those who so audaciously dined together on this occasion, and seems solicitous to have the *Bill of Fare.* He knows, or ought to know, that being charged with the high crimes of *sedition* and *rebellion,* they are not bound to furnish evidence against themselves. As to their bill of fare, they do not apprehend that they could be endangered by giving it, in all its variety; but in a case so critical, it is discreet to be silent.¹ . . .

¹ *Columbian Centinel*, January 4, 1806, p. 2/4.

The writer's refusal to divulge the names of those present seems to indicate some uneasiness of mind. At all events, the Boston celebrations reached their height in 1804, and the vigorous attacks on those who managed the festival in 1805 had their effect, for, though the celebrations were continued for a few years, they lost their political significance and soon ceased altogether.¹ It is worth noting that at none of these Feasts of Shells was there a discourse, nor does it appear that there were ever any speeches. But in 1813 the day was celebrated by the Massachusetts Historical Society in a formal manner, a notice of which will bring to a close these accounts of Boston celebrations:

Commemoration of the Landing of the Fathers.

WE are happy to hear that this interesting anniversary is about to be celebrated by the *Massachusetts Historical Society*, in a manner appropriate to the occasion and worthy of this highly valuable institution. At *eleven o'clock*, *THIS DAY*, the Hon. JOHN DAVIS, will deliver an ORATION before the Society, in the Stone Chapel; and the Rev. Dr. FREEMAN and Dr. HOLMES will perform suitable religious services. It will be, doubtless, a scene, which the taste and refinement of this metropolis will delight to witness. — And notwithstanding the usual obtrusive modes of attracting public notice have been omitted by the Society, the interest of the occasion and the rank and genius of the speaker will, unquestionably, assemble a large and discriminating audience. We understand that the doors will be opened for ladies at 10 o'clock.²

¹ In 1806 the celebration was duly recorded in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 24, p. 2/3. The same paper of December 19, 1807, contented itself with remarking that "The anniversary will also be noticed in this town by the Descendants of the Pilgrim fathers" (p. 2/3). There is no notice of a celebration in 1808. The *Centinel* of December 27, 1809, merely stated that "The above anniversary was respectfully noticed by a number of the Sons of the Pilgrims, in this town: — who partook of an excellent dinner in the *Exchange Coffee-House*" (p. 2/3). This was apparently the last of the Boston celebrations, except that in 1813. The following advertisement appeared in the *Columbian Centinel* of December 22, 1824:

LANDING of the PILGRIMS.

THE *Columbian and City-Museum*, Common-street, (late Tremont) will be brilliantly illuminated in good style, in commemoration of this Anniversary, *THIS EVENING*. Music on different Instruments (p. 3/4).

² *Columbian Centinel*, December 22, 1813, p. 2/4. A proposal to make the anniversary permanent failed (1 *Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society*,

Of the celebrations that occurred elsewhere than at Plymouth or Boston, one only need be mentioned — that at New York on December 22, 1805. It was thus described:

CONTRAST.

[*We present the following account of the proceedings of the Sons of the Pilgrims, in New York, as a just satire on those of this town.*]

On Saturday last the members of the "*New England Society*," in this city, celebrated the 185th Anniversary of the landing of their forefathers at Plymouth. An elegant dinner was prepared for the occasion by Mr. Lovett. The Rev. Docts. Rogers and Beach¹ performed in a devout and very appropriate manner the accustomed religious services of the table. More than 150 gentlemen of the society, forgetting all differences of party and opinion, united to celebrate the occasion with an affectionate remembrance of their common origin and in the true spirit of a society, the objects of which are *friendship, charity and mutual assistance*.

This we believe, is the first time in this state that the descendants of New England, now so extensively diffused, have joined in a public and solemn celebration of that anniversary. . . .

Among the toasts were the following:

2. New England. . . .
3. The city of Leyden. . . .
5. John Carver, first Governor of the first colony of New-England.
6. John Winthrop, the venerable founder and first Governor of Massachusetts.
7. John Smith, who gave to New-England its name, and to its inhabitants a bright example of naval skill and courage.
8. The descendants of the first settlers of *New-York* — *we respect them as our elder brethren, and may they regard us as members of their family.*
12. The President of the United States — Drank *standing*.

i. 235-236, 237, 239). Judge Davis's oration was printed in 1814 in 2 Massachusetts Historical Collections, vol. i. pp. i-xxxi; and also separately with the following title: "A Discourse before the Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston, December 22, 1813. At their anniversary commemoration of the first Landing of our Ancestors at Plymouth, in 1620 . . . Boston: . . . 1814."

¹ Probably Rev. William Rogers (1751-1824), and Rev. Abraham Beach (1740-1823).

It is further stated that "the toasts were interspersed with many excellent Songs," one of which "had been composed at a few hours' notice" by Thomas Green Fessenden.¹

In the discourses delivered at Plymouth and in the accounts of the celebrations held there from 1769 to 1798, both included, the words "ancestors," "ancestry," "fathers," and "forefathers" frequently occur, but neither Pilgrim nor Pilgrim Fathers. These terms were first recorded, in 1798 and 1799 respectively, not at Plymouth, where one would naturally expect to find them, but in Boston. It is a reasonable conjecture, however, that they were in colloquial use before they found their way into print; and it seems fair to assume that they arose at Plymouth somewhere between 1793 and 1798.²

¹ Independent Chronicle, January 2, 1806, p. 2/1. The New England Society of Charleston was founded January 6, 1819, and incorporated December 20, 1820; and discourses were annually delivered from 1819 to 1835, both included (p. 61 of "An Oration delivered on the anniversary of the New-England Society, Charleston, S. C. December 22. 1835; in commemoration of the Landing of the Pilgrims upon the Rock of Plymouth, December 22d. 1620. By Joshua Barker Whitridge, A.M., M.D. . . . Charleston: . . . 1836.") Apparently the third New England Society to be formed outside of New England was that in Philadelphia. (Discourse before the Society of the Sons of New England of the City and County of Philadelphia, on the History of the early settlement of their country; being their first anniversary. Delivered December 21, 1844, by their President, Samuel Breck. Philadelphia: . . . 1845.) The "Address delivered before the New England Society of Michigan, December 22, 1848," by Lewis Cass, was printed at Detroit in 1849. The "Address delivered before the New England Society of San Francisco, at the American Theatre, on the twenty-second day of December, A. D. 1852. By Rev. T. Dwight Hunt. Pastor of the New England Church," was printed at San Francisco in 1853.

² Though not recorded at Plymouth until 1800, it is possible that the word Pilgrim was employed in the "spirited song composed by B. Seymour" in 1797 (p. 308, above), which does not appear to have been printed. Previous to 1798, apparently the only poems written for these occasions were those by A. Scammell in 1770 (p. 301, above), by J. Davis in 1794 (p. 306, above), and by B. Seymour in 1797. A poem entitled "*Thanksgiving Hymn. Deo Optim. Maxim. Composed for December 11th,*" and dated "Boston, December, 1783," was printed in the Boston Magazine for December, 1783, i. 70-71. Poems on the subject of the Pilgrims will be found in Thacher's History of the Town of Plymouth (pp. 373-382 of the 1832 edition, pp. 341-352 of the 1835 edition); in *Airs of the Pilgrims*, appended to W. S. Russell's Guide to Plymouth (1846); and in *Zilpha H. Spooner's Poems of the Pilgrims* (1881). The most famous of these poems is of course that written by Mrs. Hemans, about which Moncure D. Conway related the following anecdote in his Autobiography (1904):

ORIGIN OF THE TERM

We have seen that, as applied specifically to the early settlers at Plymouth, Pilgrim first appeared in 1798 and Pilgrim Fathers in 1799. To explain how these terms came to be so used, we must glance back one hundred and seventy-eight years. But before doing so, let us consider the words *pilgrim* and *peregrine*. The former, derived from the Latin *peregrinum*, "one that comes from foreign parts, a stranger," has, with its derivatives, been employed in English literature for over seven centuries in various senses, but chiefly in the following five. (1) "One who travels from place to place; a person on a journey; a wayfarer, a traveller; a wanderer; a sojourner," found as early as about 1200.¹ (2) "One who journeys (usually a long distance) to some sacred place, as an act of religious devotion; one who makes a pilgrimage," found as early as about 1225. (3) "Figuratively, chiefly in allegorical religious uses," found as early as about 1225. (4) In American history, as discussed in this paper.² (5) "An original settler; a new-comer, a recent immigrant."³ The word *peregrine*, derived from the Latin *peregrinus*,

"When the elder Channing visited Europe he went to see Mrs. Hemans, whose poems were popular in America, in her home near Windermere. He spoke of her hymn on 'The Landing of the Pilgrim Fathers in New England,' and told her that he had heard it sung by a great multitude on the spot where the Pilgrims landed. But when, in answer to her questions, he was compelled to inform her that the coast described in her hymn as 'stern and rock-bound' was without any rocks, she burst into tears" (i. 161). The following advertisement was printed in the Columbian Centinel of December 20, 1826 (p. 3/4):

PILGRIM FATHERS.

A SONG written by Mrs. HEMANS, and set to Music by her sister, Miss BROWNE—is This Day published by C. BRADLEE, and for sale by S. H. PARKER, 164, Washington-street.

The profits arising from the sale of the above will be appropriated for the benefit of the author, Mrs. Hemans.

¹ These definitions, and the dates of early use, are taken (except in sense 4) from the Oxford English Dictionary.

² The present investigation was undertaken for the Dictionary at the request of Sir James Murray in 1905. At the meeting held in December of that year, the tentative results then reached were placed before the Society (Publications, x. 180).

³ Marked "*U. S. and Colonial*," the two earliest extracts (1851, 1865) being from New Zealand sources. The third extract is the following from L. Swin-

has been employed, with its derivatives, in meanings similar to those of *pilgrim*, for over five centuries. In particular we should note the

burne's article on The Bucolic Dialect of the Plains in Scribner's Magazine for October, 1887:

"Pilgrim" and "tenderfoot" were formerly applied almost exclusively to newly imported cattle, but by a natural transference they are usually used to designate all new-comers, tourists and business-men (ii. 508).

This is putting the cart before the horse as regards pilgrim certainly, and probably as regards tenderfoot also. At all events, the example is a belated one, and so a few other extracts are cited. In 1841 the Rev. William L. McCalla probably meant by the word a wanderer, but as his use of the word is the earliest known to me in the West, I give his sentence:

After such an address from a citizen of that calumniated country [Texas] to a shattered old pilgrim, I took the liberty of withdrawing to another apartment, to enjoy in secret the luxury of weeping, and communing with home and with heaven (Adventures in Texas, p. 46).

In 1852 Captain Howard Stansbury, speaking of Salt Lake City, but not referring to the Mormons in particular, wrote:

The studding, therefore, of this beautiful city with noble trees, will render it, by contrast with the surrounding regions, a second "Diamond of the Desert," in whose welcome shade, like the solitary Sir Kenneth and the princely Hderim, the pilgrim, wayworn and faint, may repose his jaded limbs and dream of the purling brooks and waving woodlands he has left a thousand miles behind him (Exploration and Survey of the Valley of the Great Salt Lake of Utah, p. 129).

In a letter dated Fort Kearney, Nebraska Territory, June 11, 1866, Col. James F. Meline said he had "ascertained from the officer on duty there that since May 15, emigrant trains have gone west from Kearney City at the rate of eighty wagons and one hundred and sixty people (men, women, and children) per day," and inserted "an extract from the Kearney City paper giving the departures for two days," June 5 and 6. This is headed "LIST OF FREIGHTERS' AND PILGRIMS' TRAINS ORGANIZED AT AND PASSING WEST OF KEARNEY." Meline adds this note:

The term Pilgrims for emigrants first came into use at the period of the heavy Mormon travel — the Mormons styling themselves "Pilgrims to the promised land of Utah." The word has been retained on the Plains, and applied indiscriminately to all emigrants (Two Thousand Miles on Horseback, Santa Fé and Back, 1867, p. 22 and note).

In 1869 Dr. Ferdinand V. Hayden wrote:

During the gold excitement in the San Juan Mountains, west of the Rio Grade del Norte, in 1862, a large number of miners, or, as they were called in those days, "pilgrims," crossed the Sangre de Christo Pass, and camped for rest after a long journey from Idaho, Montana, and Northern Colorado, on Placiere

way in which these words have been employed in the Bible, especially in St. Paul's Epistle to the Hebrews. In the Geneva version Creek (Preliminary Field Report of the United States Geological Survey of Colorado and New Mexico, p. 73).

In 1873 the Rev. James D. Butler remarked:

Many pioneers leave their families in the old home, until they have prepared the new ones. Few can leave their farms and go for them, but westward trains are full of wives carrying children to their husbands. Sixteen babies have been counted in a single car on this pilgrimage — Japhets in search of their Fathers (Nebraska: its Characteristics and Prospects, p. 17).

In a letter to the writer dated Unity, Montana, December 27, 1905, Mr. C. W. Cook said:

In 1868 I was interested in placer mining in Diamond City, at that time quite a noted mining camp. A gentleman from Chicago spent a few days with me. He was quite an extensive traveler and a writer of some standing. To him I expressed a great desire to explore the upper valley of the Yellowstone. It seemed to interest him as something new in the line of travel, and he proposed to join me. But after due deliberation I decided it was too late in the season to take a trip into unexplored mountains with a "pilgrim" not inured to hardship, so the matter was dropped.

Mention should also be made of the fact that there once existed in this country a fanatical sect called the Pilgrims. The only allusion I have found to them occurs under date of January 21, 1820, when Thomas Nuttall, then at the junction of the Arkansas and Mississippi Rivers, wrote:

Not far from this place, a few days ago were encamped, the miserable remnant of what are called the Pilgrims, a band of fanatics, originally about 60 in number. They commenced their pilgrimage from the borders of Canada, and wandered about with their wives and children through the vast wilderness of the western states, like vagabonds, without ever fixing upon any residence. They looked up to accident and charity alone for support; imposed upon themselves rigid fasts, never washed their skin, or cut or combed their hair, and like the Dunkards wore their beards. Settling nowhere, they were consequently deprived of every comfort which arises from the efforts of industry. Desertion, famine, and sickness, soon reduced their numbers, and they were every where treated with harshness and neglect, as the gypsies of modern civilized society. Passing through Ohio, Indiana, and Illinois, they at length found their way down the Mississippi to the outlet of White river and the Arkansa. Thus ever flying from society by whom they were despised, and by whom they had been punished as vagabonds, blinded by fanatic zeal, they lingered out their miserable lives in famine and wretchedness, and have now nearly all perished or disappeared. Two days after my arrival in the territory, one of them was found dead in the road which leads from the Mississippi to Arkansas. If I am correctly informed, there now exists of them only one man, three women, and two children. Two other children were taken from them in compassion for their miserable situation, and the man was but the other day seized by a boat's crew descending the river, and forcibly shaved, washed, and dressed (Journal of Travels into the Arkansa Territory, 1821, pp. 226-227).

of 1557 — and it was this version which the Mayflower passengers brought with them — Hebrews XI. 13 reads thus:

And they all dyed in faith, and receaved not the promises, but sawe them a farre of, and beleued *them*, and receaved *them* with thanckes, and confessed that they were strangers and pylgremes on the earth.¹

It was design, not chance, that gave to the first child of English parents born in New England the name of Peregrine White.²

¹ The English Hexapla (1841). It will be of interest to give, from the same source, five other versions previous to 1620:

Wiclif, 1380: bi feith alle these ben deed, whanne the biheestis weren not takun but thei behilden hem afer, and gretynge hem wel: and knowlechiden that thei weren pilgryms, & herborid men on the erthe.

Tyndale, 1534: And they all dyed in fayth and receaved not the promyses: but sawe them a farre of and beleued them and saluted them: and confessed that they were straungers and pilgremes on the erthe.

Cranmer, 1539: These all dyed accordynge to fayth, whan they had not receaved the promyses: but sawe them a farre of, and beleued them, and saluted them, and confessed, that they were straungers and pilgremes on the erthe.

Rheims, 1582: According to faith died al these, not hauing receiued the promyses, but beholding them a farre of, and saluting them, and confessing that they are pilgrimes and strangers vpon the earth.

Authorized, 1611: These all died in faith, not hauing receiued the promises, but hauing seene them afarre off, and were perswaded of *them*, and embraced *them*, and confessed that they were strangers and pilgrims on the earth.

As printed in the 1856 edition of Bradford's History (p. 59), the marginal reference to "Heb. 11" was placed in a footnote and so easily overlooked. Some writers have apparently not been aware that Bradford was quoting from the Bible. Thus John A. Goodwin, remarking that "Bradford never wrote a finer sentence than this, which ends his story of the departure," quotes the passage in the text (Pilgrim Republic, 1888, p. 49).

² "And beyond that place they were enioyned not to goe, whereupon, a Company was chosen to goe out vppon a third discoverie: whilset some were employed in this discovery, it pleased God that Mistris *White* was brought to bed of a Sonne, which was called *Peregrine*" (Mourt's Relation, 1622, p. 15). The exact date of his birth on the Mayflower is not known, but the late Dr. Dexter (in his edition of Mourt's Relation, 1865, p. 42 note) put it between December 7 and 10, 1620 (New Style). He was the son of William and Susanna (Fuller) White; was brought up by Edward Winslow, who married his mother Susanna; and died July 20, 1704. In the Massachusetts Magazine for September, 1790, appeared the following:

Newengland, for salubrity of air and temperature of climate, has been much and very justly celebrated. Frequent instances of longevity confirm this opinion. There is a woman now living in Marshfield, County of Plymouth, in the ninety fifth year of her age. Although Newengland has been settled almost an hundred and seventy years, yet she perfectly remembers *Peregrine White*, the

In 1630 Governor Bradford began to write his History of Plymouth Plantation. Referring to the departure from Leyden on July 21-31, 1620, he said:

And y^e time Being that they must depart, they were accompanied with most of their Brethren out of y^e citie, vnto a towne sundrie miles of called Delfes-Hauen wher the ship lay ready to receiue them. So they lefte y^t goodly & pleasante citie, which had been ther resting place, nere .12. years; but they knew they were pilgrimes & looked not much on those things; but lift vp their eyes to y^e heauens, their dearest cuntrie; and quieted their spirits.¹

Though Bradford's History was not published until 1856 it was well known to American historians before the disappearance of the manuscript at the Revolution, and the above passage had more than once made its appearance in print before 1798. The first time was in 1669, when Nathaniel Morton gave it as follows:

. . . and the time being come that they must depart, they were accompanied with most of their Brethren out of the City, unto a Town called *Delfs Haven*, where the Ship lay ready to receive them: so they left that goodly and pleasant City, which had been their resting place above eleven years; but they knew that they were *Pilgrims and Strangers* here below, and looked not much on these things, but lifted up their eyes to Heaven, their dearest Country, where *God hath prepared for them a City*, and therein quieted their spirits.²

first child born after the arrival of our ancestors, and has several times attended publick worship with him. This woman is now in very good health (ii. 575).

¹ History of the Plimoth Plantation (facsimile edition, 1896), p. 36; Ford's edition, i. 124. In his New England's Memorial (1669, pp. 144-145), Morton printed "Certain Verses left by the Honoured *VVilliam Bradford Esq*; . . . penned by his own hand." These begin as follows:

*F*ROM my years young in dayes of Youth,
 God did make known to me his Truth,
 And call'd me from my Native place
 For to enjoy the Means of Grace.
 In Wilderness he did me guide,
 And in strange Lands for me provide.
 In Fears and Wants, through Weal and Woe,
 As Pilgrim past I to and fro.

² New England's Memorial (1669), p. 5. In his Epistle Dedicatory "To the Right Worshipful, Thomas Prince Esq;" Morton declares that the Governor's

In 1702 Cotton Mather wrote:

After the fervent Supplications of this Day, accompanied by their affectionate Friends, they took their leave of the pleasant City, where they had been *Pilgrims* and *Strangers* now for Eleven Years.¹

If the Reader would know, how these good People fared the rest of the Melancholy *Winter*; let him know, That besides the Exercises of Religion, with other Work enough, there was the *care of the Sick* to take up no little part of their Time. 'T was a most heavy Trial of their Patience, whereto they were called the first Winter of this their *Pilgrimage*, and enough to convince them, and remind them, that they were but *Pilgrims*.²

But the Vessel rose again, and when the *Mariners* with sunk Hearts often cried out, *We sink! We sink!* The Passengers without such Distraction of Mind, even while the Water was running into their Mouths and Ears, would chearfully Shout, *Yct, Lord, thou canst save! Yct, Lord, thou canst save!* And the Lord accordingly brought them at last safe unto their *Desired Haven*: And not long after helped their Distressed Relations thither after them, where indeed they found upon almost all Accounts *a new World*, but a World in which they found that they must live like *Strangers* and *Pilgrims*.³

In 1767 Governor Hutchinson remarked:

After eleven or twelve years residence in Holland, . . . one of the congregations . . . determined to remove to America. There were many obstacles in their way and it took up several years of their pilgrimage* to make the necessary preparations for such an undertaking.

* I think I may with singular propriety call their lives a pilgrimage. Most of them left England about the year 1609, after the truce with the Spaniards, young men between 20 and 30 years of age: They spent near 12 years, strangers among the Dutch, first, at Amsterdam, afterwards, at Leyden. After having arrived to the meridian of life, the declining part was to be spent in another world, among savages, of whom every European must have received a most unfavorable if not formidable idea. *Tantum religio potuit suadere*.⁴

acceptance "shall ever oblige me to answerable returning of gratitude, and administer to me further cause of thankfulness, That God hath given me an Habitation under your just and prudent Administrations; and wish for a Succession of such as may be skilfull to lead our *Israel* in this their peregrination."

¹ Magnalia, bk. i. ch. ii. § 4, p. 6.

² Ibid. bk. i. ch. ii. § 10, p. 9.

³ Ibid. bk. ii. ch. i. § 1, p. 3.

⁴ History of Massachusetts, Boston, ii. 451-452 and note.

In 1775 the Rev. Samuel Baldwin preached from Hebrews XI. 8, and, referring to Abraham, said:

It was a hard though just command—"get thee out of thy country, and from thy kindred, and from thy father's house." He quits all his possessions, foregoes every convenience, in his native land; bids adieu to dearest relatives, when, or whither ever to return again, he knew not; all was uncertainty; he departs, not knowing whither he went: How long he must wander as a pilgrim from city to city, from one kingdom and country to another; what hardships and difficulties he must undergo, to what dangers he must be exposed, he was altogether in the dark, ignorant, and unapprized. . . .

ABRAHAM, acting agreeable to these, acquitted himself in the best manner, with honour and dignity, with the approbation of his Maker. And while he wandered about, as a pilgrim, altogether uncertain of the time of the fulfilment of the promise, there was a part for him to act, agreeable to his character, as a man of sense and reason, a servant of the most High, and the father of the church of Israel. . . .

THIS is the account given of the rise of the Fathers of this country: . . . And as the fathers viewed themselves as absolutely under the direction of providence, they held themselves obligated to attend to its calls.¹

Whether Baldwin had noted the use of Pilgrim by Morton or by Mather, it is impossible to determine; but Baldwin does not apply the term to the early settlers. That is, he does not specifically call the early settlers Pilgrims, though he does compare their condition with that of Abraham.

In his sermon preached in 1793, the Rev. Chandler Robbins, pastor of the First Church at Plymouth, stated that "although the accounts chiefly must be derived necessarily from historical facts, . . . yet, I shall bring to your view, *some* circumstances — some ancient anecdotes, which, I presume, have never yet been made public, at least, which I have never seen. I shall take them from the first book of the very ancient *records* of this church, now in my hands." These early records had been kept by Nathaniel Morton, a nephew of Governor Bradford. Robbins continued:

"And now, the trying time being come, that they must depart, (say the records) they were accompany'd by most of their brethren out of the city, into a town called *Half-Haven*, where the ship lay ready to

¹ Sermon (1776), pp. 9-11, 16, 21-22.

receive them. So they left that goodlye and pleasant city, which had been their resting-place, near twelve yeeres. But they knew they were *pilgrimes*, and looked not much on those things, but lifted up their eyes to Heaven, their dearest country, and quieted their spirits. . . ."¹

Thus, whether the term arose at Plymouth or in Boston, its pedigree can be traced back through Robbins, Hutchinson, Mather, Morton, and Bradford to the departure from Leyden in 1620. There are several cases where the origin of a term must be sought for many years before the term itself came into existence, but there cannot be many to explain which it is necessary to look back one hundred and seventy-eight years.

PROPRIETY OF APPLICATION

"The latest English traveller," wrote the Rev. Joseph Hunter of London in 1849, referring to Sir Charles Lyell's visit to Plymouth, "describes . . . the relics which are exhibited of these 'Pilgrim fathers,' as they are affectionately called."² A little later, however, doubts appear to have arisen in Hunter's mind as to the appropriateness of the term, and in 1854 he remarked:

The people of New England pay all proper deference to the colony of New Plymouth as being the parent colony of their country, and they speak fondly, if not wisely, of the persons who established it as THE PILGRIM FATHERS.³

³ There is something of affectation in this term, which is always displeasing; and we have seen also very strange applications of it: but further, it appears to me to be philologically improper. A pilgrim is a person who goes in a devout spirit to visit a shrine — real in the first instance but afterwards a place where, it may be, no shrine is, but which is hallowed by some recollections which would deserve to have a substantial representative. An American who visits the place from which the founders of his country emigrated is a pilgrim in the proper sense of the word, whether he finds, a shrine, an altar, or a stone of memorial, or not. But these founders when they sought the shores of America were proceeding to no object of this kind, and even leaving it to the winds and the waves to drive them to any point on an unknown and unmarked shore. There is, however, it must be owned, the same corrupt use of the word Pilgrim in the English version of the Scriptures, "and confessed that they were strangers and pilgrims on the earth."³

¹ Sermon (1794), pp. 17-18, 29-30.

² Collections concerning the Early History of the Founders of New Plymouth, the First Colonists of New England, London, 1849, p. 1.

³ First Collections concerning the Founders of New-Plymouth, London, 1854, p. 5 and note.

In an article called "Puritans — Pilgrims — Palmers," printed in a Boston newspaper in 1870, Charles C. Hazewell made — or, rather, repeated — the same criticism:

Is it proper to speak of the men who came over in the *Mayflower* as "*Pilgrim Fathers*?" Puritans in language assure us it is not, and they are right, though time and usage, and poetical associations have sanctioned the term, so that it is worse than idle to object to it, seeing that the objection would lead to nothing but a waste of words, — and the objector would, it is probable, be regarded by all good Americans as a bore. Yet we may subscribe to what is said on this subject by one of the best of our authorities on the history of the Pilgrims.

Mr. Hazewell then quoted the passage from Hunter given above, and added: "In a certain sense, the term is well used, for if the pilgrim be a *wanderer*, as he is according to one definition of the word, the Separatists who came hither certainly were pilgrims; for they wandered from England to Holland, and from Holland to America."¹

After what has been said in a previous section,² it need hardly be pointed out that Hunter's criticism is due to an entire misapprehension of the history and meanings of the word *pilgrim*, that the Scriptural use of the term is not "corrupt," that there is nothing either "philologically improper" or of "affectation" in our use of the term Pilgrim Fathers, and that such use is perfectly legitimate.³

MEANING OF THE TERM

For twelve years (1769-1780) the celebrations at Plymouth were purely local, the speakers and participants being either Plymotheans or from the neighboring towns in the Old Colony. For the next twelve years (1781-1792) the celebration fell into abeyance. Revived in 1793 and 1794, it was still local, and in 1797 it was merely a social gathering. It was instituted to commemorate those who

¹ Daily Evening Traveller, November 21, 1870, p. 1/4-5. The article is without signature, but was attributed to Mr. Hazewell, the editor of the Traveller, by John Ward Dean (New England Historical and Genealogical Register, 1871, xxv. 90).

² Pp. 352-359, above.

³ After quoting the passage from Bradford, J. A. Goodwin says: "The hypercritics who query why these people should be called 'Pilgrims' will see that they applied it to themselves" (Pilgrim Republic, p. 49 note). This statement is misleading.

“landed” in 1620, and of course only the Mayflower passengers did land in that year. When, therefore, during the first twenty-nine years, the participants spoke of their “ancestors,” “fathers,” and “forefathers,” undoubtedly they had chiefly in mind the Mayflower passengers, even though occasionally they drank toasts to the memories of a few who, like Cushman and Morton, reached Plymouth after 1620. But in 1798 the celebration began to assume a distinctly different character. Though to commemorate the past was, and continued to be, still the main object of the occasion, yet the present assumed a much greater prominence than heretofore; current politics were emphasized; the speakers were generally chosen from beyond the limits of the Old Colony; and the horizon was greatly widened, including the early settlers of Massachusetts as distinct from those of Plymouth. When, too, in 1798, the Boston celebrations began, the field was still further broadened, for the Boston celebrators, while not forgetful of the early Plymouth settlers, naturally had principally in mind the early Massachusetts settlers. Hence by about 1800 the terms Pilgrims and Pilgrim Fathers, which had then become well established, meant any early settlers of either of the two colonies which in 1692 were united under the Province of the Massachusetts Bay.¹ And such use of the term continued for many years — indeed, still continues.²

¹ About 1800, too, while the term Pilgrim Fathers was of course applied only to the early settlers, the meaning of the word Pilgrims was extended to include living persons who participated in the celebrations. This special meaning is now rarely encountered.

² In the following passages the term is applied either to the Massachusetts settlers only, or to the Plymouth and the Massachusetts settlers jointly (it often being difficult, if not impossible, to distinguish between the two): 1820, Rev. G. Spring, *A Tribute to New England*, in *New England Society Orations* (1901), i. 18, 21; 1822, Rev. P. M. Whelpley, *The Memory of the Just is Blessed*, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 133, 135 (William Stoughton); 1828, Rev. S. Green, *Discourse* (1829), pp. 14, 16; 1830, “*The Pilgrim Fathers, or the Lives of some of the First Settlers of New England*. Designed for Sabbath School Libraries” (contains lives of Robinson, Carver, Bradford, Winslow, and John Winthrop); 1836, Rev. J. Hayes, *A Tribute to the Memory of the Pilgrims* (second edition), pp. 93–118, 175; 1841, C. B. Hadduck, *The Elements of National Greatness*, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 280; 1844, Rev. J. A. Albro, *The Fathers of New England* (1845), p. 20; 1845, Rev. J. Pierce, 2 *Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society*, x. 398; 1846, C. W. Upham, *The Spirit of the Day and its Lessons*, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 446 (Roger Clap); 1856, T. Bridgman, *The Pilgrims of Boston and their Descend-*

Towards the middle of the nineteenth century it was felt by some that the terms had been used too loosely. Thus in 1841 the Rev. Alexander Young declared that "The term PILGRIMS belongs exclusively to the *Plymouth* colonists."¹ In 1848 the Rev. Samuel M. Worcester wrote:

There are those who will "garnish the sepulchres" of the "Pilgrims" of Plymouth Rock, and the "Fathers"* their associates of Salem, Charlestown, Boston, and other primitive settlements; while they are slow to recognize the true secret of the moral worth, and energy, and endurance, by which those godly sires achieved their noble deeds and won their renowned conquests and possessions.

"It is to be observed," said the Rev. Alvan Lamson in 1851, "that the term 'Pilgrims' belongs exclusively to the Plymouth colonists. It is never by accurate writers applied to the Massachusetts colonists."² In 1866 Benjamin Scott spoke of "the Pilgrim Fathers of Plymouth Colony" as "the only persons to whom that term has been historically applied."³ This restriction, however, of the terms Pilgrims and Pilgrim Fathers exclusively to the Plymouth settlers is recognized at the present time only in the Old Colony itself.

About the middle of the nineteenth century, also, an attempt was made to define somewhat precisely the meaning of the terms. "Those who came in the first three ships," said Young in 1841, "the May-

* Those who came to Plymouth are properly called "*The Pilgrims*"; — because they had sojourned in Holland. We speak of them as "the Fathers." But "the Fathers" were not all "Pilgrims."⁴

ants (title); 1867, Rev. S. G. Buckingham, Memorial of the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 35; 1874, W. Winters, The Pilgrim Fathers of Nazing, in New England Historical and Genealogical Register, xxviii. 140; 1881, Epochs and Episodes of History, p. 591 (Roger Williams); 1882, W. Winters, "Memorials of the Pilgrim Fathers. John Eliot and his Friends, of Nazing and Waltham Abbey" (title); 1893, J. P. Rylands, in New England Historical and Genealogical Register, xxxix. 39 (Richard Mather); 1909, Rev. A. Whyte, Thomas Shepard, Pilgrim Father and Founder of Harvard (title); 1913, W. E. A. Axon, in Nation, xcvi. 149 (John Endicott).

¹ Chronicles of the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 88 note.

² The Memory of John Robinson: A Discourse (1852), p. 16.

³ The Pilgrim Fathers neither Puritans nor Persecutors (second edition, 1869), p. 5.

⁴ Discourse (Boston, 1849), p. 6 and note. In the first edition of the Discourse (Salem, 1849) the footnote reads: "Those who came to Plymouth are properly called '*The Pilgrims*'; — because they had sojourned in Holland" (p. 6 note).

flower, the Fortune, and the Ann, are distinctively called the *old comers*, or the *forefathers*.”¹ In 1849 Sir Daniel Wilson wrote:

The last of the Pilgrim Fathers.

The arrival of the Anne and Little James, with their new band of emigrants casting in their lot with the founders of Plymouth, marks a period of peculiar interest in the annals of the Pilgrim Fathers. By all the historians of New England these later pilgrims are reckoned with those who came in the Mayflower and Fortune, as the *Old Comers* or *Forefathers*. It was the completion of the band of Pilgrims, the aristocracy of the New World, from whom, as from a fount of honour, its titles and its privileges were to be derived to all after ages.²

About 1884 John A. Goodwin remarked:

The above list closes the catalogue of those who are known as the Pilgrims, the First Comers, or the Forefathers. These names, therefore, are used synonymously for those who came in the “Mayflower,” the “Fortune,” and the “Anne,” with her consort. The number at landing, it will be remembered, was: “Mayflower,” 102; “Fortune,” 35; “Anne,” about 96: total, 233.³

In 1897 the late Edward Arber made this elaborate statement:

Who were the Pilgrim Fathers?

The general answer to this must be:

All those members of the Separatist Church at Leyden, who voted for the emigration to America; whether they were actually able to go there or not: together with such others as joined their Church from England.

Membership in the Pilgrim Church was the first qualification: intended, or actual, emigration to New England was the second one.

This general definition will include the Rev. JOHN ROBINSON and his family; who were unable to leave Leyden. It also includes the 35 members of the Leyden Church who arrived, at Plymouth in New England, in the *Fortune*, in November 1621; the 60 who arrived, in the *Ann* and *Little James* in August 1623; the 35 with their families, who arrived in the *Mayflower* in August 1629; and the 60 who arrived in the *Handmaid*, in May 1630.

¹ Chronicles of the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 352 note.

² The Pilgrim Fathers, in History of the Puritans in England, and the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 441.

³ Pilgrim Republic (1888), p. 244.

It likewise includes CHRISTOPHER MARTIN and his wife, who joined from Billericay in Essex: and RICHARD WARREN, and JOHN BILLINGTON *sen.* and his family; who came from London.

It also embraces WILLIAM KING, who started from Southampton in the *Mayflower* on the 5th of August 1620; but who, with ROBERT CUSHMAN, returned back from the voyage, at Plymouth; . . .

It further includes hired men, such as JOHN HOWLAND, a Man-servant in Governor CARVER'S family; and JOHN ALDEN the cooper: who both came out in the *Mayflower*, and eventually embracing the Pilgrim Cause, became honoured men among the Pilgrim Fathers.

On the other hand, it excludes all those members of the Pilgrim Church who had no wish to go to America. . . .

It also excludes all hired men who went out in the *Mayflower*; and who did not become members of the Church in the Old Colony. So all the *Mayflower* passengers were not Pilgrim Fathers.

It likewise excludes THOMAS WESTON and all the seventy Adventurers, as such: for having Shares in the Joint Stock did not make them Pilgrim Fathers.

It further excludes (though it is *very* hard to make the exclusion) three of the four London Merchants, now known as the noble FRIENDS OF THE PILGRIMS; who were among the number of the Adventurers, and who also joined with the eight Undertakers of the Colony in the Composition of 15/25 November 1626: RICHARD ANDREWS, JOHN BEAUCHAMP, and JAMES SHIRLEY; but it includes the Fourth of these, TIMOTHY HATHERLEY, because he settled at Scituate about the year 1635.¹

In 1898 the Rev. William E. Griffis remarked:

The affectionate term "Pilgrim Fathers," coined by later generations, includes (1) the members of the Leyden church who voted for emigration, whether able or unable to go; (2) those who came from England and joined the church. The *Mayflower* passengers constituted the "Old Stock" of Bradford's meaning. Those who reached New Plymouth in the *Mayflower*, Anne, and Little James were called the "Old Comers," or "Forefathers."²

The terms Pilgrims and Pilgrim Fathers are of popular origin, and so necessarily are incapable of precise definition; and Arber's fine-spun distinctions are too fanciful and absurd for serious consideration. Suffice it to say that at the present time by the terms are gen-

¹ Story of the Pilgrim Fathers, pp. 355-356.

² The Pilgrims in their Three Homes, p. 161.

erally meant the passengers who came in the first four ships — the Mayflower in 1620, the Fortune in 1621, and the Anne and the Little James in 1623.

How the terms came to be applied to them in particular has already been shown. It now remains to point out that the word Pilgrim was also applied to others, though Plymotheans are so accustomed to appropriate the word to their own ancestors as to resent its application to others. Yet it would be strange indeed if a word which had been in common use for four centuries before the sailing of the Mayflower should in the seventeenth century have been restricted to the men and women who came on that historic vessel. There was a ship named Peregrine in 1594,¹ at least two others of the same name between 1603 and 1625,² and one of the same name in Boston in 1659.³ In 1591 there was a ship named Pilgrim;⁴ another in 1595;⁵ another between 1603 and 1625;⁶ and in a letter to Endicott dated London, May 28, 1629, the Governor and Company of the Massachusetts Bay wrote, "Wee send yo^w also herewth a p̄ticuler of . . . what goods, cattle, or other p̄visions, wee now send vpon these 3 shippes, viz, the Mayflower, of Yarmouth, . . . the Fower Sisters, of London, . . . the Pilgrim, of London."⁷ Writing about 1651 Edward Johnson said:

¹ Hakluyt's Voyages (1904), xi. 46.

² R. G. Marsden, English Ships in the Reign of James I, in Transactions of the Royal Historical Society (1905), New Series, xix. 328.

³ Suffolk Deeds, iii. 245.

⁴ Hakluyt's Voyages (1904), vii. 44, 49.

⁵ Purchas His Pilgrimes (1906), xvi. 18.

⁶ R. G. Marsden: cf. note 2, above.

⁷ Massachusetts Colony Records, i. 400, 404. Late in the eighteenth century there is mention of several ships of this name. "We hear the Pilgrim has taken a ship of upwards of 500 tons burthen, laden with dry goods" (Independent Chronicle, August 20, 1781, p. 2/3). On November 5, 1781, Franklin wrote: "The Admiralty there will not accept any English [prisoners] in exchange, but such as have been taken by Americans, and absolutely refuse to allow any of the paroles given to our privateers by English prisoners discharged at sea, except in one instance, that of fifty-three men taken in the *Snake* sloop, by the *Pilgrim* and *Rambler*, which was a case attended, as they say, with some particular circumstances" (Works, 1888, vii. 306). "Last Monday," said the Boston Gazette of June 24, 1782, "the Prize Brig Neptune, of about 100 tons burthen, laden with Lumber, arrived in a safe Port. She was taken on her passage from Halifax to Antigua, by the Privateer Ship Pilgrim, Capt. Robinson, of Beverly" (p. 3/2). The sloop Pilgrim was among the port entries noted in the

At this time those who were in place of civill Government, having some addition Pillars to under-prop the building, begun to thinke of a place of more safety in the eyes of Man, then the two frontire Towns of *Charles Towne*, and *Boston* were for the habitation of such as the Lord had prepared to Gouverne this Pilgrim People. . . .

It being a work (in the apprehension of all, whose capacity could reach to the great sums of money, the edifice of a mean Coledg would cost) past the reach of a poor Pilgrim people, who had expended the greatest part of their estates on a long voyage, . . .

Thir year [1650] was the first noted year wherein any store of people died, the ayr and place being very healthy naturally, made this correction of the Lord seem the greater, for the most that died were children, and that of an untoward disease here, though frequent in other places, the Lord now smiting many families with death in them, although there were not any families wherein more then one died, or very rare if it were otherwise, yet were these pilgrim people minded of the suddain forgetfulness of those worthies that died not long before, but more specially the little regard had to provide means to train their children up in the knowledg of learning, and improve such means as the Lord hath appointed to leave their posterity an able Minister.¹

In a letter to John Winthrop, Jr., dated October 30, 1660, the Rev. John Davenport said: "It was of Mantoweeze that the land was bought, whereby N. H. [New Haven Colony] bounds extended neare unto Cold Spring, beyond Pilgrims Harbour."² Pilgrims' Harbor

Massachusetts Centinel of December 8, 1784 (p. 3/3). And in the same paper of December 22, 1784 (p. 4/2), is this advertisement:

To be S O L D,

(If applied for immediately),

THE good Sloop P I L G R I M, British built, burthen about 90 tons, as she now lies at the south side of the Long-Wharf. She is a fast sailing vessel, well found, and exceedingly well calculated for the Southern Trade

¹ Wonder-working Providence (1654), pp. 60-61, 193, 216. The references in the first two paragraphs are to the church gathered at Cambridge in 1633 and to Harvard College.

² 4 Massachusetts Historical Collections, vii. 518. There are allusions (1666-1687) to Pilgrims' Harbor in the Connecticut Colonial Records (ii. 53, 127, iii. 235), and also (1660-1742) in C. H. S. Davis's History of Wallingford, etc. (1870), pp. 128-130. Referring to the regicides Whalley and Goffe, on July 18, 1785, President Stiles wrote: "After the Restor^a of Charles II. 1660 these holy Pilgrims came first to Boston. But being hunted there they fled to New Haven, . . . It being still dangerous here, they removed to & resided near a Rivulet in

was "probably a hut where travellers between Hartford and New Haven found shelter."¹ In 1660 Henry Gardiner wrote:

. . . if good Society and English Government were there, people would rather live there, than in Africk, Greece, Italy, France, Spain, or England; it transcends all the Baltick Seas, and affords all or any Commodity they have, & more plenty of sundry sorts, and of more concernment to his Majesty, than if all the Baltic Seas were annexed to his Empire; as in a short Epitomy and Anotomy of those countries, from New-found-land to Cape Florida, with Mapps and Cards shall appear, with Collections of 55 years Pilgrimage.²

In 1694 Joshua Scottow said: "Thus far of the Light and white side of the Pillar, which attended us in this our Wilderness Pilgrimage; the black and dark side remains."³ In 1702 Cotton Mather, referring to Salem, wrote:

An Entrance being thus made upon the Design of Planting a Country of *English* and *Reformed* Churches; they that were concerned for the Plantation, made their Application to Two Non-Conformists Ministers,

Meriden 20 M. fr. N. Haven at a place known to this day by the name of *Pilgrims Harbor*;" and on May 8, 1793: "To Hartfd, . . . Tradition at Meriden & about here Pilgrim's Harbor so named from two men stopt here till could make a float. Afterw^{ds} Public built a shed for Pilgrims caught here by high Freshes" (Literary Diary, iii. 170, 494). In the next year (1794) Stiles published his History of Three of the Judges of King Charles I, and then, after stating that Whalley and Goffe arrived at Boston on July 27, 1660, and at New Haven on March 7, 1661, said: "On the 13th of October, 1664, they left Milford, and proceeded in this excursion. I shall suppose that the first night they came over to New-Haven to their friend Jones, though of this there is no tradition, as there is of their making a lodgment at Pilgrims Harbor, so called from them, being twenty miles from New-Haven, at a place since called Meriden, half-way between New-Haven and Hartford. . . . But of this I find no tradition, saving only, that in their rout to Hadley they made one station at Pilgrims Harbor" (pp. 22, 44, 108). As the letter quoted in the text was written four years before the regicides are alleged to have taken shelter at Pilgrims' Harbor, obviously Stiles's theory that it received its name from that fact is erroneous. "If the regicides ever made use of it," says E. E. Atwater, "it was after this letter was written. It was not, as President Stiles suggests, called Pilgrims' Harbor because the regicides lodged in it" (History of the Colony of New Haven, 1881, p. 447 note).

I am indebted to our associate Professor Franklin B. Dexter for the references to Atwater, to Davis, and to Stiles's History.

¹ E. E. Atwater, History of the Colony of New Haven, p. 447 note.

² New England's Vindication (Gorges Society, 1884), p. 37.

³ Narrative, 4 Massachusetts Historical Collections, iv. 297.

that they would go over to serve the *Cause of God and of Religion* in the beginning of those *Churches*. The one of these was Mr. *Higginson*, . . . the other was Mr. *Skelton*, . . . These Ministers came over to *Salem*, in the Summer of the Year 1629. . . . 'Tis true, there were two other *Clergy-Men*, who came over about the same time; nevertheless, . . . we will proceed with our Story; which is now to tell us, That the Passage of these our *Pilgrims* was attended with many Smiles of Heaven upon them.¹

¹ Magnalia, bk. i. ch. iv. § 4, pp. 16-17. In his Discourse delivered at Plymouth in 1828, the Rev. Samuel Green said:

Sons of the Pilgrims, look at these beacons, as they rise around you, and beware of forsaking the God of your fathers. Their graves are before you. This occasion rolls back the light of their doctrines, and the light of their example. "It is reported of the Scythians," says Cotton Mather, "that in battles, when they came to stand upon the graves of their dead fathers, they would stand there immovable till they died on the spot: and, thought I, why may not such a method now engage the children of the Pilgrims, to stand fast in their faith, and their order, and in the power of godliness? I will show them the graves of their dead fathers; and if any of them do retreat unto the errors of another Gospel, they shall undergo the irresistible rebukes of their progenitors, here brought from the dead for their admonition" (pp. 31-32).

No reference for this quotation is given. It is conceivable that Mather might have used the expression "children of the Pilgrims," and if so it would be interesting to know whether in reference to the Plymouth or to the Massachusetts settlers. It turns out, however, that Mr. Green's memory was at fault. On the few occasions when Mather quoted *Paradise Lost*, he did so inaccurately, once changing Milton's "Chariot and charioteer" to "*Salvage and Sagamore*." In the present instance the tables were turned against Mather, for what he actually wrote is as follows:

It is reported of the *Scythians*, who were, doubtless, the Ancestors of the *Indians* first inhabiting these Regions, that in Battels, when they came to stand upon the *Graves* of their *dead Fathers*, they would there stand immovable, 'till they dy'd upon the spot: And, thought I, why may not such a Method now effectually engage the *English* in these Regions, to *stand fast* in their *Faith* and their *Order*, and in the *Power of Godliness*? I'll shew them, the *Graves* of their *dead Fathers*; and if any of them do retreat unto a Contempt or Neglect of *Learning*, or unto the *Errors of another Gospel*, or unto the Superstitions of *Will-Worship*, or unto a *worldly*, a *selfish*, a *little* Conversation, they shall undergo the irrisistible Rebukes of their Progenitors, here fetch'd from the dead, for their Admonition; and I'll therewithal advertise my *New-Englanders*, that if a Grand-child of a *Moses* becomes an *Idolater*, he shall, [as the Jews remark upon *Judg.* 18. 30.] be destroy'd, as if not a *Moses*, but a *Manasseh*, had been his Father. Besides, *Plus Vivitur Exemplis quam Præceptis!* (Magnalia, 1702, bk. iii. pt. i., To the Reader, § 2, p. 11.)

In 1786 David Humphreys, in his "Poem, On the Happiness of America; Addressed to the Citizens of the United States," wrote:

Here equal fortunes, ease, the ground their own,
Augment their numbers with increase unknown —
Here hamlets grow — here Europe's pilgrims come
From vassall'd woes to find a quiet home.¹

The following extract is taken from the Independent Chronicle of January 6, 1794:

CONCORD, *December 26, 1793.*

At the Anniversary Meeting of the Pilgrim Society in Concord, on the 25th instant, at Lieut. *John Richardson's*,* for the purpose of commemorating the Divine Nativity; after transacting the necessary business of the Society, they spent the evening in grateful and Christian conviviality, and most cordially drank the following pertinent Toasts on the occasion, *viz.*

First. The Birth-Day of our SAVIOUR.

Second. The Pilgrims in Concord.

Third. The Day. — While we feast as strangers and brethren, let us rejoice as Christians.

Fourth. May the light of Reason and Philosophy, banish superstition.

Fifth. May we never want a WASHINGTON, nor a WASHINGTON a grateful People.

Sixth. May the basis of our freedom be virtue, and lasting as time.

Seventh. May those, who are struggling for Freedom and Equality, ever enjoy them.

Eighth. May we ever rejoice in each others' freedom and prosperity.

Ninth. Strangers, wheresoever they are.

After which the Members retired to their respective places of abode, in great good order and filled with many good impressions.

* *A Society formed in Concord, some years since by a number of young Men, who emigrated from various towns, and settled in Concord, and replenished from time to time, with persons only of that description. — The Society now consists of about 20 members.*²

¹ Boston Magazine, 1786, iii. 397.

² P. 4/1. Presumably it was at Concord, Massachusetts, that this Pilgrim Society existed; but no other allusion to it has been found. John Richardson was born at Watertown July 11, 1758; went to Concord in 1778, opened an inn there in 1789, but moved away in 1804; became a member of the Social

Between 1785 and 1794, the Rev. Ezra Stiles often spoke of the regicides who had taken refuge in New England as Pilgrims.¹

It is possible that when Mather alluded to Higginson and Skelton as "these our Pilgrims," he may have been influenced by the passage in Bradford's History, known to him through Morton; but such could not have been the case with the other writers just quoted. It is interesting to find the early Massachusetts settlers called a Pilgrim people or Pilgrims a century and a half before the word was specifically applied to the Plymouth settlers, and a Pilgrim Society at Concord thirty years before a similarly-named society was formed at Plymouth.

Circle in 1782; on March 7, 1790, was married to Anna Bemis of Watertown, who died July 14, 1796; on December 29, 1801, was married to Hannah Bemis of Watertown, a sister of his first wife; had several children by both wives; and died at Newton May 3, 1837. (Memoirs of the Social Circle in Concord, i. 52, 159, 163, ii. p. ix; Concord Registers, pp. 323, 387; Watertown Records, iii. 140, 178, 230, iv, 159; H. Bond, Genealogies of Watertown, pp. 25, 412; Newton Vital Records, p. 495.) The early history of the Social Circle in Concord is somewhat obscure, but apparently there was no connection between it and the Pilgrim Society. In "A Topographical Description of the Town of Concord, August 20th, 1792. Presented by Mr. William Jones, student of Harvard College," it is stated that "An association is established called the Social Club, who meet once a week at each other's houses. The club is founded upon principles, and governed by rules, that are admirably promotive of the social affections and useful improvements" (1 Massachusetts Historical Collections, i. 239).

¹ See p. 366 note 2, above. This use of the word *pilgrim*, without reference to the Pilgrims of Plymouth, is of course occasionally met with after 1798. Thus a poem printed in the Independent Chronicle of January 21, 1799 (p. 4/1), began as follows:

WACHUSETT's true can boast of many trees
 Who patriot like, display their niches;
 But the pilgrim as he's passing, sees
 Contemptuous thorns and ugly bushes.

A novel entitled "Love's Pilgrimage; A Story founded on facts" was advertised in the Columbian Centinel of January 8, 1800 (p. 4/1); but whether English or American, I do not know. The following lines occur in a political skit published in 1820 entitled "The Pilgrims of Hope: An Oratorio For the Clintonian celebration of the New Year" (p. 19):

See from the shores of subjugated France,
 G*N*T and ADANCOURT, lead up the dance
 Of foreign Pilgrims, who, in devious maze,
 Like Shaking Quakers, rigadon their praise.

Wherever the terms Pilgrims and Pilgrim Fathers are found after 1798, of course their use is due to the Pilgrims of Plymouth.¹ In 1830 John F. Watson published his "Annals of Philadelphia, being a Collection of Memoirs, Anecdotes, & Incidents of the City and its Inhabitants from the Days of the Pilgrim Founders." In 1831 John V. L. McMahon wrote:

Leonard Calvert . . . purchased the town from the natives, and established his colony within it by their consent. In pursuance of his agreement with the natives, the colony was disembarked at the town of Yaocomoco, on the 27th of March, 1634, and took possession of it by the name of St. Mary's. Then and thus landed *the Pilgrims of Maryland*, and then and thus were laid the foundations of the *old city of St. Mary's*, and of *our present State*. . . . The close of the second century since that event, is now near at hand; and why should not the return of the day, which commemorates the landing of these pilgrims, be the occasion of a *jubilee* to us? . . . *The landing of the Pilgrims of New England*, has been the burden of many a story, and the theme of many an oration. . . . Yet whilst we would avoid all invidious contrasts, and forget the stern spirit of the Puritan, which so frequently mistook religious intolerance for holy zeal; we can turn with exultation to *the Pilgrims of Maryland*, as the founders of religious liberty in the new world.²

"Thus much," remarked William L. Stone in 1842, "for the public career of this great Indian benefactor to the Pilgrim Fathers of Con-

¹ The following appeared in the *Columbian Centinel* of January 20, 1802 (p. 4/1):

MR. RUSSELL.

SIR — *THE following lines were addressed to our late excellent fellow-citizen, G. R. MINOT, ESQUIRE, while he was composing the 1st Volume of his History of Massachusetts, by a sincere admirer of his character* — ANALASKI.

Then follows a poem in sixteen stanzas, the last reading:

Yes, ere the *fabled* Tale is wrought,
While yet the features are imprest,
Shall thy discriminating thought,
Pourtray the *Pilgrims of the West*.

The first volume of Minot's *Continuation of the History of the Province of Massachusetts Bay* bears on its title-page the date "Feb. 1798." If the above lines were written before that date, then their author probably was not influenced by the Plymouth and Boston celebrations.

² *Historical View of the Government of Maryland*, i. 195, 197, 198 note.

necticut.”¹ “It was a beautiful thought,” declared Joseph R. Chandler in 1855, “and does honor to those who entertained it and gave it utterance, and finally put it into practice, to make a public celebration of the ‘Landing of the Pilgrims of Maryland;’” and in the oration he delivered on the occasion, he alluded to “the Pilgrim Fathers of St. Mary’s,” “the Pilgrims of St. Mary’s county,” “the Pilgrim Fathers of Maryland,” and “the Pilgrims of St. Mary’s city.”² “The Pilgrims of Plymouth,” wrote Whittier in 1872, “have not lacked historian and poet. . . . The Quaker pilgrims of Pennsylvania, seeking the same objects by different means, have not been equally fortunate;” and so he composed his poem “The Pennsylvania Pilgrim,” dealing with Francis Daniel Pastorius.³

THE PILGRIMS OF PLYMOUTH AND THE PURITANS OF MASSACHUSETTS

We now reach the last phase of our subject — namely, the distinction between the Pilgrims of the Plymouth Colony and the Puritans of the Massachusetts Colony. Were the passengers in the Mayflower Puritans in religion? During the past half-century this

¹ Uncas and Miantonomoh, p. 143.

² “Civic and Religious Equality. An Oration delivered at the fourth commemoration of the Pilgrims of Maryland, celebrated May 15, 1855. Under the auspices of the Philodemic Society of Georgetown College. . . . To which is prefixed a notice of the proceedings at the Celebration. Philadelphia: . . . 1855,” pp. 5, 23, 30, 42, 45, 53, 54. Mr. Chandler’s “Address . . . at the celebration of the Landing of the Pilgrims of Maryland, at the site of St. Mary’s City, May 15th, 1855,” was also printed at Baltimore. The same use of the terms will be found in *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* (1877), xxxi. 224; J. W. Thomas, *Chronicles of Colonial Maryland* (1900), p. 19; Rev. W. T. Russell, *Maryland; the Land of Sanctuary* (1907), pp. 76–77, 84, 197 note.

³ *Complete Poetical Works* (Cambridge edition, 1894), pp. 103–112, 519–520. The term is also occasionally used in a figurative sense. Thus on October 18, 1906, Life said: “The early efforts of Josh Billings and Artemus Ward, the Pilgrim Fathers of Phonetics, to introduce their Sound System of Spelling were not taken seriously; these fanatics of functics were laughed at, and in time spelling as a branch of humor died out” (xlviii. 431). At the Boston celebration in 1804 was sung a song called *New-England*, “written for the occasion, (by a gentleman in a neighbouring State),” which contained the following lines (*Columbian Centinel*, December 26, 1804, p. 4/1) :

From Discord, oppression, injustice and strife,
Here FREEDOM, the PILGRIM a refuge shall find,
A covert secure from the tempest of life
The WONDER, EXAMPLE, and PRIDE of MANKIND.

question has been hotly contested, and admirable authority can be cited in both the affirmative and the negative. The problem is too complex for treatment here, and its discussion is reserved for a future occasion. Moreover, for our present purpose it is immaterial whether the Mayflower passengers were or were not, properly speaking, Puritans. It will be sufficient to show what views have been held on this subject since 1769.

In 1776 the Rev. Sylvanus Conant said: "In these and the like ways, GOD as it were searched out and prepared a place in this wilderness for the flight of his little persecuted flock. It must be noticed that the civil and ecclesiastical powers of England at this time, were against them, on account of their puritan principles."¹ "Hence they," remarked the Rev. Samuel West in 1777, referring to the enemies of "our fathers," "called them, *Fanaticks*, *Schismaticks*, and, in scorn, *Puritans*; and they doubtless thought that God would be glorified by their thus cruelly persecuting their brethren."² In 1794 Belknap stated that in 1620 "A Company of ENGLISH PURITANS, who had resided twelve years in Holland, began a colony in New England, which they called *New Plymouth*."³ "Two Centuries are this day completed," said the Rev. John Chester in 1820, "since the PURITAN PILGRIMS of New England landed on the soil of the new world;"⁴ and in the same year the Rev. Daniel Huntington remarked,

¹ Anniversary Sermon (1777), pp. 14-15.

² Anniversary Sermon (1778), p. 38.

³ American Biography, i. 46: cf. ii. 151. The following is taken from the Massachusetts Magazine for May, 1794:

Account of an Ancient and Curious STAFF.

DEACON *Joseph White*, of Yarmouth, in the County of Barnstable, great grandson of *Peregrine*,* has in his possession a *Staff*, which is valuable for its great antiquity. It had conveyance, agreeably to well authenticated tradition, in the first ship which came to New England in 1620. When those venerable puritanic sages landed at Plymouth, one of their company walked with this Staff. It is three feet in length; and is a striking instance of that noble simplicity, which so eminently dignified the character of those primitive, and justly celebrated *fathers* of this country.

* *Peregrine White* was the first born of English parents in New England (vi. 288).

⁴ Sermon (1820), p. 6. The term "Puritan Pilgrims" occurs again on p. 7 of this Sermon, and is also employed by the following writers: 1835, P. Sprague, Speech (1836), pp. 5, 32; 1849, D. Wilson, in History of the Puritans in England,

“Let it ever be remembered with admiration and gratitude, that a *Church of English Puritans* began the settlement of New England.”¹ “A company of these Puritans,” wrote the Rev. Samuel Green in 1828, “among whom were the first of the New England pilgrims, in 1610, bade adieu to their native land and settled in Leyden.”² “Where were the Pilgrims,” asked Rufus Choate in 1843, “while in this furnace of affliction? Who saw and cared for them? A hundred persons, understood to be Lollards, or Precisians, or Puritans, or Brownists, had sailed away some three thousand miles, to arrive on a winter’s coast, in order to be where they could hear a man preach without a surplice!”³ In the same year Webster spoke of “the Puritans who landed upon the Rock of Plymouth.”⁴ “But with all their errors,” declared Lewis Cass in 1848, “history has left on record no name in all the annals of religious controversy, brighter or nobler than that of the Pilgrim Puritans, who raised an altar in the western wilderness, and died around it.”⁵ In 1851 Joseph Banvard spoke of “the forty-one Puritan fathers who signed the memorable compact in the cabin of the *Mayflower*.”⁶ In 1855 the Rev. Joseph B. Felt wrote:

The departure of Columbus for the discovery of a new world, and for opening new sources of commerce, wealth, and knowledge, was an enterprise worthy of the noblest mind; but the undertaking of the Leyden Puritans to found a commonwealth suited to cherish and expand the blessings of civil and religious liberty is one of brighter, sublimer ends.⁷

“But of the Congregationalism of the Puritans,” said our late associate the Rev. C. Carroll Everett in 1865, “as represented by the

and the Pilgrim Fathers, p. 480; 1851, J. Banvard, *Plymouth and the Pilgrims*, pp. 25, 33; 1885, G. W. Curtis, *Oration, in New England Society Orations*, ii. 417-418.

¹ Discourse (1821), p. 23.

² Discourse (1829), p. 12: cf. pp. 28, 32 note.

³ *The Age of the Pilgrims the heroic period of our History*, in *New England Society Orations* (1901), i. 346: cf. i. 332, 338.

⁴ *Niles' Register* (1844), lxxv. 295; *New England Society Orations*, i. 361, 366.

⁵ Address delivered before the *New England Society of Michigan* (1849), p. 33. The term “Pilgrim Puritans” was also employed in 1849 by the Rev. N. Cleaveland in his *Address* (1850), p. 22.

⁶ *Plymouth and the Pilgrims*, p. 273.

⁷ *Ecclesiastical History of New England*, i. 38.

Pilgrim Fathers, during the first years of their residence in America, our liberal churches are the true and only representatives.”¹

Not only does writer after writer,² from 1769 to about 1860, assert that the early Plymouth settlers were Puritans, but during that period apparently no other view was taken. And the same view is

¹ Sermon (1865), p. 8.

² Among the writers who maintain that the early Plymouth settlers were Puritans are the following: 1801, Rev. J. Allyn, Sermon (1802), pp. 9–10; 1803, Rev. J. Strong, Sermon (1804), p. 5; 1804, Rev. J. Morse and Rev. E. Parish, *Compendious History of New England*, pp. 24, 36; 1806, Rev. A. Holmes, Discourse, pp. 9, 12, 19–20; 1809, Rev. A. Abbot, Discourse (1810), pp. 7, 8; 1815, Rev. J. Flint, Discourse (1816), p. 23; 1820, Rev. A. Holmes, Two Discourses (1821), p. 16; 1820, Rev. H. Humphrey, *The character and sufferings of the Pilgrims* (1821), pp. 7, 8, 10; 1820, Rev. G. Spring, Tribute to New England, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 14, 15 note; 1820, Rev. J. Woodbridge, *The Jubilee of New England* (1821), pp. 3, 4; 1829, S. L. Knapp, Address, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 150; 1829, W. Sullivan, Discourse (1830), p. 12; 1830, Rev. B. B. Wisner, *Influence of Religion on Liberty* (1831), pp. 24, 25; 1831; Rev. J. Codman, *Faith of the Pilgrims* (1832), pp. 7, 21; 1835, J. B. Whitridge, Oration (1836), p. 15; 1835, A. Bradford, *History of Massachusetts*, pp. 15, 16; 1836, Rev. J. Hawes, *Tribute to the Memory of the Pilgrims* (second edition), p. 57; 1842, Rev. G. B. Cheever, *Elements of National Greatness*, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 292, 293; 1844, G. P. Marsh, Address, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 387 and note; 1845, Rev. J. Dyer, Discourse (1846), p. 3; 1845, Rev. O. W. B. Peabody, Discourse (1846), p. 8; 1845, J. R. Chandler, *The Pilgrims of the Rock* (1846), p. 11; 1846, Rev. M. Hopkins, Sermon (1847), pp. 5, 31; 1846, Rev. M. A. H. Niles, *Distinctive Characteristics of the Pilgrims*, p. 3; 1846, C. W. Upham, *The Spirit of the Day and its Lessons*, in *New England Society Orations*, i. 433; 1847, W. H. Dillingham, Oration (1847), pp. 13, 22, 28; 1850, Rev. W. DeL. Love, *Obedience in Rulers* (1851), pp. 11, 12, 16; 1851, G. S. Hillard, *The Past and the Future*, in *New England Society Orations*, ii. 141, 145–146, 149; 1851, A. C. Spooner, Speech, pp. 3, 6; 1852, Rev. R. Ashton, *4 Massachusetts Historical Collections*, i. 112; 1852, Rev. T. D. Hunt, Address (1853), p. 9; 1853, Rev. H. Brown, *The Pilgrim Fathers*, pp. 14, 46; 1853, Rev. T. Raffles, *Lecture on the Pilgrim Fathers*, p. 8; 1853, R. Yeadon, Speech, p. 2; 1854, W. M. Evarts, *Heritage of the Pilgrims*, in *New England Society Orations*, ii. 241, 245, 250; 1854, J. W. Thornton, *The Landing at Cape Anne*, p. 24; 1855, O. W. Holmes, Oration, in *New England Society Orations*, ii. 280; 1855, W. H. Seward, Oration (1856), pp. 7, 8; 1856, Rev. J. A. Copp, *The Old Ways* (1857), p. 11; 1856, Rev. J. Cordner, *Vision of the Pilgrim Fathers* (1857), p. 14; 1857, Rev. A. D. Smith, *The Puritan Character* (1858), pp. 7, 23; 1857, Rev. R. S. Storrs, *The Puritan Scheme of National Growth*, in *New England Society Orations*, ii. 334; 1859, Rev. J. Hawes, *One Soweth and another Reapeth*, pp. 3, 6, 7, 9, 18, 19; 1867, Rev. S. G. Buckingham, *Memorial of the Pilgrim Fathers*, p. 5; 1883, J. T. Morse, Jr., *Thomas Jefferson*, p. 3; 1896, Rev. C. H. Pope, in *New England Historical and Genealogical Register*, l. 234; 1907, Rev. F. A. Noble, *The Pilgrims*, p. 3.

still held by many eminent scholars. But in 1866 Benjamin Scott of London advanced an opposite view. Before quoting Mr. Scott, it is pertinent to point out that previous writers, though regarding the early Plymouth settlers as Puritans, were yet alive to the fact that those early settlers were Separatists, while the early settlers at Salem and Boston still regarded themselves as members of the Church of England.¹ Thus in 1847 William H. Dillingham, speaking of the Mayflower passengers, said, "A step in advance of their brother Puritans, had entitled them to the designation of Separatists."² In 1851 the Rev. Alvan Lamson wrote: "The Pilgrims, or Plymouth Colony, were Separatists; the Massachusetts Colony was mostly composed of Puritans, who had not before left the national church."³ "The Pilgrims of Plymouth," declared Charles Sumner in 1853, "were among the earliest of the Separatists."⁴

But while pointing out that the early Plymouth settlers were Separatists, the writers just quoted regarded them as also Puritans. In 1857 the Rev. Edmund H. Sears wrote:

We will not take our final leave of the good men whose labors and sacrifices we have been reviewing, without a filial tribute to their virtues. This we do, because, with all the eulogy bestowed upon them by popular historians and orators, we doubt if their principles are yet fully understood. They are constantly confounded with the Massachusetts Puritans, whereas they were entirely different in character, temper, principles, and policy.⁵

¹ Of course, this difference had been remarked on much earlier. Thus about 1680 Hubbard spoke of "some religious and well affected persons, that were lately [about 1626] removed out of New Plymouth out of dislike of their principles of rigid separation" (History of New England, p. 106). In 1813 Judge Davis wrote: "The first planters of Massachusetts, though puritans, had not, like Mr. Robinson's society, separated from the Church of England before their arrival in this country. As soon as they were at liberty to pursue, unimpeded, their own ideas of ecclesiastical order, they adopted, with little variation, the practice of the Plymouth settlers" (Discourse, 1814, p. 9). In 1908 Mr. Andrew McF. Davis called attention to the open letter which on April 7, 1630, Winthrop and others addressed "to the rest of their brethren in and of the Church of England," and to what Winthrop said about the laying of hands on the Rev. John Wilson (Publications, xii. 11, 12).

² Oration (1847), p. 22.

³ Discourse (1852), p. 16.

⁴ A Finger-Point from Plymouth Rock, p. 7.

⁵ Pictures of the Olden Time, as shown in the fortunes of a Family of the Pilgrims, p. 324. "It would be difficult to say," the author well remarks, "to

Mr. Sears then proceeded to draw a contrast which presents the Massachusetts Puritans in a very unenviable light. In 1860 the Rev. John Waddington remarked that "Few, comparatively, clearly understand the distinction between the Puritans, and the Separatists who gave rise to the Pilgrim fathers."¹ We are thus brought to the statement made by Benjamin Scott in 1866:

I propose first to show that the Pilgrim Fathers of Plymouth Colony — the only persons to whom that term has been historically applied, the first successful Anglo-Saxon colonists of America, and the real founders of New England — were not *Puritans*, as is often carelessly and erroneously reported, but *Separatists*.

The difference between the early Puritans and the Separatists was not one of name merely, . . . but wide, fundamental and irreconcilable. . . . It has been asked, "Did the Pilgrim Fathers repudiate the term *Puritan* as applied to themselves?" I reply they were not and could not, at that day, have been afforded the opportunity of repudiation; no such confusion of terms could then have arisen.² Their enemies were too vigilant and unrelenting, and they and their predecessors were too truthful to permit of their shielding themselves under the term of *Puritan*.³

what class of literature the following work properly belongs. It is neither romance nor pure history" (p. v). Some will be disposed to see more romance than history in the work.

¹ Track of the Hidden Church; or, the Springs of the Pilgrim Movement (1863), p. 38.

² Obviously, confusion could not have arisen between two terms one of which did not come into existence until 1798. J. A. Goodwin asserted that "The Pilgrim Fathers, the founders of our Plymouth, the pioneer Colony of New England, were not Puritans. They *never* were called by that name, either by themselves or their contemporaries" (Pilgrim Republic, 1888, p. 1). Even if the Pilgrims did not call themselves by the name of Puritans, that fact would have no significance, since the word Puritan — like Quaker, Whig, Tory, and a host of other terms — was originally one of reproach, and so might have been objected to on that ground. Indeed, Bradford twice expresses his dislike to the word for that reason. "And to cast contempte the more upon the sincere servants of God," he says in one place, "they opprobriously and most injuriously, gave unto, and imposed upon them, that name of Puritans; which [it] is said the Novatians (out of prid) did assume and take unto themselves" (History of Plymouth, ed. Ford, i. 12-13). And in another place he says: "The name of Brownists is but a nickname, as Puritan and Huguenot, &c., and therefore they do not amiss to decline the odium of it in what they may" (Dialogue, in Young's Chronicles of the Pilgrim Fathers, 1841, pp. 416-417).

³ The Pilgrim Fathers neither Puritans nor Persecutors (1869), pp. 5-6.

Mr. Scott's lecture was widely read in this country and its main contention, that the early Plymouth settlers were not Puritans, though denied by some,¹ was accepted by others. "Before tracing the history of this separation," said the Rev. Henry M. Goodwin in 1870, "let me speak of the difference between the *Puritans* and the *Pilgrims*, who are often confounded by many persons. This difference was not one of name merely, but wide and fundamental. . . . The Pilgrim Fathers who founded the Plymouth Colony, and who planted and gave type to our institutions, were not Puritans, but Separatists, men of larger and freer and more catholic spirit, than the Puritans who came after, and settled in Salem and Boston."² In the same year the Rev. Henry M. Dexter is reported to have said:

The speaker did not know if the difference between the Puritans of Boston and the Plymouth Pilgrims was understood by many, but it was important in celebrating the present occasion not to forget this difference. Such men as the Pilgrims of Plymouth were almost impossible to understand. They started in the north of England, — men with one idea, — and that idea was, that they must do right whatever it cost them. They felt that the Anglican church was not right according to the Bible, and that nothing like it could be right. The Puritans started with the same idea, but they did not carry it out. They saw the Anglican church was unscriptural, and said that they must avoid being under the yoke, but they stayed there a long time, and when they came here they believed they were going to still live in vital union with the Church of England. The Pilgrims, feeling they could not do right in England, determined to leave, and went to Holland, but finding there that they were unfortunate in opportunities for the education of their children, they added the idea that was the key note to their action — the missionary idea. This idea was new as they wrought it out; it did not appear in the history of Christianity, and the form in which the American Board of Foreign Missions were now working it out. The Pilgrims' idea was to come over and worship God in this new country, in their own way, among savages whom they might convert.³

¹ J. W. Dean, in *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* (1871), xxv. 301-303.

² The Pilgrim Fathers (Rockford, Illinois), pp. 7, 8. In a note on p. 8 Scott's lecture is referred to.

³ "Pilgrim Jubilee. Celebration in Providence, R. I., of the two hundred and fiftieth anniversary of Congregationalism in this country, October 11th, 1870," pp. 34-35.

It was in 1870 also that Robert C. Winthrop spoke of the Rev. Joseph Hunter as having "turned his attention to the Pilgrims of Plymouth, and to the Puritans of Massachusetts, for the latest and best themes of his unwearied investigations;"¹ and went on to say:

An Episcopalian myself, by election as well as education, and warmly attached to the forms and the faith in which I was brought up; . . . I yet rejoice, as heartily as any Congregationalist who listens to me, that our Pilgrim Fathers were Separatists. I rejoice, too, that the Puritan Fathers of Massachusetts, who followed them to these shores ten years afterwards, . . . were, if not technically and professedly, yet to all intents and purposes, Separatists, also;—Semi-Separatists at least, as Robinson himself was called when he wrote and published that book which so offended the Brownists. . . . I would not seem too harsh towards those old prelates of the English Church, by whom Pilgrims or Puritans were persecuted.²

In 1874 the Rev. Leonard Bacon wrote:

Those who read the story will understand, I trust — what many are ignorant of, and what some historians have not sufficiently explained — the difference between "our Pilgrim Fathers" and "our Puritan Fathers." In the old world on the other side of the ocean the Puritan was a Nationalist, believing that a Christian nation is a Christian church, and demanding that the Church of England should be thoroughly reformed; while the Pilgrim was a Separatist, not only from the Anglican Prayer-book and Queen Elizabeth's episcopacy, but from all national churches. Between them there was sharp contention — a controversy quite as earnest and almost as bitter as that which they both had with the ecclesiastico-political power that oppressed them both, fining and imprisoning the Puritan, and visiting upon the Separatist the added penalties of exile and the gallows. The Pilgrim wanted liberty for himself and his wife and little ones, and for his brethren, to walk with God in a Christian life as the rules and motives of such a life were revealed to him from God's Word. For that he went into exile; for that he crossed

¹ It is to be noted that Hunter himself made no such distinction between the Pilgrims of Plymouth and the Puritans of Massachusetts. "Those who followed Governor Winthrop," he wrote in 1847, "from his own country may not improperly be designated the *Second Puritan Emigration*, — the *First* being formed of those who had been of Mr. Robinson's church, and founded Plymouth, and the emigrants from Dorchester" (3 Massachusetts Historical Collections, x. 171).

² Oration (1871), pp. 10, 42-43, 45.

the ocean; for that he made his home in a wilderness. The Puritan's idea was not liberty, but right government in church and state — such government as should not only permit him, but also compel other men to walk in the right way.¹

In 1876 John A. Goodwin remarked:

The most common error is to speak of the Pilgrims as Puritans. Yet they never called themselves Puritans and were never known as such by their contemporaries. Puritan divines preached against them while they were in England; Puritan tractarians assailed them while they halted in Holland, and Puritan hostility nearly destroyed their settlement at Plymouth. In that day the term Puritan had a definite meaning, and it can with no propriety be applied to the Pilgrim Fathers. . . . Whatever reforms the Puritan desired, he sought to make within the church. Separation he denounced as schism — a deadly sin. Thus the Puritans were Episcopalians — the low-church wing of their day.²

In 1878 the Rev. Increase N. Tarbox wrote:

Let us make another distinction. The people of Plymouth were called Pilgrims, and when we speak of the Pilgrim Fathers, we have special reference to them. The people that settled Salem and Boston and the surrounding towns were known as Puritans, and when we speak of the Puritan Fathers, in our early history, if we use and understand historical language correctly, we shall have primary reference to these dwellers in Massachusetts Bay. The little companies that soon after went out to begin the settlements at Hartford and New Haven, came from the same general class in English society. Indeed, they passed through the gateway of the Bay, to go and found those Connecticut colonies. They were also Puritans. Many persons use these terms indiscriminately, and speak of Pilgrims or Puritans as meaning the same thing. But this is only a confused use of language. Let us ever bear in mind that by the name of Pilgrim Fathers, we designate particularly the men of Plymouth, while the Puritan Fathers are the men of the Massachusetts Bay and the colonies that grew directly out of that.³

¹ Genesis of the New England Churches, pp. ix-x.

² The Pilgrim Fathers (1877), pp. 15, 16. See p. 377 note 2 above.

³ "The Pilgrims and Puritans: or, Plymouth and the Massachusetts Bay," in Collections of the Old Colony Historical Society (1879), No. 1, p. 28. Tarbox quotes Scott's lecture at length.

In 1886 William Everett said:

Brethren, how far are we to carry the parallel? We are proud of our descent from the Pilgrims and our inheritance of that birthright they won so hard. We had rather claim kindred with them than with the heroes of the war for the Union and the struggle for Independence, with the signers of the Constitution and the Declaration. We will not own the name of Puritan for our fathers, though that name would link them with Conant and Endicott, with Winthrop and Cotton, with the apostle Eliot and the martyr Vane.¹

And in 1895 Senator George F. Hoar wrote:

The commonwealths which were united in 1692 and became the Province of Massachusetts Bay are still blended in the popular conception. Their founders are supposed to have the same general characteristics, and are known to the rest of the world by the common title of New England Puritans. I suppose this belief prevails even in New England, except to a small circle of scholars and descendants of the Pilgrims who still dwell in the Old Colony, and who have studied personally the history of their ancestors. Many of our historians have treated the two with little distinction, except that the suffering of the Pilgrim, the dangerous and romantic voyage of the *Mayflower*, the story of the landing in December and the hardship of the first winter have made, of course, a series of pictures of their own. Even Mr. Webster, after narrating as could have been done by no other chronicler who ever lived, these picturesque incidents, proceeds in his oration of 1820 to discuss the principles which lay at the foundation of the Puritan State, and which were, in the main, common to both communities.

Yet the dwellers of Plymouth know well the difference between the Pilgrim that landed here and the Puritan that settled in Salem and Boston. . . .

Massachusetts has educated the foreigner. She is making an American of him. She is surely, and not very slowly, when we consider the great periods that constitute the life of a State, impressing upon him what is best of the Pilgrim and the Puritan quality and the Pilgrim and the Puritan conception of a State.²

The distinction now so sharply drawn between the Pilgrims of Plymouth and the Puritans of Massachusetts thus appears to be due

¹ Discourse (1887), p. 8.

² In Proceedings, etc. (1896), pp. 14-15, 42.

to two causes: first, to the belief that the word Pilgrims belongs exclusively or peculiarly to the Plymouth settlers; and secondly, to the notion, which first made its appearance only about half a century ago, that the early Plymouth settlers were not Puritans, while those of Massachusetts were. The purpose of this section has been to show the genesis of this distinction, not to submit that distinction to a critical examination. Yet a few comments may be permissible. Nowadays the fact is too often overlooked that the Plymouth Colony was, except during the first decade of its existence, of slight importance. In 1813 Judge Davis, himself a native of Plymouth, wrote:

In ten years from the commencement of Plymouth Colony the number of inhabitants did not exceed three hundred. In an equal space of time from the settlement of Massachusetts, more than twenty thousand persons had arrived, and three hundred ships had been employed in their transportation. In money and commodities, in artizans of every necessary description, in the means of defence, and all the furniture of a state, there was a correspondent superiority.¹

After 1643 Plymouth Colony, as our associate Mr. Worthington C. Ford has recently said, "as an historical factor . . . practically ceased to exist;"² and during the last fifty years of its existence as a separate colony, few persons found their way within its precincts. If, as Scott declared in 1866, the difference between Plymouth and Massachusetts was "wide, fundamental, and irreconcilable," how comes it that, almost within a few days after reaching here, the Boston settlers themselves became Separatists and adopted the Congregationalism of Plymouth? It is true that no one in Plymouth Colony was put to death for witchcraft, but that fact was not due to a disbelief in witchcraft, for among the capital laws adopted by Plymouth in 1636 was "Solemn Compaction or conversing wth the devill by way of witchcraft conjuracon or the like" — a law that remained on the statute book for many years.³ And though no

¹ Discourse (1814), p. 8.

² Bradford's History (1912), vol. i. p. xv.

³ Plymouth Colony Records, xi. 12, 95, 172. In the Book of the General Laws, etc., 1672, p. 4; and in the Book of the General Laws, etc., 1685, p. 10, the law read as follows:

Witchcraft.

8. If any Christian (so-called) be a Witch, that is, hath, or consulteth with a Familiar Spirit; he or they shall be put to Death.

Quaker was put to death in Plymouth Colony, yet Quakers were apprehended and banished in 1657 and disfranchized in 1658, and their books were seized and presented in court in 1659.¹ In short, it may well be doubted whether the religious, intellectual, and moral differences between the Plymouth and the Massachusetts settlers were so fundamental as some recent writers would have us believe; and certain it is that these writers have occasionally gone astray in their judgments.² Finally, much confusion will be avoided by always bearing in mind that the terms Pilgrims and Pilgrim Fathers, as

¹ Plymouth Colony Records, iii. 111, 123, 167, xi. 101, 121. Mr. Scott can acquit the Pilgrim Fathers of persecuting the Quakers only by strictly limiting that term to the Mayflower passengers (see p. 377, above) and then by killing them off before some of them actually died. "In 1656," he says, "every leader of that party, whose name history has recorded, was in his grave" (p. 34), including Governor Bradford. As a matter of fact Bradford did not die until May 9, 1657. The first legislation against the Quakers was at a Court of Assistants on February 3, 1657, at which Bradford was himself present as Governor. At that time John Alden was Treasurer and also an Assistant, and John Cooke and John Howland were Deputies: hence four of the Mayflower passengers were concerned in the earliest legislation against the Quakers. It is not of course my intention to dispute the generally accepted view that the sway of Plymouth was milder and more tolerant than was that of Massachusetts, but clearly some of Mr. Scott's statements are open to criticism. The popular notion as to the treatment of the Quakers by the Plymouth Colony is singularly at fault. Thus in 1870 Emerson said: "It is the honorable distinction of that first colony of Plymouth, of the Pilgrims, not of the Puritans, that they did not persecute; that those same persons who were driven out of Massachusetts then were received in Plymouth. They did not banish the Quakers" (in *New England Society Orations*, ii. 388). As a matter of fact, Quakers in the Plymouth Colony were not only, as stated in the text, apprehended, banished, and disfranchized, but were imprisoned, sent to the house of correction, put in stocks or cage, whipped, fined for attending their meetings, and others were fined for harboring or encouraging them, etc. (See *Plymouth Colony Records*, vols. iii, xi.)

² An instance may be given. "I think the first Puritans," wrote the Rev. Thomas Robbins on February 5, 1807, "discovered something of a separatist spirit" (*Diary*, i. 316). To this remark, the Rev. I. N. Tarbox, who edited the *Diary*, appends this note:

The Pilgrims who came to Plymouth in 1620 were open and avowed Separatists. Mr. Robbins seems to imply that some of the Puritans who came to the Massachusetts Bay in 1629 and 1630 had something of the same idea, though they disowned the name of Separatists. He grounds his remark probably on what took place at Salem in 1629, in the organization of the first church in the Massachusetts Bay.

Robbins's remark stands by itself, without context. So obsessed was Dr. Tarbox with the notion that the word Pilgrims could be applied only to the early Plym-

used in American history, were unknown until the closing years of the eighteenth century.¹

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE PLYMOUTH DISCOURSES

List A, a chronological list, gives the year, the day of the month, the day of the week, the name of the body by whom the celebration was held, and the name of the speaker (if there was one) down to 1820; but after 1820 it includes only the celebrations at which were delivered discourses afterwards printed. List B is an alphabetical list of speakers with titles of the discourses printed, or, if a discourse was not printed, the year in which it was delivered.² Also, down to

outh settlers, while the word Puritans could mean only the early Massachusetts settlers, that, finding Robbins using the word Puritans, he inferred that Robbins must refer to the early Massachusetts settlers. Had he consulted Robbins's Historical View of the First Planters of New-England, published in 1815, he would have seen that Robbins frequently speaks of the early Plymouth settlers as Puritans; and that the distinction between the Pilgrims and the Puritans, upon which he himself insisted so strongly (see p. 380, above), was quite unknown to Robbins. It is possible that when he made his remark, Robbins had in mind the early Massachusetts settlers; but it is far more probable that by "the first Puritans" he meant those who preceded both the Plymouth and the Massachusetts settlers.

An amusing episode, thoroughly characteristic of Boston, occurred in 1907, when certain persons petitioned for the incorporation of the Pilgrim Trust Company of Boston. Objection to the name was raised by the counsel for the Puritan Trust Company, a distinguished citizen of Massachusetts, who said: "The name 'Puritan Trust Company' is valuable. There is a confusion in the public mind as to the Puritans and Pilgrims, and there would be sure to be confusion if there were two trust companies bearing such similar designations. The Pilgrims were a tolerant people who were not addicted to the burning of witches." To this the opposing counsel replied, "But the Puritans have been out of the witch burning business for some time." The persistency with which the erroneous notion that persons were burned in Massachusetts for witchcraft is adhered to and repeated by those who ought to know better, is extraordinary. (See the Boston Evening Transcript of July 31, 1907, p. 1/6).

¹ The expressions "Pilgrim martyr," referring to John Penry, who was executed in 1593; "Pilgrim church," meaning Robinson's church at Scrooby, England, afterwards removed to Amsterdam and then to Leyden; "Pilgrim press," in allusion to the press managed by Brewster and Brewer at Leyden; and other similar expressions are convenient and are now in frequent use, but are liable to misinterpretation unless the fact stated in the text is kept constantly in mind.

² For the sake of completeness, list B includes the titles not only of all printed discourses, but also of the volumes containing the proceedings at various cele-

1820, the place of residence of the speaker is given. An asterisk (*) denotes that a discourse was printed separately at the time. A dagger (†) denotes that a discourse was printed (in whole or in part) at a later time.¹

A

CHRONOLOGICAL LIST OF CELEBRATIONS

1769	Dec. 22	Fr	Old Colony Club	
1770†	" 24	Mo	" " "	E. Winslow, Jr.
1771	" 23	Mo	" " "	
1772	" 22	Tu	" " "	Rev. C. Robbins
1773*	" 22	We	" " "	Rev. C. Turner
1774*	" 22	Th	Town of Plymouth	Rev. G. Hitchcock
1775*	" 22	Fr	" " "	Rev. S. Baldwin
1776*	" 23	Mo	" " "	Rev. S. Conant
1777*	" 22	Mo	" " "	Rev. S. West
1778	" 22	Tu	" " "	Rev. T. Hilliard
1779	" 22	We	" " "	Rev. W. Shaw
1780	" 22	Fr	" " "	Rev. J. Moore
1781-1792			No celebration	
1793*	Dec. 22	Su	Town of Plymouth	Rev. C. Robbins
1794	" 22	Mo	Private celebration	
1795-1796			No celebration or private	
1797	Dec. 22	Fr	Private celebration	
1798	" 22	Sa	" "	Dr. Z. Bartlett
1799			No celebration	
1800†	Dec. 22	Mo	Town of Plymouth	J. Davis
1801*	" 22	Tu	" " "	Rev. J. Allyn
1802*	" 22	We	" " "	J. Q. Adams
1802*	" 22	We	Third Church	Rev. A. Judson
1803†	" 22	Th	Town of Plymouth	Rev. J. T. Kirkland
1803*	" 22	Th		Rev. J. Strong

brations — those held on August 1 in commemoration of the embarkation from Delft Haven as well as those on Forefathers' Day; and likewise of the Report, published in 1850, relating to the correct date of Forefathers' Day.

¹ Lists have been printed in Harris's Discourse (1808), p. 32; in Webster's Discourse (1821), pp. 103-104; in Thacher's History of the Town of Plymouth, pp. 369-371 of the 1832 edition, pp. 339-340 of the 1835 edition; in W. S. Russell's Guide to Plymouth (1846), pp. 280-283; and in W. T. Davis's Plymouth Town Records (1903), iii. 457-458; and cf. Sullivan's Discourse (1830), p. 42. None of these lists, however, is either complete or wholly accurate. The present lists owe what completeness and accuracy they may have largely to our associate Mr. Arthur Lord, who owns a complete set of the printed discourses and has furnished several titles that otherwise would have escaped me. I am also indebted to Mr. Lord for information derived from the records of the Pilgrim Society (p. 320 note 2, above).

It is curious that the word Pilgrims first occurs in these titles in 1826 (R. S. Storrs), and the term Pilgrim Fathers in 1828 (S. Green).

1804*	Dec. 21	Fr	Town of Plymouth	A. Bradford
1805	" 22	Su		Rev. J. Kendall ¹
1806*	" 22	Mo	Town of Plymouth	Rev. A. Holmes
1806*	" 22	Mo	Second Church	Rev. S. Stetson
1807	" 22	Tu	Town of Plymouth	Rev. J. Freeman
1808*	" 22	Th	" " "	Rev. T. M. Harris
1809*	" 22	Fr	" " "	Rev. A. Abbot
1810			No celebration	
1811	Dec. 22	Su	Town of Plymouth	Rev. J. Eliot
1812-1814			No celebration	
1815*	Dec. 22	Fr	Town of Plymouth	Rev. J. Flint
1816†	" 22	Su	First Church	Rev. E. S. Goodwin
1817	" 22	Mo	Town of Plymouth	Rev. H. Holley
1818	" 22	Tu	" " "	W. Davis
1819	" 22	We	Pilgrim Society	F. C. Gray
1820*	" 22	Fr	" "	D. Webster
1821*	" 23	Su	Third Church	Rev. W. T. Torrey
1824*	" 22	We	Pilgrim Society	E. Everett
1826*	" 22	Fr	Third Church	Rev. R. S. Storrs
1827*	" 22	Sa	" "	Rev. L. Beecher
1828*	" 22 ²	Mo		Rev. S. Green
1829*	" 22	Tu	Pilgrim Society	W. Sullivan
1830*	" 22	We	Pilgrim Association ³	Rev. B. B. Wisner
1831*	" 22	Th	" "	Rev. J. Codman
1831*	" 22	Th	Robinson Congregation	Rev. A. Cobb ⁴

¹ It was stated in the last note that the lists hitherto printed have not been wholly accurate. All such lists (except that of W. T. Davis, 1903) state that Alden Bradford's Sermon was delivered in 1805. This is an error for 1804, in which year December 22d fell on Saturday and the celebration took place on the 21st: see p. 301 note 1, above. All such lists also contain this entry: "1804. (Lord's day) Rev. Mr. KENDALL preached from Heb. xi. 13*," the asterisk denoting that the sermon was not printed. But it was in 1805 that December 22 fell on Sunday. Clearly, therefore, the previous lists have transposed the discourses delivered in 1804 and 1805.

² See p. 388 note 2, below.

³ Mr. Lord informs me that the discourses of the Rev. B. B. Wisner in 1830 and the Rev. J. Codman in 1831 were delivered before the Third Church as well as the Pilgrim Association, and that the Pilgrim Association was apparently composed of members of the Third Church, though the Pilgrim Association only is mentioned in the discourses themselves. This notion is borne out by an entry made by the Rev. Thomas Robbins on December 22, 1831:

Anniversary. . . . Attended the exercises in Mr. Kendall's meeting-house. Mr. Brazier, of Salem, had a very good sermon, excepting its Unitarianism. . . . Went to Mr. Freeman's and sat awhile with the Pilgrim Association. Mr. Codman preached today in his meeting-house (Diary, 1887, ii. 247).

The Rev. Frederick Freeman was pastor of the Third Church. The sermon preached by the Rev. John Brazer in the First Church was not printed.

⁴ See p. 383 note 1, below.

1832*	Dec. 22	Sa	First Parish	Rev. C. Francis
1834*	" 22	Mo	Pilgrim Society	Rev. G. W. Blagden
1835*	" 22	Tu	" "	P. Sprague
1846*	" 22	Tu	" "	Rev. M. Hopkins
1848*	" 22	Fr	" "	Rev. S. M. Worcester
1851*	" 22	Mo	Pilgrim Society	A. C. Spooner
1853	Aug. 1		" "	Various speakers ¹
1855*	Dec. 21	Fr	" "	W. H. Seward
1870*	" 21	We	" "	R. C. Winthrop
1886*	" 19	Su	First Church	W. Everett
1889	Aug. 1		Pilgrim Society	Various speakers ²
1895*	Dec. 21	Sa	" "	G. F. Hoar

B

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF SPEAKERS AND DISCOURSES

ABBOT, REV. ABIEL, Beverly. A Discourse delivered at Plymouth December 22, 1809, at the Celebration of the 188th Anniversary of the Landing of our Forefathers in that Place. . . . Boston: . . . 1810.

An ACCOUNT of the Pilgrim Celebration at Plymouth, August 1, 1853, containing a list of the Decorations in the Town, and correct copies of the Speeches made at the dinner-table. Revised by the Pilgrim Society. Boston: . . . 1853.³

ADAMS, JOHN QUINCY, Boston. An Oration, Delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1802. At the Anniversary Commemoration of the First Landing of our Ancestors, at that Place. . . . Boston, . . . 1802.

ALLYN, REV. JOHN, Duxbury. A Sermon, delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1801, Commemorative of the Pious Ancestry, who first immigrated to that place, 1620. . . . Boston: . . . 1802.

BALDWIN, REV. SAMUEL, Hanover. A Sermon, preached at Plymouth, December 22, 1775. Being the Anniversary Thanksgiving, in commemoration of the first landing of the Fathers of New-England, there; anno domini, 1620. . . . Boston, . . . MDCCLXXVI.

BARTLETT, DR. ZACCHEUS, Plymouth. 1798.

BEECHER, REV. LYMAN. The Memory of our Fathers. A Sermon delivered at Plymouth, on the Twenty-second of December, 1827. . . . Boston: . . . 1828.

BLAGDEN, REV. GEORGE WASHINGTON. Great Principles associated with Plymouth Rock. An Address delivered before the Pilgrim Society of Plymouth, December 22, 1834. . . . Boston: . . . 1835.

BRADFORD, ALDEN, Boston. A Sermon delivered At Plymouth, December 21st, 1804; the Anniversary of the Landing of Our Fathers In December, 1620. . . . Boston: . . . Jan. 1805.

¹ The celebration on August 1, 1853, was to commemorate the embarkation from Delft Haven. At least three of the speeches then delivered were printed separately: see E. Everett, C. Sumner, R. Yeadon.

² The celebration of August 1, 1889, was to commemorate the completion of the National Monument to the Pilgrims at Plymouth.

³ Of the speeches delivered on this occasion, at least three were printed separately: see E. Everett, C. Sumner, R. Yeadon.

COBB, REV. ALVAN. God's Culture of his Vineyard. A Sermon, delivered at Plymouth before the Robinson Congregation, on the 22d of December, 1831. . . . Taunton: . . . 1832.¹

CODMAN, REV. JOHN. The Faith of the Pilgrims. A Sermon delivered at Plymouth, on the Twenty-second of December, 1831. . . . Boston: . . . 1832.

CONANT, REV. SYLVESTER, Middleborough. An Anniversary Sermon preached at Plymouth, December 23, 1776. In grateful Memory of the first Landing of our worthy Ancestors in that Place, An. Dom. 1620. . . . Boston, . . . 1777.

DAVIS, JOHN, Boston. 1800. *Extracts are printed in J. Morse and E. Parish, Compendious History of New England, 1804, pp. 373-378; and in 1 Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society, i. 217, 217 note, 507-510.*

DAVIS, WENDELL, Sandwich. 1818.

ELIOT, REV. JOHN, Boston. 1811.

EVERETT, EDWARD. An Oration delivered at Plymouth December 22, 1824. . . . Boston. . . . 1825.

EVERETT, EDWARD. Remarks at the Plymouth Festival, on the First of August, 1853, in commemoration of the Embarkation of the Pilgrims. . . . Boston: . . . 1853. *See also An ACCOUNT, etc., 1853.*

EVERETT, WILLIAM. Discourse delivered in the First Church of Plymouth, Mass. 19 December, 1886 in commemoration of the Pilgrim Fathers. . . . Boston . . . 1887

FLINT, REV. JAMES, Bridgewater. A Discourse delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1815, at the anniversary commemoration of the First Landing of our Ancestors at that Place. . . . Boston: . . . 1816.

FRANCIS, REV. CONVERS. A Discourse delivered at Plymouth, Mass. Dec. 22, 1832, in commemoration of the Landing of the Fathers. . . . Plymouth: . . . 1832.

FREEMAN, REV. JAMES, Boston. 1807.

GOODWIN, REV. EZRA SHAW, Sandwich. The Providence of God in the Settlement of New England. Isaiah lx. 22. *Printed in Sermons, by the late Rev. Ezra Shaw Goodwin, Pastor of the First Church and Society in Sandwich, Mass. With a Memoir.* Boston: . . . 1834. (Pp. 33-50.)

GRAY, FRANCIS CALLEY, Boston. 1819.

GREEN, REV. SAMUEL. A Discourse, delivered at Plymouth, Dec. 20,² 1828, on the two hundred and eighth anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrim Fathers. . . . Boston: . . . 1829.

¹ On Dec. 22, 1831, the Rev. Thomas Robbins noted that "A new society has lately been formed here by the division of Mr. Freeman's" (Diary, ii. 247), and W. T. Davis states that the Third Church was "the parent of three children," one being the "Robinson Church organized in 1830" (Ancient Landmarks of Plymouth, 1883, pp. 102-103). The half-title of Mr. Cobb's sermon reads: "Rev. Mr. Cobb's Pilgrim Sermon."

² The date in the title-page is December 20. At the close of his Discourse Mr. Green says that "The little island on which they kept their first Sabbath, 208 years ago yesterday, still stands as a modest remembrancer of our fathers' piety," and adds this note:

A small Island in Plymouth harbor, called Clark's Island, seen from the shore, on which an exploring party landed on Saturday evening, supposing it to

HARRIS, Rev. THADDEUS MASON, Dorchester. A Discourse delivered at Plymouth, Dec. 22d. 1808, at the Anniversary Commemoration of the Landing of our Ancestors at that Place. . . . Boston, . . . 1808.

HILLIARD, Rev. TIMOTHY, Barnstable. 1778.

HITCHCOCK, Rev. GAD, Pembroke. A Sermon preached at Plymouth December 22d, 1774. Being the Anniversary Thanksgiving, in Commemoration of the first Landing of our New-England Ancestors in that Place, Anno Dom. 1620. . . . Boston: . . . 1775.

HOAR, GEORGE FRISBIE. Oration delivered at Plymouth, December 21, 1895, at the celebration of the two hundred and seventy-fifth anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrims, . . . Washington, D. C., 1895. *See also PROCEEDINGS, etc.*, 1896.

HOLLEY, Rev. HORACE, Boston. 1817.

HOLMES, Rev. ABIEL, Cambridge. A Discourse, delivered at Plymouth, 22 December, 1806, at the Anniversary Commemoration of the first landing of the Fathers, A.D. 1620. . . . Cambridge, . . . 1806.

HOPKINS, Rev. MARK. A Sermon, delivered at Plymouth, on the Twenty-second of December, 1846. . . . Boston: . . . 1847.

JUDSON, Rev. ADONIRAM, Plymouth. A Sermon, preached in the New Meeting House, Plymouth, December 22, 1802, in Memory of the Landing of our Ancestors, December 22, 1620. . . . Boston: . . . 1803.

KENDALL, Rev. JAMES, Plymouth. 1805.¹

KIRKLAND, Rev. JOHN THORNTON, Boston. 1803. *An extract is printed in J. Morse and E. Parish, Compendious History of New England, 1804, pp. 381-384.*²

MOORE, Rev. JONATHAN, Rochester. 1780.

The PROCEEDINGS at the Celebration by the Pilgrim Society at Plymouth, December 21, 1870, of the Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrims. Cambridge: . . . 1871.³

The PROCEEDINGS at the Celebration by the Pilgrim Society at Plymouth, August 1st, 1889 of the completion of the National Monument to the Pilgrims. Plymouth: . . . 1889.

be the main land. Here they rested on the holy Sabbath, devoting the day to the worship of God, and on Monday morning came on shore at Plymouth. This discourse was delivered on Monday, the same day of the week, as well as of the month, on which our fathers landed on the Plymouth rock (p. 36 and note).

It thus appears that Mr. Green's Discourse was delivered Monday, but in 1828 Monday was December 22; hence the date December 20 in the title-page is a typographical error for December 22. Mr. Green was mistaken in supposing that his Discourse was delivered on the same day of the month, though it was the same day of the week, as that on which the Pilgrims landed, for that day was Monday, December 21, 1620: see p. 297 note 2, above.

¹ Cf. p. 386 note 1, above.

² In his Discourse (pp. 18-19) of 1848, the Rev. Samuel M. Worcester quoted "the late amiable and accomplished Dr. Kirkland, in his discourse delivered at Plymouth, forty-five years since." The passage quoted occurs at p. 383 of the work cited in the text.

³ The oration delivered in 1870 was separately printed: see R. C. Winthrop.

The PROCEEDINGS at the Celebration by the Pilgrim Society, at Plymouth, December 21, 1895, of the 275th anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrims. Plymouth: . . . 1896.¹

REPORT on the Expediency of celebrating in future the Landing of the Pilgrims, on the Twentyfirst Day of December, instead of the Twentysecond Day of that Month. By a Committee of the Pilgrim Society. Boston: . . . 1850.²

ROBBINS, REV. CHANDLER, Plymouth. 1772.³

ROBBINS, REV. CHANDLER, Plymouth. A Sermon preached at Plymouth, December 22, 1793; being the anniversary of the landing of our Ancestors in that place, in 1620. Published at the request of those who heard it, and others; with some enlargements, and particular anecdotes relating to their sufferings before they left England; never before published. . . . Boston: . . . 1794.

SEWARD, WILLIAM HENRY. Oration by William H. Seward, at Plymouth, December 21, 1855. Albany: . . . 1856.⁴

SHAW, REV. WILLIAM, Marshfield. 1779.

SPOONER, ALLEN CROCKER. Speech of Allen C. Spooner, Esq. before the Pilgrim Society, at Plymouth, Dec. 22, MDCCCLI, in reply to the toast, "The Faith of the Pilgrims — May it be our Pillar of Fire, to guide us alike in the day of prosperity and the night of trial." Boston: . . . [No date]

SPRAGUE, PELEG. An Address delivered before the Pilgrim Society of Plymouth, December 22, 1835. Boston: . . . 1836.

STETSON, REV. SETI, Plymouth. The Substance of a Discourse preached in the Second Parish, Plymouth, December 22, 1806, in memory of the Landing of our Forefathers, 22 December, 1620. . . . Boston: . . . 1807.

STORRS, REV. RICHARD SALTER, Braintree. The Spirit of the Pilgrims. A Sermon Delivered at Plymouth, December the twenty-second, 1826. . . . Plymouth: . . . 1827.

¹ The oration delivered in 1895 was separately printed: see G. F. Hoar.

² This title is added for the sake of completeness.

³ In his sermon on December 23, 1776, the Rev. S. Conant said: "The most noted *historical facts*, relative to the coming over of our fore-fathers, have been named in the first public Sermon on this occasion, from *Psalm lxxviii*. 5, 6, 7" (Anniversary Sermon, 1777, p. 6). In 1815 a writer, referring to Robbins's sermon of 1772, stated (2 Massachusetts Historical Collections, iii. 176-177) that "This discourse was printed at their request" — that is, at the request of the Old Colony Club. What the Old Colony Club did was to appoint a committee on January 6, 1773, to "write a letter of thanks to the rev^d M^r Robbins for his sermon on the 22d ult., and request a copy thereof." Mr. Robbins took the matter under consideration, and, having decided to accede to the request, on February 23, 1773, wrote a letter in which he said, "I now present you a copy of said sermon, with liberty to make what use of it you shall think proper;" and this letter, "together with the Anniversary sermon in manuscript," was received by the Club on February 24 (2 Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society, iii. 435, 436-437, 439). But the sermon was never printed.

⁴ Seward's Oration was also among the "Documents published by the Republican Association of Washington City," 1856, it being issued in a sixteen-page pamphlet without title-page, the heading on p. 1 reading, "Oration by William H. Seward, at Plymouth, December 21, 1855"

STRONG, Rev. JONATHAN, Randolph. A Sermon, delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1803, at the Anniversary Commemoration of the First Landing of our Ancestors at that Place. . . . Boston: . . . 1804.

SULLIVAN, WILLIAM. A Discourse delivered before the Pilgrim Society, at Plymouth, on the Twenty Second Day of December, 1829. . . . Boston. . . . M DCCC XXX.

SUMNER, CHARLES. A Finger-Point from Plymouth Rock. Remarks at the Plymouth Festival, on the First of August, 1853. In commemoration of the Embarkation of the Pilgrims. . . . Boston: . . . 1853. *See also* AN ACCOUNT, etc., 1853.

TORREY, Rev. WILLIAM TURNER. A Sermon, delivered in Plymouth, Dec. 23, 1821, on the Lord's Day after the anniversary of the Landing of the Fathers. . . . Boston: . . . 1822.

TURNER, Rev. CHARLES, Duxbury. A Sermon, preached at Plymouth, December 22d, 1773. Being the Anniversary Thanksgiving, in Commemoration of the Landing of the Fathers there, A. D. 1620. . . . Boston: . . . M,DCC,LXXIV.

WEBSTER, DANIEL, Boston. A Discourse, delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1820. In Commemoration of the first Settlement of New-England. . . . Boston: . . . 1821.

WEST, Rev. SAMUEL, Dartmouth. An Anniversary Sermon, Preached at Plymouth, December 22d, 1777. In grateful Memory of the first Landing of our pious New-England Ancestors In that Place, A.D. 1620. . . . Boston: . . . [No date, but 1778]

WINSLOW, EDWARD, Jr., Plymouth. 1771. *Printed in 2 Proceedings Massachusetts Historical Society*, iii. 416-417.

WINTHROP, ROBERT CHARLES. Oration on the Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary of the Landing of the Pilgrim Fathers at Plymouth. 21 December, 1870. . . . Boston: . . . 1871. *See also* PROCEEDINGS, etc., 1871.

WISNER, Rev. BENJAMIN BLYDENBURG. Influence of Religion on Liberty. A Discourse in commemoration of the Landing of the Pilgrims, delivered at Plymouth, December 22, 1830. . . . Boston: . . . 1831.

WORCESTER, Rev. SAMUEL MELANCTHON. New England's Glory and Crown. A Discourse, delivered at Plymouth, Mass., December 22, 1848. . . . Salem: . . . 1849.¹

YEADON, RICHARD. Speech of Richard Yeadon, Esq., of Charleston, S. C. at the Pilgrim Celebration, at Plymouth, Mass., August 1, 1853. Extract from the Boston Courier, August 5th, 1853. "On the first page we have placed the patriotic speech of Mr. Yeadon, at the Pilgrim Dinner, at Plymouth, on the 1st instant, which speech was complimented by hisses from certain crazy and rabid abolitionists." New-York: . . . 1853. *See also* PROCEEDINGS, etc., 1853.²

¹ Another edition has this title: "New England's Glory and Crown. A Discourse, delivered at Plymouth, Mass., December 22, 1848. . . . Second Edition. Boston: . . . 1849."

² The corner-stone of the monument erected at Provincetown was laid August 20, 1907 (see p. 293, above), and the monument was dedicated August 20, 1910. The proceedings on both occasions were printed in a book bearing the following title: "The Pilgrims and their Monument By Edmund J. Carpenter, Litt.D. . . . Illustrated . . . New York MCMXI"

