Extrinsic motivation and internalisation

Reading: Reeve (2018)
Ch 5
(pp. 98–122)

James Neill
Discipline of Psychology
University of Canberra
2022

Extrinsic motivation
Environmental reason to engage in an action or activity.

“What’s in it for me?”
(gaining reward or avoiding punishment)

Extrinsic motivation - Example 1
CEO implements financial incentives to increase worker productivity:
- A-rated employees: Large wage increases
- B-rated employees: Modest wage increase
- C-rated employees: No wage increase

Uses positive reinforcement

Extrinsic motivation - Example 2
Car manufacturers reward drivers for wearing a seatbelt by including an alarm that goes off when the car is driven without seat belts being worn.
- Apathy towards wearing seat belts is overcome by having to work to remove the irritating event

Uses negative reinforcement

Extrinsic motivation - Example 3
Army instructor uses punishment to get recruits’ compliance with orders:
- Non-compliance is met with additional harsh physical training.

Uses positive punishment

Outline
- Extrinsic motivation
- Incentives and rewards
- Hidden costs of reward
- Intrinsic motivation
- Cognitive evaluation theory
- Types of extrinsic motivation
- Internalisation
- Amotivation
Extrinsic motivation - Example 4

Parent uses punishment when child doesn’t comply with requests:

- Non-compliance is met with withdrawal of privileges such as reading of a story before turning lights out.

Uses negative punishment

Incentives and consequences

\[ S : R \rightarrow C \]

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 100-101)

Reinforcer effectiveness

Reinforcer effectiveness depends on:

- Quality (e.g., intensity)
- Immediacy (vs. delay)
- Recipient’s need for, and perceived value of, the reward (person/reinforcer fit) (e.g., “one man’s meat is another man’s poison”)

External regulation of motivation: Incentives, consequences, and rewards

Based on operant conditioning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Incentives</th>
<th>Consequences</th>
<th>Rewards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental event that attracts or repels a person toward or away from a particular course of action. (e.g., wage increase, seat belt alarm, physical punishment)</td>
<td>Reinforcers: “Do”: +ve: ↑ behaviour to get desirable outcome (e.g., love) -ve: ↑ behaviour to avoid undesirable quality (e.g., criticism) Punishers: “Stop”: ↓ behaviour to avoid undesirable quality (e.g., speeding fine)</td>
<td>Offered by one person to another person in exchange for their service or achievement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How do rewards work?

- Enliven positive emotion and facilitate behaviour by signalling opportunity for personal gain.
- Provide unexpected turns for the better:
  - → releases dopamine
  - → Behavioural Activation System (BAS)
  - = Brain latching onto environmental signal of unexpected gain

Hidden cost of rewards

Extrinsic rewards can have unexpected, unintended, and adverse effects on intrinsic motivation, learning, and self-regulation.

Using a reward to engage someone in an activity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intended effect</th>
<th>Unintended effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promotes:</td>
<td>Undermines:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compliance</td>
<td>intrinsic motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(behavioural engagement in the activity)</td>
<td>quality and process of learning (encourages short-cuts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>capacity for autonomous self-regulation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Do punishers work?

Research shows that *punishment* is *ineffective* as a motivational strategy despite its popularity.

**Side effects**

- **Negative emotionality**  
  e.g., crying, screaming, feeling afraid

- **Impaired relationship**  
  between punisher and punishee

- **Negative modeling**  
  of how to cope with undesirable behaviour in others

---

Long-term consequences of corporal punishment

**Child**

- ↑ aggression
- ↑ antisocial behaviour
- ↓ mental health
- ↓ internalisation
- ↓ quality of child-parent relationship
- ↑ physical abuse

**Adult**

- ↑ aggression
- ↓ mental health
- ↑ alcoholism
- ↓ internalisation
- ↑ alcoholism
- ↑ child abuse
- ↑ criminal/antisocial

---

Benefits of incentives, consequences, and rewards

When there is no intrinsic motivation to be undermined, rewards can make an uninteresting task seem worth pursuing e.g.,

- Developing daily living skills, such as dressing
- Motivating children to start their homework
- Getting motorists to stop at stop signs
- Participating in recycling and energy conservation
- Teaching autistic children to initiate conversation
- Increasing older adults’ participating in physical activity

---

Reasons not to use extrinsic motivation (even for uninteresting endeavors)

- Undermines quality of performance and interferes with the process of learning.
- Should ask the harder question: why is someone being asked to do an uninteresting task in the first place?
- There are better ways to encourage participation than bribery.
- Undermines individual’s long-term capacity for autonomous self-regulation.

---

Intrinsic motivation

Inherent desire to engage one’s interests and to exercise and develop one’s capacities.

“I am doing this because it is …”

engaging in activity interesting, fun, enjoyable, satisfies psychological needs autonomy, competence, relatedness

“I just love it!”

(reward is the journey - enjoyment of the process)
Origins of intrinsic motivation

Intrinsic motivation

Psychological need satisfaction

- Autonomy
- Competence
- Relatedness

Autonomy support
Competence support
Relatedness support

Environment and relationships

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 5.2, p. 107)

Cognitive evaluation theory

Predicts effect of external events on I-E motivation based on how the events affect the psychological needs for competence and autonomy.

The extent to which events are perceived as either: controlling behaviour or informing competence determines the impact on I-E motivation.

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 112-114)

External event

Controlling behaviour

“If you do X, then you get Y.”

Informed competence

“Because you were able to do X, that means you are effective, competent.”

↓ intrinsic motivation
↓ learning
↓ self-regulation

↑ intrinsic motivation
↑ learning
↑ self-regulation

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 112-114)

Amotivation

Motivational apathy can be caused by a lack of:

- Autonomy
  - “I am not interested in the task”
  - “The task has no appeal or meaning to me”

- Competence
  - “I cannot effectively perform the required behaviour.”
  - “I cannot obtain the desired outcomes.”

- Relatedness
  - “I dislike the people involved in this activity.”
  - “I have no sense of connection with others in this domain”

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 119-120)

Taxonomy of motivation

Amotivation

Extrinsic motivation

Intrinsic motivation

External regulation
Introjected regulation
Identified regulation
Integrated regulation

Internalisation (increasing autonomy)

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 5.4, p. 114)

Types of extrinsic motivation

Example: “Why I Recycle”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of EM</th>
<th>External contingency</th>
<th>Reason I recycle</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External Regulation</td>
<td>Incentive, consequences</td>
<td>to get or to avoid a consequence</td>
<td>make 10c per can</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introjected Regulation</td>
<td>Avoid guilt, boost self-esteem</td>
<td>because I should</td>
<td>ought to, so feel good (not guilty) about myself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identified Regulation</td>
<td>Valuing, sense of importance</td>
<td>because it is important</td>
<td>Important for a cleaner environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Regulation</td>
<td>Value congruence</td>
<td>because it reflects my values</td>
<td>reflects and expresses who I am and what I believe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Reeve (2018, Table 5.1, p. 116)
Internalisation

- Transforming an external way of thinking or behaving into an internally-endorsed one.
- The “carrot and stick” are first internalised, then disappear altogether, to be replaced by authentic inner desire to perform the behaviour.
- With full integration, the person themselves - not the environment or society - generates the value, behaviour, or regulation.

Motivating others to do uninteresting activities

How to promote more autonomous extrinsic motivation

- **Explanatory rationale**: Explain *why* the activity is important and useful.
- **Build interest**: Catch situational interest in an activity and then develop individual interest in the activity over time.

Explanatory rationale - Example

A parent explains to a child why raking the leaves is an important and necessary thing to do:

“Raking the leaves is important because bushfire season is coming up and we don’t want the yard to catch on fire.”

Building interest - Example

A parent is trying to teach their child fractions:

“The parent notices their child’s growing interest in cooking. So, they cook together and learn about fractions by measuring and serving dishes in various proportions.”

Summary

- Extrinsic motivation: comes from environmental rewards and punishments (operant conditioning)
- Hidden cost → undermines intrinsic motivation
- Cognitive evaluation theory determines the impact of external events on intrinsic motivation, based on whether the event is: 
  - Controlling
  - Informational
- Types of extrinsic motivation
  - External regulation
  - Introjected regulation
  - Identified regulation
  - Integrated regulation
- Motivating others to do uninteresting activities
  - Explanatory rationales
  - Build situational interest

Drive: The surprising truth about what motivates us

Dan Pink

RSA Animate (10:47 mins)

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u6XAPnuFjJc
References

Psychological needs

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 124)

We engage in our environment to involve and satisfy our psychological needs. When our activities:
- **involve** our psychological needs, we feel interest (an emotion)
- **satisfy** our psychological needs, we feel joy (another emotion).

Environments that support and nurture one’s psychological needs promote:
- positive emotions
- optimal experience
- healthy development

Organismic approach to motivation

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 124-125)

- People are inherently active
  - We are always in active exchange with our environment because it offers what we need to be well, grow, and actualise our potential.
- People need supportive, rather than hostile, environments
  - Need satisfaction → growth and adaptive functioning
  - Need frustration → defense and maladaptive functioning

Psychological needs

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 124)

**Inherent** desire to interact with the environment so as to advance personal growth, social development, and psychological well-being.

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 123)

- Psychological needs
  - Autonomy
  - Competence
  - Relatedness

Outline

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 123)

- Psychological needs
- Autonomy
- Competence
- Relatedness

Reading:
Reeve (2018)
Ch 6
(pp. 123–151)
Need satisfaction benefits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Engagement</th>
<th>initiative, effort, enthusiasm, and planning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal growth</td>
<td>personal development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic motivation</td>
<td>interest and enjoyment in tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internalisation</td>
<td>volitional engagement in uninteresting tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>health-promoting lifestyle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well-being</td>
<td>positive emotion and sense of purpose</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 125-127)

Dual processes in supportive and thwartive relationships

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 6.1, p. 127)

What makes us feel good about our work?
Dan Ariely
TED Talk (10:32 mins) Start at 9:54

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5aH2Ppjp CHO#t=594

Psychological needs

Based on Reeve (2018, Ch. 6)

Autonomy
Psychological need to experience self-direction and personal endorsement in the initiation and regulation of one’s behaviour.

Behaviour is autonomous (or self-determined) when our interests, preferences, and wants guide our decision-making process to engage or not to engage in a particular activity — "I want to”.

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 128-136)

Motivating styles

Autonomy-supportive vs. controlling motivating style

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 6.2, p. 129)
**Autonomy support vs. controlling**

What autonomy-supportive and controlling people say and do to motivate others

**Autonomy support**
- Listen carefully
- Allow others time to talk
- Provide rationale
- Encourage effort
- Praise progress, mastery
- Ask others what they want to do
- Respond to questions
- Acknowledge the other’s perspective

**Controlling**
- Hog resources
- Show/tell correct answers
- Speak directives, commands
- Should, must, have to statements
- Ask controlling questions
- Seem demanding

Based on Reeve (2015, pp. 161-167)

---

**Ways of supporting autonomy**

- Nurture inner motivational resources
- Provide explanatory rationales
- Listen empathically
- Use informational language
- Display patience
- Acknowledge & accept displays of negative affect

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 128-134)

---

**The conundrum of choice**

Not all choices promote autonomy

“**either-or**” choices
offered by others
fail to tap into, and involve, the need for autonomy

true choices
reflects one’s values & interests
enhance sense of need-satisfying autonomy

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 134-135)

---

**Autonomy support benefits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th>Intrinsic and mastery motivation</th>
<th>Perceived control</th>
<th>Curiosity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Engagement</td>
<td>More positive and less negative emotion</td>
<td>Better attendance and persistence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>Self-worth</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>Preference for optimal challenge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>Conceptual understanding</td>
<td>Deep, active information processing</td>
<td>Self-regulation strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Grades</td>
<td>Task performance</td>
<td>Standardised test scores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological well-being</td>
<td>Psychological well-being</td>
<td>Vitality</td>
<td>School/ life satisfaction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 6.3, pp. 134-136)

---

**Competence**

A psychological need to be effective in interactions with the environment.

Reflects desire to exercise and to extend one’s skills and capacities and, in doing so, generates a willingness to seek out and master optimal challenges.

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 136)

---

**Challenge and optimal challenge**

- Challenge: “Can you do it?”
  - Can you cope?
  - Can you handle what the environment is asking or requiring you to do?

- Optimal challenge: “Can you do a little better than you have done in the past?”
  - Can you improve?
  - Can you grow and develop your skill further?

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 136-137)
**Involving competence**
**Key environmental conditions**

- **Optimal challenge and flow**
  - Flow is a state of concentration that involves holistic absorption in an activity

- **Structure**
  - Information about the pathways to desired outcomes
  - Support & guidance for pursuing these pathways

- **Feedback**
  - Setting the stage for challenge
  - Performance feedback

- **Failure tolerance**
  - Error making is essential for optimising learning.
  - Failure produces opportunities for learning.

*Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 136-141)*

---

**Structure**

- Amount and clarity of info provided about what and how to do a task (helps to develop desired skills and achieve desired outcomes).

- **Typical steps:**
  - **Clear expectations:** Communicate clear expectations about how to achieve high standards
  - **Guidance:** Model, mentor and coach the “how-to” skills, providing resources and support
  - **Feedback:** Facilitate reflection to build competence and develop pathways to more effective functioning

*Based on Reeve (2018, p. 139)*

---

**We learn more from failure than success**

Failure produces unique learning opportunities:

- encourages identification of causes (and ways to remedy)
- motivates updating of coping strategies
- prompts seeking of advice and guidance.

*Based on Reeve (2018, p. 141)*

---

**Relatedness**

Psychological need to establish close emotional bonds and attachments with other people (caring, responsive, reciprocal, warm relationships).

The desire to be emotionally connected to, and interpersonally involved in, warm relationships.

*Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 142-146)*

---

**Conditions that satisfy the need for relatedness**

- **Social bond**
  - The other person cares about my welfare, likes me

- **Responsiveness**
  - The other person offers understanding, validation, caring

*Based on Reeve (2018, p. 144)*
Nurturing relatedness

- Involving relatedness: Interaction with others
  - Emotionally positive interactions and interaction partners
- Satisfying relatedness: Perception of social bond
  - Intimate and high-quality relationships that involve perceived caring, liking, accepting, and valuing
- Communal relationships
  - People care for the needs of the other, and both feel an obligation to support the other’s welfare
- Benefits of relatedness need satisfaction
  - Engagement, developmental growth, health, and well-being

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 144)

Why relatedness is important

- Provides social context to:
  - Support internalisation
  - Nurture vitality, engagement
  - Fuel happiness (prevents loneliness, depression)

Persistence of emotions such as sadness, depression, jealousy, and loneliness are signs of the absence of high-quality, relatedness-satisfying social bonds and relationships.

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 145-146)

Key elements of relatedness support

- Support internalisation
- Nurture vitality, engagement
- Fuel happiness (prevents loneliness, depression)

Persistence of emotions such as sadness, depression, jealousy, and loneliness are signs of the absence of high-quality, relatedness-satisfying social bonds and relationships.

Based on Reeve (2018, Figure 6.6, p.145)

Exchange relationships

- Acquaintance- or business-based relationship.
- Transactional. Desired outcome:
  - Fair deal on material outcomes (e.g., time, money).
- No obligation to be concerned with the other’s needs or welfare.
- Doesn’t satisfy need for relatedness.

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 145-146)

Communal relationships

- Relationship between people who care about the welfare and needs of the other (e.g., friendships, family, romantic partners).
- Monitor and keep track of (and actively support the) other’s needs (instead of “keeping score”)
- Satisfies the relatedness psychological need.

Based on Reeve (2018, pp. 145-146)

Engagement model

Engagement model based on psychological need satisfaction

Based on Figure 6.7 Reeve (2018, p. 147)
What makes for a good day?

Psychological nutrients for good days, positive well-being, and vitality

- Daily autonomy
- Daily competence
- Daily relatedness

Based on Reeve (2018, p. 147)

Summary

- Organismic approach assumes that:
  - People are inherently active
  - Psychological needs provide inherent motivation to engage in the environment
  - Environments sometimes support and sometimes frustrate meeting of these needs.
- Satisfying basic psychological needs is required for optimal growth and well-being:
  - Autonomy
  - Competence
  - Relatedness

References