

Propositional Logic– Resolution (6A)

Copyright (c) 2016 Young W. Lim.

Permission is granted to copy, distribute and/or modify this document under the terms of the GNU Free Documentation License, Version 1.2 or any later version published by the Free Software Foundation; with no Invariant Sections, no Front-Cover Texts, and no Back-Cover Texts. A copy of the license is included in the section entitled "GNU Free Documentation License".

Please send corrections (or suggestions) to youngwlim@hotmail.com.

This document was produced by using LibreOffice

Based on

Contemporary Artificial Intelligence,
R.E. Neapolitan & X. Jiang

Logic and Its Applications,
Burkey & Foxley

Definitions

A **literal** :

A proposition of the form A or $\neg A$,
Where A is an atomic proposition other than True or False

A **conjunctive clause** \wedge
A **conjunction** of **literal**

A **disjunctive clause** \vee
A **disjunction** of **literal**

A **disjunctive normal form** proposition
The **disjunction** of **conjunctive clause**

A **conjunctive normal form** proposition
The **conjunction** of **disjunctive clause**

Definitions

A **literal** :

$A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n, B_1, B_2, \dots, B_n, C_1, C_2, \dots, C_n$

A **conjunctive clause** $(A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n)$

A **disjunctive clause** $(B_1 \vee B_2 \vee \dots \vee B_n)$

A **disjunctive normal form** proposition

$(A_1 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n) \vee (B_1 \wedge \dots \wedge B_n) \vee (C_1 \wedge \dots \wedge C_n)$

A **conjunctive normal form** proposition

$(A_1 \vee \dots \vee A_n) \wedge (B_1 \vee \dots \vee B_n) \wedge (C_1 \vee \dots \vee C_n)$

Logical Equivalences

Commutativity Law

$$A \wedge B \equiv B \wedge A, \quad A \vee B \equiv B \vee A$$

Distributivity Law

$$A \wedge (B \vee C) \equiv (A \wedge B) \vee (A \wedge C), \quad A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

De Morgan's Law

$$\neg(A \wedge B) \equiv \neg A \vee \neg B, \quad \neg(A \vee B) \equiv \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

Implication Elimination

$$A \Rightarrow B \equiv \neg A \vee B$$

If and Only If Elimination

$$A \Leftrightarrow B \equiv (A \Rightarrow B) \wedge (B \Rightarrow A) \equiv (\neg A \vee B) \wedge (\neg B \vee A)$$

Double Negation

$$\neg\neg A \equiv A$$

$$A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

$$(A \vee B) \wedge C \equiv (A \wedge C) \vee (B \wedge C)$$

Logical Equivalences

Commutativity Law

$$A \wedge B \equiv B \wedge A, \quad A \vee B \equiv B \vee A$$

Distributivity Law

$$A \wedge (B \vee C) \equiv (A \wedge B) \vee (A \wedge C), \quad A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

De Morgan's Law

$$\neg(A \wedge B) \equiv \neg A \vee \neg B, \quad \neg(A \vee B) \equiv \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

Implication Elimination

$$A \Rightarrow B \equiv \neg A \vee B$$

If and Only If Elimination

$$A \Leftrightarrow B \equiv (A \Rightarrow B) \wedge (B \Rightarrow A) \equiv (\neg A \vee B) \wedge (\neg B \vee A)$$

Double Negation

$$\neg\neg A \equiv A$$

$$\begin{aligned} \neg((P \Rightarrow Q) \wedge \neg R) &\equiv \neg((\neg P \vee Q) \wedge \neg R) && \text{Implication Elimination} \\ &\equiv \neg(\neg P \vee Q) \vee \neg\neg R && \text{De Morgan's Law} \\ &\equiv \neg(\neg P \vee Q) \vee R && \text{Double Negation} \\ &\equiv (\neg\neg P \wedge \neg Q) \vee R && \text{De Morgan's Law} \\ &\equiv (P \wedge \neg Q) \vee R && \text{Double Negation} \\ &\equiv (P \vee R) \wedge \neg(\neg Q \vee R) && \text{Distributive Law} \end{aligned}$$

Logical Equivalences

Commutativity Law

$$A \wedge B \equiv B \wedge A, \quad A \vee B \equiv B \vee A$$

Distributivity Law

$$A \wedge (B \vee C) \equiv (A \wedge B) \vee (A \wedge C), \quad A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

De Morgan's Law

$$\neg(A \wedge B) \equiv \neg A \vee \neg B, \quad \neg(A \vee B) \equiv \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

Implication Elimination

$$A \Rightarrow B \equiv \neg A \vee B$$

If and Only If Elimination

$$A \Leftrightarrow B \equiv (A \Rightarrow B) \wedge (B \Rightarrow A) \equiv (\neg A \vee B) \wedge (\neg B \vee A)$$

Double Negation

$$\neg\neg A \equiv A$$

$$\begin{aligned} (P \wedge Q) \vee (R \wedge S) &\equiv ((P \wedge Q) \vee R) \wedge ((P \wedge Q) \vee S) && \text{Distributive Law} \\ &\equiv (P \vee R) \wedge (Q \vee R) \wedge ((P \wedge Q) \vee S) && \text{Distributive Law} \\ &\equiv (P \vee R) \wedge (Q \vee R) \wedge (P \vee S) \wedge (Q \vee S) && \text{Distributive Law} \end{aligned}$$

Conjunctive Normal Form Algorithm

Procedure **Conj_Normal_From** (var Proposition);

Remove all " \leftrightarrow "

Remove all " \rightarrow "

Repeat

$$\neg\neg A \equiv A$$

$$\neg(A \wedge B) \equiv \neg A \vee \neg B$$

$$\neg(A \vee B) \equiv \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

Until the only negations are **single negations** of **atomic propositions**

Repeat

$$A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

$$(A \wedge B) \vee C \equiv (A \vee C) \wedge (B \vee C)$$

Until proposition is in conjunctive normal form

Conjunctive Normal Form Algorithm – detail

Input: a proposition

Output : a logically equivalent proposition in conjunctive normal form

Procedure **Conj_Normal_From** (var Proposition);

Remove all " \leftrightarrow " using the iff elimination law;

Remove all " \Rightarrow " using the implication elimination law;

Repeat

If there are any double negations $\neg\neg$

Remove them using the double negation law;

If there are any negations of non-atomic propositions $\neg(A \wedge B)$, $\neg(A \vee B)$

Remove them using the DeMorgan's law;

Until the only negations are single negations of atomic propositions

Repeat

If there are any disjunctions in which one or more terms is a conjunction

Remove them using the following laws

$$A \vee (B \wedge C) \equiv (A \vee B) \wedge (A \vee C)$$

$$(A \wedge B) \vee C \equiv (A \vee C) \wedge (B \vee C);$$

Until proposition is in conjunctive normal form

Refutation

An argument consisting of
the premises A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n
and the conclusion B

The negation of the conclusion B

$$A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n \models B \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n \wedge \neg B \quad \text{Contradiction}$$

$$A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n \models B \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n \models \neg B \quad \text{False}$$

$$A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n \models B \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n \Rightarrow B \quad \text{Always True}$$

$$A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n \models B \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_n \Rightarrow B \quad \text{Tautology}$$

Resolution

$$(A \vee P), (B \vee \neg P) \models A \vee B$$

Resolution is on P

Resolvent : $A \vee B$

$$(A \vee P) \wedge (B \vee \neg P)$$

$$\text{When } P: (A \vee T) \wedge (B \vee F) \models B$$

$$\text{When } \neg P: (A \vee F) \wedge (B \vee T) \models A$$

$$(A \vee B)$$

$$(A \vee P) \wedge (B \vee \neg P)$$

$$A \wedge (B \vee \neg P) \vee P \wedge (B \vee \neg P)$$

$$(A \wedge B) \vee (A \wedge \neg P) \vee (P \wedge B) \vee (P \wedge \neg P)$$

$$\text{When } P: (A \wedge B) \vee (B) \models B$$

$$\text{When } \neg P: (A \wedge B) \vee (A) \models A$$

$$(A \vee B)$$

$$\cancel{(A \vee P)} \wedge \cancel{(B \vee \neg P)} \models A \vee B$$

Resolution

$$(A \vee P), (B \vee \neg P) \models A \vee B$$

Resolution is on P

Resolvent : $A \vee B$

$$(Q \vee P), (R \vee \neg P) \models Q \vee R$$

Resolution is on P

Resolvent : $Q \vee R$

$$(P \vee \neg Q \vee R), (\neg S \vee Q) \models P \vee R \vee \neg S$$

Resolution is on Q

Resolvent : $P \vee R \vee \neg S$

$$(A \vee \cancel{P}) \wedge (B \vee \cancel{\neg P}) \models A \vee B$$

$$(Q \vee \cancel{P}), (R \vee \cancel{\neg P}) \models Q \vee R$$

$$(P \vee \cancel{\neg Q} \vee R), (\neg S \vee \cancel{Q}) \models (P \vee R) \vee \neg S$$

Resolution

$A, (A \Rightarrow B) \models B$

CNF

$A, (\neg A \vee B)$ $A \wedge (\neg A \vee B) \Rightarrow (A \wedge \neg A) \vee (A \wedge B) \Rightarrow A, B \Rightarrow B$

- | | |
|----------------------|------------------------|
| 1. A | Premise |
| 2. $(\neg A \vee B)$ | Premise |
| 3. $\neg B$ | Negation of conclusion |
| 4. B | Resolvent 1 & 2 |
| 5. False | Resolvent of 3 & 4 |

$B \wedge \neg B \Rightarrow B, \neg B \Rightarrow \text{False}$

Resolution

$$(A \Rightarrow B), (B \Rightarrow C) \models (A \Rightarrow C)$$

CNF

$$(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)$$

$$\neg(\neg A \vee C) \equiv A \wedge \neg C \quad A, \neg C$$

1. $(\neg A \vee B)$ Premise
2. $(\neg B \vee C)$ Premise
3. A Added Premise from the Negation of conclusion
4. $\neg C$ Added Premise from the Negation of conclusion
5. B Resolvent of 1 & 3
6. $\neg B$ Resolvent of 2 & 4
7. False Resolvent of 5 & 6

$$\begin{array}{l} (\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C), A, \neg C \\ (\neg A \vee B) \wedge A \quad \rightarrow \quad A \wedge B \quad \rightarrow \quad A, B \\ (\neg B \vee C) \wedge \neg C \quad \rightarrow \quad \neg B \wedge \neg C \quad \rightarrow \quad \neg B, \neg C \\ B, \neg B \quad \rightarrow \quad \text{False} \end{array}$$

Resolution

Set_of_Support: initially the negation of the conclusion

Auxiliary_Set : no two clauses in this set resolve to **False** (all the premises)

Perform all possible resolutions

Where one clause is from the **Set of support**

All the **Resolvents** obtained in this way are added into the **Set of support**

each clause C in **Set_of_Support**

each clause D in **Auxiliary_Set** \cup **Set_of_Support**

Resolvents = set of clauses obtained by resolving C and D;

If **False** \in **Resolvents** **return True;**

else **New** = **New** \cup **Resolvents** **endif**

until **New** \subseteq **Set_of_Support**;

Resolution Algorithm

Set_of_Support_Resolution

Input: A set **Premises** containing the premises in an argument;
The **Conclusion** in the argument.

Output: The value **True** if **Premises entail Conclusion**; **False** otherwise

Function Premises_Entail_Conclusion (**Premises**, **Conclusion**)

Set_of_Support = clauses derived from the negation of **Conclusion**;

Auxiliary_Set = clauses derived from **Premises**;

New = { };

Repeat

Set_of_Support = **Set_of_Support** \cup **New**;

for each clause **C** in **Set_of_Support**

for each clauses **D** in **Auxiliary_Set** \cup **Set_of_Support**

Resolvents = set of clauses obtained by resolving **C** and **D**;

If **False** \in **Resolvents** **return** **True**;

else **New** = **New** \cup **Resolvents** **endif**

endfor

endfor

until **New** \subseteq **Set_of_Support**;

return **False**;

Resolution

Set_of_Support = clauses derived from the negation of **Conclusion**;
Set_of_Support = **Set_of_Support** \cup **New**;

Auxiliary_Set = clauses derived from **Premises**;

New = { };
New = **New** \cup **Resolvents**

each clause C in **Set_of_Support**
each clauses D in **Auxiliary_Set** \cup **Set_of_Support**
Resolvents = set of clauses obtained by resolving C and D;

If **False** \in **Resolvents** **return True**;
else **New** = **New** \cup **Resolvents** **endif**

until **New** \subseteq **Set_of_Support**;

Resolution

$A, (A \rightarrow B) \models B$

	New	Set of Support	Auxiliary Set
CNF	$\{\}$	$\{\}$	$\{\}$
$A, (\neg A \vee B), \neg B$	$\{\}$	$\{\neg B\}$	$\{A, (\neg A \vee B)\}$
$\neg B, (\neg A \vee B) \models \neg A$	$\{\neg A\}$		
	$\{\neg A\}$	$\{\neg B, \neg A\}$	$\{A, (\neg A \vee B)\}$
$\neg A, A \models \text{False}$	$\{\neg A, \text{False}\}$		

Resolution

$$(A \Rightarrow B), (B \Rightarrow C) \models (A \Rightarrow C)$$

	New	Set of Support	Auxiliary Set
CNF			
$(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C), A, \neg C$	$\{\}$	$\{\}$	$\{\}$
$A, (\neg A \vee B) \models B$	$\{\}$ $\{B\}$	$\{A, \neg C\}$ $\{A, \neg C\}$	$\{(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)\}$ $\{(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)\}$
$\neg C, (\neg B \vee C) \models \neg B$	$\{B\}$ $\{B, \neg B\}$	$\{A, \neg C, B\}$ $\{A, \neg C, B\}$	$\{(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)\}$ $\{(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)\}$
$\neg B, B \models \text{False}$	$\{B, \neg B\}$ $\{B, \neg B, \text{False}\}$	$\{A, \neg C, B, \neg B\}$	$\{(\neg A \vee B), (\neg B \vee C)\}$

Logical Equivalences

$\neg, \wedge,$
 \vee

$\neg, \wedge,$
 \vee

$\wedge \vee \neg \neg$
 $\Rightarrow \Leftrightarrow \equiv \equiv$
 \vDash

$\wedge \vee \neg \neg$
 $\Rightarrow \Leftrightarrow \equiv \equiv$
 \vDash

\Rightarrow
 \Leftrightarrow
 \equiv

\Rightarrow
 \Leftrightarrow
 \equiv

References

- [1] en.wikipedia.org
- [2] en.wiktionary.org
- [3] U. Endriss, “Lecture Notes : Introduction to Prolog Programming”
- [4] <http://www.learnprolognow.org/> Learn Prolog Now!
- [5] http://www.csupomona.edu/~jrfisher/www/prolog_tutorial
- [6] www.cse.unsw.edu.au/~billw/cs9414/notes/prolog/intro.html
- [7] www.cse.unsw.edu.au/~billw/dictionaries/prolog/negation.html
- [8] <http://ilppp.cs.lth.se/>, P. Nugues, `An Intro to Lang Processing with Perl and Prolog